RESEARCH HIGHLIGHTS

Potential causal variants for RA identified

Raychaudhuri and colleagues narrowed down the possible genetic associations to six potentially causal variants for RA

,,

Genome-wide association studies (GWASs) have previously revealed 101 non-MHC loci associated with rheumatoid arthritis (RA), but the causal genetic variants had not been defined. By combining fine-mapping techniques with functional studies, the authors of a new study published in *Nature Genetics* have identified strong candidate causal genetic variants for RA and for type 1 diabetes mellitus (T1DM).

"In this study we used statistical genetic strategies, dense genotyping data, functional investigation of non-coding variants and a combined analysis of data from patients with RA and patients with T1DM," explains corresponding author Soumya Raychaudhuri. "Statistical data for non-coding variation is important but often insufficient for identifying functional alleles, so using the statistical data, and combining it with non-coding functional assays to demonstrate that the candidate alleles had the potential to alter enhancer function, was key to defining causal variation."

Starting with a fine-mapping approach, the researchers investigated 76 non-MHC risk-associated loci for RA (11,475 cases and 15,870 controls) and T1DM (9,334 cases



and 11,111 controls). The resulting list was refined to include only loci with ≤10 variants in their credible sets, and these loci were taken forward for functional studies (electrophoretic mobility shift assays and allele-specific luciferase assays) using immortalized T cell and monocyte lines.

Using this integrated approach, Raychaudhuri and colleagues narrowed down the possible genetic associations to six potentially causal variants for RA. These variants included missense mutations in *TYK2* (rs35018800) and *DNASE1L3* (rs35677470), an indel in *TNFAIP3* (rs35926684) and a non-coding mutation in the *CD28-CTLA4* locus (rs117701653). Shared missense mutations with T1DM in *PTPN22* and *TYK2* that had been previously described in GWASs were also confirmed.

"Amongst the most exciting results are a loss-of-function allele in DNASE1L3 and non-coding causal alleles in TNFAIP3 and CD28-CTLA4," says Raychaudhuri. "These results point to key pathways and genes that are driving RA risk."

The loss-of-function missense mutation in *DNASE1L3* produced a nuclease that could no longer cleave DNA during apoptosis. Importantly, similar missense mutations in *DNASE1L3* have previously been reported for systemic sclerosis and systemic lupus erythematosus (SLE).

Similarly, variants of *TNFAIP3* are associated with several autoimmune diseases, including SLE and Sjögren syndrome. A20, the protein coded for by *TNFAIP3*, reduces signalling via the transcription factor NF- κ B and thereby inhibits apoptosis. Interestingly, the results of Hi-C promoter-capture analysis suggested that the rs35926684 region interacts with the promoters for *TNFAIP3*, *IL22RA* (involved in inflammation, apoptosis and angiogenesis) and *IFNGR1* (involved in interferon responses), indicating that several genes could be influenced by this one variant.

The rs117701653 variant of *CD28–CTLA4* (located in the CD28 region) also showed interactions with multiple promoters via Hi-C analysis, suggesting that this variant might affect *CTLA4* (involved in T cell co-stimulation) and *RAPH1* (involved in cell adhesion).

"The success of this study is to identify primary disease-associated variants," says Gerry Wilson, an expert in the genetics that underlie RA who was not involved in this study. "It's a great example of integration of state-of-the-art statistical analysis and straightforward biological experiments. Moving forward, it will be important to determine if the functional effects observed are specific to T cells or potentially occur in other relevant cell types such as synovial fibroblasts or B cells."

"There remain questions as to what context these alleles are working in, both in terms of cell-type and cell-state, what the downstream genes are that are regulated by the RA risk alleles and what the upstream regulatory machineries are that are driving RA risk," concludes Raychaudhuri. "Additional cellular investigations including CRISPR strategies and single cell investigation of inflamed tissues in RA will be critical to define the set of candidate genes driving cellular phenotypes."

Joanna Collison

ORIGINAL ARTICLE Westra, H.-J. et al. Fine-mapping and functional studies highlight potential causal variants for rheumatoid arthritis and type 1 diabetes. *Nat. Genet.* **50**, 1366–1374 (2018)

IN BRIEF

PAEDIATRIC RHEUMATOLOGY

Long-term safety of canakinumab in systemic JIA

In a long-term extension of two phase III studies assessing the safety and efficacy of canakinumab (a fully human anti-IL-1 β monoclonal antibody) in patients with active systemic juvenile idiopathic arthritis (JIA), treatment efficacy at 6 months was maintained for up to 5 years. No new safety findings were reported and treatment was associated with glucocorticoid discontinuation or substantial reduction in glucocorticoid dose. Overall, 102 patients (58%) discontinued canakinumab, mainly because of treatment inefficacy. A higher rate of discontinuation was noted for late responders than for early responders (81% versus 29%), indicating that early response is a predictive factor of long-term outcome.

ORIGINAL ARTICLE Ruperto, N. et al. Canakinumab in patients with systemic juvenile idiopathic arthritis and active systemic features: results from the 5-year long-term extension of the phase III pivotal trials. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* https://doi.org/10.1136/annrheumdis-2018-213150 (2018)

SYSTEMIC LUPUS ERYTHEMATOSUS

Ustekinumab — a novel treatment?

The addition of ustekinumab, an IL-12 and IL-23 inhibitor, to standard-of-care treatment was more efficacious than placebo in the treatment of patients with active systemic lupus erythematosus (SLE) in a double-blind phase II randomized controlled trial. More patients in the ustekinumab group achieved an SLE responder index-4 (SRI-4) response at week 24 than in the placebo group (37 (62%) versus 14 (33%); P = 0.006). The safety profile of ustekinumab was consistent with that reported in previous trials of ustekinumab for other diseases. **ORIGINAL ARTICLE** van Vollenhoven, R. F. et al. Efficacy and safety of ustekinumab, an IL-12 and IL-23 inhibitor, in patients with active systemic lupus erythematosus: results of a multicentre, double-blind, phase 2, randomised, controlled study. *Lancet.* https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(18)2167-6 (2018)

🕽 GOUT

IL-1 β blockade prevents gout attacks

In a post hoc analysis of data from CANTOS, a large double-blind placebo-controlled trial of canakinumab treatment for patients with established atherosclerotic disease, canakinumab treatment was associated with a ~50% reduction in risk of a first gout attack, but not with a change in serum uric acid levels. The reduction in risk of incidence gout was observed for all baseline concentrations of serum uric acid, suggesting that IL-1 β blockade can prevent gout attacks independent of serum uric acid levels. **ORIGINAL ARTICLE** Solomon, D. H. et al. Relationship of interleukin-1 β blockade with incident gout and serum uric acid levels: exploratory analysis of a randomized controlled trial. *Ann. Intern. Med.* https://doi.org/10.7326/M18-1167 (2018)

RHEUMATOID ARTHRITIS

DMARD-related adverse events lower persistence

In a study of patients with methotrexate-refractory rheumatoid arthritis, the addition of sulfasalazine and hydroxychloroquine to methotrexate (triple therapy; n = 171) resulted in a lower persistence rate (defined as treatment without a \geq 90-day gap in therapy) than the addition of a TNF inhibitor (n = 2,125). Over a 12 month period, 45% of patients in the TNF inhibitor group persisted with treatment, compared with 18% of patients in the triple therapy group. Treatment discontinuation was most often because of sulfasalazine-related adverse drug events.

ORIGINAL ARTICLE Erhardt, D. P. et al. Low persistence rates in rheumatoid arthritis patients treated with triple therapy are attributed to adverse drug events associated with sulfasalazine. *Arthritis Care Res.* https://doi.org/10.1002/acr.23759 (2018)

RHEUMATOID ARTHRITIS

Nanoparticles in neutrophil clothing

Neutrophils are key immune cells in rheumatoid arthritis (RA) that are known for their involvement in perpetuating, but also in resolving, inflammation. One mechanism used by neutrophils to control inflammation is the production of natural vesicles (such as exosomes and microparticles), which have been shown to be joint-protective in mouse models of RA.

In a new study published in Nature Nanotechnology, researchers show how semisynthetic nanoparticles (NPs) coated in neutrophil cell membrane can also have joint-protective effects in mouse models of RA. "We collected the plasma membrane of activated neutrophil cells and then coated the membrane onto a synthetic nanoscale particle core, forming neutrophil-membrane-coated nanoparticles (neutrophil-NPs)," states corresponding author Liangfang Zhang. "The resulting neutrophil-NPs were then applied locally to inflamed joints."

Intra-articular injection of neutrophil-NPs reduced disease severity and joint damage in two mouse models of RA (collagen-induced arthritis and a transgenic model of inflammatory arthritis) to a level comparable with mice treated with anti-TNF or anti-IL-1 β antibodies. "Neutrophil-NPs were able to effectively interact with and absorb various types of inflammatory cytokines that would otherwise have interacted with real neutrophils," says Zhang.

The researchers also investigated the ability of neutrophil-NPs to penetrate cartilage. Fluorescently labelled neutrophil-NPs could be detected to a depth of 140 μ m from the cartilage surface in explants, whereas erythrocyte-membranecoated NPs could only be detected to a depth of 30 μ m. Neutrophil-NPs were also seen in close proximity to chondrocyte nuclei, indicating that the NPs might have been taken up by the chondrocytes. In explants



Credit: Adapted from Thomas, B.L. & Perretti, M. Neutrophil wrap. Nat. Nanotechnol. https://doi. org/10.1038/s41565-018-0260-6 (2018)

treated with IL-1 β , neutrophil-NPs reduced cartilage damage by removing IL-1 β from the environment.

"The development of therapeutic approaches based on the modification of NPs with cell membrane represents an important leap forward in the field of nanomedicine since they combine the benefits of both human-made and natural materials," explains Massimo Bottini, who was not involved in this study. "Although the authors did not assess the mechanism of interaction between neutrophil-NPs and chondrocytes, the ability of neutrophil-NPs to enter the cartilage and target the chondrocytes is an important finding," he continues. "The next step should be to test the therapeutic efficacy of systemically administered neutrophil-NPs in mouse models of arthritis as both a therapeutic agent and a chondrocyte-specific drug delivery system."

"We are very interested in moving this technology forward to evaluate its clinical application potential; however, a major challenge that we have to overcome is the large-scale manufacturing of the neutrophil-NPs to GMP quality," concludes Zhang.

Joanna Collison

ORIGINAL ARTICLE Zhang, Q. et al. Neutrophil membrane-coated nanoparticles inhibit synovial inflammation and alleviate joint damage in inflammatory arthritis. Nat. Nanotechnol. https:// doi.org/10.1038/s41565-018-0254-4 (2018)

RESEARCH HIGHLIGHTS

SYSTEMIC LUPUS ERYTHEMATOSUS

ACE inhibitors preserve cognitive function

In a mouse model of brain pathology mediated by a subset of anti-DNA antibodies found in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus (SLE), ACE inhibition can preserve cognitive function, according to a new study. "The most important aspect of the study is that the results showed that damaged neurons can recover and cognition can be improved if microglial activation is controlled," reports Betty Diamond, corresponding author of the study.

Her group has previously demonstrated that this subset of anti-DNA antibodies, which they term DNRAbs, cross-react with the *N*-methyl-d-aspartate receptor (NMDAR). "We have been studying how and when these antibodies can contribute to the neuropsychiatric symptoms of SLE," says Diamond. They developed a two-stage mouse model of neuropsychiatric lupus, in which DNRAbs are first induced by immunizing with a DWEYS peptide and the blood-brain barrier (BBB) is then disrupted using LPS treatment, resulting in acute excitotoxic neuron loss followed by long-term alterations in neuronal integrity and by spatial memory impairment.

In this study, Diamond and colleagues sought to understand the mechanisms underlying the longterm cognitive impairment in this model. "We demonstrate that the antibody-mediated neuronal death leads to microglial cell activation, and that microglial suppression can improve neuronal integrity and cognitive problems," explains Diamond.

Using C1q-deficient mice, they showed that the decrease in dendritic complexity and spine density, but not the acute neuronal death, was dependent on C1q. Unlike wildtype DNRAb⁺ mice, C1q-deficient DNRAb⁺ mice behaved normally in an object-place memory task that tests spatial memory.

ACE inhibitors, commonly used to lower blood pressure, have

Treatment with a BBBpermeable ACE inhibitor... suppressed microglial activation and preserved dendritic integrity and cognitive function in the DNRAb⁺ mice

... activation of

RANKL reverse

reduced bone

signalling

inhibited

formation



Credit: Oleksiy Maksymenko ²hotography/Alamy Stock Photc

previously been shown to suppress microglial activation. In the new study, treatment with a BBBpermeable ACE inhibitor, but not with a BBB-impermeable ACE inhibitor or saline, suppressed microglial activation and preserved dendritic integrity and cognitive function in the DNRAb⁺ mice.

"We plan to study the mechanisms for microglial activation, which might lead to therapeutic targets" says Diamond. "We also think clinical trials of ACE inhibitors in neuropsychiatric SLE are now warranted."

Jessica McHugh

ORIGINAL ARTICLE Nestor, J. et al. Lupus antibodies induce behavioral changes mediated by microglia and blocked by ACE inhibitors. J. Exp. Med. https://doi.org/10.1084/jem.20180776 (2018)

BONE

RANKL reverse signalling and bone

New research by Hiroshi Suzuki and colleagues shows that reverse signalling of receptor activator of nuclear factor-kB (RANK; also known as TNFRSF11A) ligand (RANKL; also known as TNFSF11) in osteoblasts has a role in linking bone resorption and formation.

RANKL belongs to the tumour necrosis factor family, which is a group of proteins that act as bidirectional signalling molecules and produce intracellular reverse signalling. Previously, osteoblasts were thought to be the main producers of RANKL; however, mounting evidence suggests that osteocytes are the main source during bone remodelling. "Because of this finding, we hypothesized that osteoblastic RANKL might have a different physiological role than that of osteocytic RANKL," explains corresponding author Masashi Honma.

In this study, the researchers showed that maturing osteoclasts secreted vesicular RANK (vRANK), which binds to osteoblastic RANKL and activates reverse signalling through *Runx2*. The stimulation also increased the mineralization of osteoblasts.

Next, the authors created a mouse model (*Rankl*^{P29A}) to suppress reverse signalling of RANKL but not forward signalling, which triggers osteoclastogenesis. When recombinant RANKL was administered, osteoclast maturation in both *Rankl*^{P29A} and wild-type mice was increased; however, bone formation was disrupted in *Rankl*^{P29A} mice compared with wild-type mice. The results suggest that osteoblastic RANKL reverse signalling is involved in linking bone resorption and formation.



Finally, Suzuki and colleagues targeted RANKL reverse signalling in an ovariectomized mouse model to test whether it is a possible pharmacological target for the treatment of osteoporosis. They found that activation of RANKL reverse signalling inhibited reduced bone formation. "Our findings indicate that the role of RANKL is the accelerator of bone turnover rather than the stimulator of bone resorption," concludes Honma.

> Ivone Leong, Nature Reviews Endocrinology This article is modified from the original in Nat. Rev. Endo. (https://doi.org/10.1038/s41574-018-0094-1).

ORIGINAL ARTICLE Ikebuchi, Y. et al. Coupling of bone resorption and formation by RANKL reverse signalling. *Nature* 561, 195–200 (2018)

RESEARCH HIGHLIGHTS

PAEDIATRIC RHEUMATOLOGY

Some PD-1⁺ CD8⁺ T cells are not exhausted

New research shows that PD-1⁺ CD8⁺ T cells that accumulate in the synovial fluid of patients with juvenile idiopathic arthritis (JIA) are not in an exhausted state. These cells are mostly memory T cells with an effector signature and probably derive from local antigenic stimulation to contribute to joint pathology.

PD-1 is a negative co-stimulatory receptor best known for its function as an immune checkpoint. In chronic inflammatory environments such as cancer and some infectious diseases, PD-1 expression is induced on CD8⁺ T cells and is associated with loss of effector functions and the entry of those cells into a state known as exhaustion.

To see if PD-1⁺ CD8⁺ T cells in the joints are similarly exhausted, the researchers performed wholetranscriptome sequencing of T cell subsets from the synovial fluid of patients with JIA or from healthy individuals. The JIA PD-1⁺ cells were enriched for gene expression pathways that are typical of effector T cells, such as the cell cycle, proliferation, cytotoxicity and pro-inflammatory signalling.

The researchers also showed that these PD-1⁺ cells are primarily glycolytic and have not switched cellular metabolism to oxidative phosphorylation, as is expected of exhausted T cells. Furthermore, these cells were functionally active in response to in vitro stimulation with PMA and ionomycin or with anti-CD3 and anti-CD28 antibodies.

The researchers also characterized the T cell receptor (TCR) V β repertoires, showing that TCR diversity is lower in the PD-1⁺ subset than in the PD-1⁻ population, suggesting that PD-1⁺ cells in the synovial fluid of patients with JIA proliferate in response to locally expressed antigens and that PD-1 marks a distinct CD8⁺ T cell subset.

"At the target site of chronic inflammatory diseases, enrichment

...PD-1⁺ cells are primarily glycolytic and have not switched cellular metabolism to oxidative phosphorylation...

dit: Springer Natur

Credit: Springer Mature Limited/Neil Smith

of PD-1⁺ CD8⁺ T cells doesn't mean exhaustion, but rather functional adaptation and local antigen-driven clonal expansion," explains Alessandra Petrelli, first author of the new study. "Therefore, our paper supports the idea of functional T cell adaptation to the local inflammatory environment. The data also suggest that these cells may have a pathogenic function in chronic inflammation and could be interesting targets for therapy," she concludes.

Nicholas J. Bernard

ORIGINAL ARTICLE Petrelli, A. et al. PD-1⁺CD8⁺ T cells are clonally expanding effectors in human chronic inflammation. *J. Clin. Invest.* https://doi. org/10.1172/JCl96107 (2018)

OSTEOARTHRITIS

Brains and bones and joints

The nuclear phosphoprotein ANP32A protects against oxidative degeneration of brain, bone and cartilage tissue, according to a study published in *Science Translational Medicine*.

To understand an already established association between risk of osteoarthritis and ANP32A polymorphisms, the researchers show that compared with patients admitted for trauma surgery, patients with hip osteoarthritis (OA) have lower gene and protein expression of ANP32A in cartilage. The protein is also expressed less in damaged areas than in healthy areas of the cartilage.

These findings are mirrored in both surgically-induced and age-induced mouse models of OA. Furthermore, $Anp32a^{-/-}$ mice are more susceptible to cartilage degeneration in a variety of OA models.

To understand the mechanism of this protective function of ANP32A, the researchers conducted genome-wide transcriptomic analyses. One of the top hits, *Atm*, drew their attention owing to the known anti-oxidant function of the protein kinase it encodes. They show that *Atm* is barely expressed in cartilage from *Anp32a^{-/-}* mice and in patients with OA, especially in damaged areas of cartilage, and knockdown of *ANP32A* in human cartilage samples results in lower expression of *ATM*.

Using ChIP-qPCR and RNA polymerase II analysis the researchers found that ANP32A directly activates transcription at the ATM promoter in chondrocytes.

The therapeutic implications of these findings were probed by feeding the antioxidant N-acetyl-cysteine (NAC) to $Anp32a^{-/-}$ mice, resulting in cartilage

...*Anp32a^{-/-}* mice are more susceptible to cartilage degeneration...

protection against surgically induced OA. Intriguingly, the pathology in *Anp32a^{-/-}* mice is not restricted to cartilage as the mice also developed osteopenia plus ataxia that is associated with reduced cerebellar expression of *Atm*. Furthermore, the ataxic gait abnormality in these mice

was reversed by NAC treatment. "Oxidative stress has been suggested to play an important role in the progression of osteoarthritis and other degenerative or ageing-associated diseases," explains corresponding author Rik Lories. "Our data suggest that increasing levels of ANP32A in the target tissues may be a strategy to act against these processes and treat OA and other diseases," he concludes.

Nicholas J. Bernard

ORIGINAL ARTICLE Cornelis, F. M. F. et al. ANP32A regulates ATM expression and prevents oxidative stress in cartilage, brain, and bone. Sci. Transl. Med. **10**, eaar8426 (2018)

ゴ THERAPY

How to be NICEr in treating osteoarthritis

Philip G. Conaghan

Current guidelines for the treatment of osteoarthritis involve exercise and lifestyle modifications as well as pharmaceutical therapeutics for effective pain management. Is this message reaching patients, and are they exercising enough?

Refers to Healey, E. L. et al. Uptake of the NICE osteoarthritis guidelines in primary care: a survey of older adults with joint pain. BMC Musculoskelet. Disord. **19**, 295 (2018).

Osteoarthritis (OA) is an increasing problem for individuals and for health-care systems, especially with ageing societies and the increasing prevalence of obesity¹. Healey et al.² have reported a large (4,059 respondents who consulted their primary care physician about joint pain in the previous 12 months) UK community-based patient survey of OA management. They used this survey to evaluate how people with OA have been using the therapies recommended by the UK National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE). NICE provides national clinical guidance on the basis of a robust synthesis of systematic literature reviews, health economic data, expert opinion and patient input. Although these guidelines are primarily aimed at NHS health-care providers, the Healey et al.² survey (performed between May 2011 and April 2012) enables us to see what patients registered in 8 sites in the West Midlands and North West of England were doing a few years after the first NICE OA clinical guidelines were published in 2008 (REF.³). The survey is, of course, reported information and therefore is limited by patient recall bias.

An important issue raised by Healey et al.² is that of multi-site joint pain: 80% of participants in the study reported such pain. However, guidelines have failed to advise on how to manage this group of patients, in part because there are very few trials in this area. Treating the whole patient is critical and needs to be the focus of future musculoskeletal research and therapy.

Healey et al.² report that patterns of usage of most OA therapies were depressingly low,

especially for muscle-strengthening exercises, but mostly in line with other surveys that have looked at use of current OA therapies in the UK⁴, EU^{5,6} and USA⁷; however, these surveys often focus on pharmacological therapies^{4,5}. The uptake of therapies was generally lower than in another survey (from 2011–2012) of approximately 2,000 patients⁴ from the broader UK population rather than the regional population surveyed by Healey et al.² Therefore, the reduction in uptake and other differences might reflect the larger sample size in the Healey et al.² study, or might be reflective of issues that are specific to some regions of the UK.

We must rebuff the view that joint pain is an inevitable part of ageing

One similarity across international studies has been the limited use of pharmacological therapies such as oral NSAIDs and opioids, probably reflecting the limitations of these therapies (rather than lack of prescription), especially their toxicities and contra-indications which substantially limit application to people who might have multiple comorbidities. A diminishing use of drug therapy is especially appropriate among an velderly population. The usage of these therapies might also reflect some dissatisfaction with the perceived benefits - a large proportion of people with OA pain have substantial levels of persistent pain despite using existing pharmacological therapies including NSAIDs and opioids6. Therefore, we

have a real problem in that it seems we are not treating joint pain very well in the community and patients are not following the principles laid out in clinical guidance.

So what can we do to treat OA better and more easily? Something not often looked at in such surveys is the provision of written information to patients; overall, only 23% of respondents in the Healey survey reported being given this information. Apart from talking about pain management, patients often report discussing with doctors their fears about OA and its impact on their lives, and about primary health-care support⁴. Many of these important issues can be addressed with adequate provision of information, advice on local facilities and directing patients to trusted, evidence-based information websites. Creating a list of such information for patients for each local practice is a relatively quick task and probably would only require annual updates.

In the Healey at al². survey, it is unclear if uptake of muscle-strengthening exercises and manual therapy reflect exposure of these patients to physiotherapy programs. Also, there is often a lack of community understanding of what constitutes aerobic activity; some patients mistakenly think this means being part of a supervised activity. Despite the efficacy of simple and safe non-pharmacological interventions (such as exercise) for OA, and indeed all mechanical joint pain, why is there a failure of patients to participate in these important aspects of daily care? NICE emphasizes that muscle strengthening should come before increasing aerobic activity; telling physically weak people to go for a walk is not an effective strategy. A particular challenge in our ageing society is the reduction in frequency of exercise as people age, as reported by Healey et al.² Whether this problem reflects a failure of health-care professionals to engage older patients in exercise therapy or a possible attitude among patients that 'my muscle weakness is just part of ageing' is unclear. We must educate our patients that only by getting strong and subsequently fit will their joint pain diminish in a sustainable way. Teaching a single exercise to patients with weak grip or weak quadriceps can take as little as a few minutes, and the analgesic benefits can be clear in just a few weeks of appropriate muscle strengthening, even in people aged >75 years⁸.

It would be wise to prevent or reduce muscle weakness through community



interventions, as recommended in a recent tiered approach to physical activity supported by a range of important UK health providers9. This approach starts with accessible community facilities (like parks and swimming pools), then supervised physical programmes (such as aqua-aerobics or dance clubs), progressing through structured community-based rehabilitation programmes (that need not be supervised by clinicians). If people have problems despite accessing these tiers, individual programmes supervised by physical therapists will be required, but clinicians need to direct patients to these tiered activities first9.

The reported rates of dieting to lose weight (<10%) are not unexpectedly low, and it is not clear if this refers to being part of an effective, supervised diet programme. Being overweight is certainly a contributor to joint pain, with trials suggesting that 5-10% of bodyweight must be lost to achieve symptomatic benefits¹⁰. We have been spectacularly unsuccessful in Western societies in turning around the obesity epidemic and we need new strategies, bearing in mind the success and beneficial effect of government societal interventions that have reduced the prevalence of smoking, for example.

Even in the absence of new pharmacological therapies, there are things health-care professionals can do better and quickly in line with NICE guidance. All practitioners who treat musculoskeletal problems should provide their patients with hard-copy or electronic exercise sheets and provide directions to appropriate web information on the nature and treatment of osteoarthritis. We must rebuff the view that joint pain is an inevitable part of ageing. We must promote muscle strengthening as a critical component of osteoarthritis care, no matter the age of the patient, and we must support our patients with guided activity plans to reduce the burden of joint pain.

Philip G. Conaghan D1,2

¹Leeds Institute of Rheumatic and Musculoskeletal Medicine, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK. ²NIHR Leeds Biomedical Research Centre, Leeds, UK,

e-mail: p.conaghan@leeds.ac.uk

https://doi.org/10.1038/s41584-018-0101-x

- 1 Arthritis Research LIK, State of musculoskeletal health 2018. arthritisresearchuk https://www. arthritisresearchuk.org/arthritis-information/data-andstatistics/state-of-musculoskeletal-health.aspx (2018).
- 2. Healey, E. L. et al. Uptake of the NICE osteoarthritis guidelines in primary care: a survey of older adults with joint pain. BMC Musculoskelet. Disord. 19, 295 (2018).
- National Institute for Health & Clinical Excellence. NICE Clinical Guideline [Cg59] Osteoarthritis: the Care

Z RHEUMATOID ARTHRITIS

and Management of Osteoarthritis in Adults (National Institute for Health & Clinical Excellence, I ondon 2008)

- 4 Conaghan, P. G. et al. Impact and therapy of osteoarthritis: the Arthritis Care OA Nation 2012 survey. Clin. Rheumatol. 34, 1581-1588 (2015).
- 5 Kingsbury, S. R. et al. Osteoarthritis in Europe: impact on health status, work productivity and use of pharmacotherapies in five European countries. Rheumatology (Oxford) 53, 937-947 (2014).
- 6 Conaghan, P. G. et al. Inadequate pain relief and large functional loss among patients with knee osteoarthritis: evidence from a prospective multinational longitudinal study of osteoarthritis real-world therapies. Rheumatology (Oxford) 54, 270-277 (2015).
- Kingsbury, S. R. et al. How do people with knee osteoarthritis use osteoarthritis pain medications and does this change over time? Data from the Osteoarthritis Initiative. Arthritis Res. Ther. 15, 106 (2013).
- 8 Christensen, R. et al. Impact of exercise type and dose on pain and disability in knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review and meta-regression analysis of randomized controlled trials. Arthritis Rheumatol. 66, 622-636 (2014).
- Ellis, B. M. & Conaghan, P. G. Reducing arthritis pain through physical activity: a new public health, tiered approach. *Br. J. Gen. Pract.* **67**, 438–439 (2017)
- 10 Christensen, R. et al. Effect of weight maintenance on symptoms of knee osteoarthritis in obese patients: a twelve-month randomized controlled trial. Arthritis Care Res. 67, 640-650 (2015).

Acknowledgements

The work of P.G.C. is supported in part by the Arthritis Research UK Leeds Experimental Osteoarthritis Centre (20083) and the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) Leeds Biomedical Research Centre. The views expressed in this publication are those of the author and not necessarily those of the NHS, the NIHR, or the Department of Health.

Competing interests

The author declares no competing interests

The parallel worlds of ACPApositive and RF-positive B cells

Vivianne Malmström and Caroline Grönwall

Seropositive RA can present with two different types of autoantibodies that have distinct features: anti-citrullinated protein antibodies (ACPAs) and rheumatoid factors (RFs). With a single-cell approach, researchers provide evidence that the underlying B cell subsets of these autoantibody specificities develop in parallel by different mechanisms.

Refers to Lu, D. R. et al. T cell dependent affinity maturation and innate immune pathways differentially drive autoreactive B cell responses in rheumatoid arthritis. Arthritis Rheumatol. https://doi.org/10.1002/art.40578 (2018).

The major subset of rheumatoid arthritis (RA), known as seropositive RA, is characterized by the presence of rheumatoid factors (RFs) and anti-citrullinated protein antibodies (ACPAs) in the serum. These two sets of autoantibodies have some contrasting features, even though they often co-occur in seropositive RA, and might function synergistically. ACPAs are specific for RA¹, whereas RFs are relatively common in other autoimmune diseases and can be present

in infection². Even though RFs have undergone somatic hypermutation, these molecules generally carry only a modest number of somatic mutations²; by contrast, ACPAs are reported to have high levels of somatic mutations³⁻⁶. Increased knowledge about how these two major autoreactivities arise is crucial for understanding how RA develops and what mechanisms drive pathogenesis. In a new study, Lu et al.⁷ explore the differences between autoreactive B cells expressing



interventions, as recommended in a recent tiered approach to physical activity supported by a range of important UK health providers9. This approach starts with accessible community facilities (like parks and swimming pools), then supervised physical programmes (such as aqua-aerobics or dance clubs), progressing through structured community-based rehabilitation programmes (that need not be supervised by clinicians). If people have problems despite accessing these tiers, individual programmes supervised by physical therapists will be required, but clinicians need to direct patients to these tiered activities first9.

The reported rates of dieting to lose weight (<10%) are not unexpectedly low, and it is not clear if this refers to being part of an effective, supervised diet programme. Being overweight is certainly a contributor to joint pain, with trials suggesting that 5-10% of bodyweight must be lost to achieve symptomatic benefits¹⁰. We have been spectacularly unsuccessful in Western societies in turning around the obesity epidemic and we need new strategies, bearing in mind the success and beneficial effect of government societal interventions that have reduced the prevalence of smoking, for example.

Even in the absence of new pharmacological therapies, there are things health-care professionals can do better and quickly in line with NICE guidance. All practitioners who treat musculoskeletal problems should provide their patients with hard-copy or electronic exercise sheets and provide directions to appropriate web information on the nature and treatment of osteoarthritis. We must rebuff the view that joint pain is an inevitable part of ageing. We must promote muscle strengthening as a critical component of osteoarthritis care, no matter the age of the patient, and we must support our patients with guided activity plans to reduce the burden of joint pain.

Philip G. Conaghan D1,2

¹Leeds Institute of Rheumatic and Musculoskeletal Medicine, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK. ²NIHR Leeds Biomedical Research Centre, Leeds, UK,

e-mail: p.conaghan@leeds.ac.uk

https://doi.org/10.1038/s41584-018-0101-x

- 1 Arthritis Research LIK, State of musculoskeletal health 2018. arthritisresearchuk https://www. arthritisresearchuk.org/arthritis-information/data-andstatistics/state-of-musculoskeletal-health.aspx (2018).
- 2. Healey, E. L. et al. Uptake of the NICE osteoarthritis guidelines in primary care: a survey of older adults with joint pain. BMC Musculoskelet. Disord. 19, 295 (2018).
- National Institute for Health & Clinical Excellence. NICE Clinical Guideline [Cg59] Osteoarthritis: the Care

Z RHEUMATOID ARTHRITIS

and Management of Osteoarthritis in Adults (National Institute for Health & Clinical Excellence, I ondon 2008)

- 4 Conaghan, P. G. et al. Impact and therapy of osteoarthritis: the Arthritis Care OA Nation 2012 survey. Clin. Rheumatol. 34, 1581-1588 (2015).
- 5 Kingsbury, S. R. et al. Osteoarthritis in Europe: impact on health status, work productivity and use of pharmacotherapies in five European countries. Rheumatology (Oxford) 53, 937-947 (2014).
- 6 Conaghan, P. G. et al. Inadequate pain relief and large functional loss among patients with knee osteoarthritis: evidence from a prospective multinational longitudinal study of osteoarthritis real-world therapies. Rheumatology (Oxford) 54, 270-277 (2015).
- Kingsbury, S. R. et al. How do people with knee osteoarthritis use osteoarthritis pain medications and does this change over time? Data from the Osteoarthritis Initiative. Arthritis Res. Ther. 15, 106 (2013).
- 8 Christensen, R. et al. Impact of exercise type and dose on pain and disability in knee osteoarthritis: a systematic review and meta-regression analysis of randomized controlled trials. Arthritis Rheumatol. 66, 622-636 (2014).
- Ellis, B. M. & Conaghan, P. G. Reducing arthritis pain through physical activity: a new public health, tiered approach. *Br. J. Gen. Pract.* **67**, 438–439 (2017)
- 10 Christensen, R. et al. Effect of weight maintenance on symptoms of knee osteoarthritis in obese patients: a twelve-month randomized controlled trial. Arthritis Care Res. 67, 640-650 (2015).

Acknowledgements

The work of P.G.C. is supported in part by the Arthritis Research UK Leeds Experimental Osteoarthritis Centre (20083) and the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) Leeds Biomedical Research Centre. The views expressed in this publication are those of the author and not necessarily those of the NHS, the NIHR, or the Department of Health.

Competing interests

The author declares no competing interests

The parallel worlds of ACPApositive and RF-positive B cells

Vivianne Malmström and Caroline Grönwall

Seropositive RA can present with two different types of autoantibodies that have distinct features: anti-citrullinated protein antibodies (ACPAs) and rheumatoid factors (RFs). With a single-cell approach, researchers provide evidence that the underlying B cell subsets of these autoantibody specificities develop in parallel by different mechanisms.

Refers to Lu, D. R. et al. T cell dependent affinity maturation and innate immune pathways differentially drive autoreactive B cell responses in rheumatoid arthritis. Arthritis Rheumatol. https://doi.org/10.1002/art.40578 (2018).

The major subset of rheumatoid arthritis (RA), known as seropositive RA, is characterized by the presence of rheumatoid factors (RFs) and anti-citrullinated protein antibodies (ACPAs) in the serum. These two sets of autoantibodies have some contrasting features, even though they often co-occur in seropositive RA, and might function synergistically. ACPAs are specific for RA¹, whereas RFs are relatively common in other autoimmune diseases and can be present

in infection². Even though RFs have undergone somatic hypermutation, these molecules generally carry only a modest number of somatic mutations²; by contrast, ACPAs are reported to have high levels of somatic mutations³⁻⁶. Increased knowledge about how these two major autoreactivities arise is crucial for understanding how RA develops and what mechanisms drive pathogenesis. In a new study, Lu et al.⁷ explore the differences between autoreactive B cells expressing

either RFs or ACPAs by characterizing the immunoglobulin repertoire and transcriptional programmes of autoantigen-specific B cells captured from six patients with RA.

The isolation of lymphocytes using antigen-labelled tetramers (the technique used by Lu et al.⁷) enables in-depth analysis of autoantigen-specific B (or T) cells. This technique is being increasingly used for the study of clinical samples of patients with RA^{3-5} and is a promising approach for use in immune surveillance studies to track autoreactive B cells (and their phenotype) in repeat blood samples of patients with RA. In their study, Lu et al.⁷ combine this technology with single-cell RNA sequencing, enabling the investigators to study the transcriptional programmes used by the different captured cells and to discriminate captured B cells that have a naive, memory or plasmablast phenotype as well as to simultaneously conduct somatic hypermutation and class-switch analyses.

All six patients of the Lu et al.⁷ study had both ACPA-positive and RF-positive B cells, which were present in similar frequencies (1–4 cells per 1,000 B cells), but interestingly they found striking differences between the two B cell subpopulations. These differences, which were both at the transcriptional level and within the immunoglobulin gene sequences themselves, suggest contrasting trajectories in the development of the two B cell subpopulations.

The maturation of B cell responses normally involves the interaction of B cells with antigens in the germinal centres, leading to somatic hypermutation and the selection of high-affinity somatically hypermutated B cells (in a process known as the germinal centre reaction) as well as class-switching. In the study by Lu et al.⁷, a higher proportion of the ACPA-positive B cells had signs of antigenexperience and class switching compared with the RF-positive B cells. Furthermore, the somatic hypermutation rates of ACPA-positive B cells were considerably higher than those of RF-positive B cells, suggesting that the ACPApositive B cells had undergone more cycles of B cell selection in the germinal centres. These findings could imply that ACPA B cells are part of a chronic response whereas the RF B cells are part of a short-term response (FIG. 1).

Looking further into the transcriptomic profiles, the investigators developed their own analysis pipeline for characterizing the differentially expressed genes (DEGs) in B cells at distinct stages of differentiation (to discriminate B cells that have a naive, memory or plasmablast phenotype). The DEGs in the ACPA-positive B cells were enriched for genes involved in the promotion of T cell-dependent B cell differentiation, class switching and nuclear factor-kB signalling.



Fig. 1 | **The maturation of RF-positive and ACPA-positive B cell responses.** Anti-citrullinated protein antibodies (ACPA)-positive B cells undergo multiple rounds of germinal centre reactions whereby they accumulate somatic hypermutations and undergo isotype switching. By contrast, rheumatoid factor (RF)-positive B cells undergo few rounds of germinal centre reactions and might instead be activated by innate immune mechanisms. Thus, the citrulline-specific immune response generates long-lived plasma cells and ACPA autoantibodies that are relatively stable, whereas the RF response is characterized by the generation of short-lived plasma cells and fluctuating RF levels. Ig, immunoglobulin; RA, rheumatoid arthritis; TLR, Toll-like receptor.

Conversely, the DEGs in RF-positive B cells included two transcription factors (BACH2 and SOX11) that might be associated with rapid IgM responses and reduced germinal centre responses. Co-expression of innate immune genes and plasmablast differentiation markers in RF-positive B cells further support the association between RF-positive B cells and rapidly induced but short-lived responses rather than responses involving prolonged affinity maturation. Altogether, these findings support the concept that parallel pathways are used in the maturation of ACPA-positive and RF-positive B cells (FIG. 1).

These results7 lend support to a scenario in which the citrulline-specific response is governed by a robust RA-specific CD4+ T cell response with repeated germinal centre selection, whereas RF production is also driven by intrinsic factors, such as Tolllike receptor stimuli, and possibly involves B cells with a more innate-like profile associated with a rapid response. Relevant to this discussion, other investigators have demonstrated that the immunoglobulins of ACPA-positive B cells have unique features, consistent with several rounds of germinal centre reactions^{3,5}. These features include the accumulation of N-glycosylation sites in the Fab region of IgG ACPAs, which is driven

by somatic hypermutation^{8,9} and implicates the existence of a gradually or continually evolving citrulline-specific autoimmune response. However, the exact mechanisms driving ACPA B cell selection are not yet fully delineated.

Yet, even though RFs are less specific to RA than ACPAs, RF-positive B cells might have important roles in amplifying immune responses by functioning as potent antigen-presenting cells¹⁰. Given that RF-positive B cells can internalize immune complexes that contain any (auto)antigen and present these antigens to T cells, these B cells might contribute to ACPA expansion and epitope spreading.

With regard to the pathogenic role of autoantibodies in RA, the extent to which autoantibodies directly contribute to arthritis development is unknown, even if accumulating evidence suggests that they have a functional role^{1,3}. Clearly, both immune complexes and antigen capture and presentation contribute to arthritis development. The expression of recombinant monoclonal antibodies from sequenced B cells will enable researchers to continue dissecting the effector functions pertinent to RA pathology.

There is a growing interest in monitoring the autoreactive B cell and T cell repertoires of patients with RA, and tetramer technology is one useful approach that can be combined with

several methodologies such as RNA sequencing and time-of-flight mass cytometry (CyToF) for this purpose. The isolation of antigenspecific lymphocytes (both B and T cells) might reveal signals that would otherwise be easily missed by generic approaches that analyse entire subsets of cells without pre-selecting for the autoreactive cells. Using tetramer methodology, Lu et al.⁷ provide intriguing insight into RA pathogenesis and implicate the existence of distinct scenarios that shape the respective autoreactive B cell subpopulations in RA. Studies like this one will hopefully inspire future efforts to characterize the underlying activation and differentiation history of autoreactive lymphocyte populations to help understand the mechanisms by which B cell tolerance breaks down in RA. Such insights could ultimately lead to therapeutic approaches that interfere with RA pathogenesis.

Vivianne Malmström • and Caroline Grönwall • Division of Rheumatology, Department of Medicine, Karolinska Institutet, Karolinska University Hospital, Center for Molecular Medicine, Stockholm, Sweden.

> **e-mail: Vivianne.Malmstrom@ki.se* https://doi.org/10.1038/s41584-018-0094-5

- Malmström, V., Catrina, A. I. & Klareskog, L. The immunopathogenesis of seropositive RA: from triggering to targeting. *Nat. Rev. Immunol.* **17**, 60–75 (2017).
- Falkenburg, W. J. J., von Richthofen, H. J. & Rispens, T. On the origin of rheumatoid factors: insights from analyses of variable region sequences. *Semin. Arthritis Rheum.* https://doi.org/10.1016/ j.semarthrit.2018.06.006 (2018).
- Titcombe, P. J. et al. Pathogenic citrulline-multispecific B cell receptor clades in rheumatoid arthritis. Arthritis Rheumatol. https://doi.org/10.1002/art.40590 (2018).
- Elliott, S. E. et al. Affinity maturation drives epitope spreading and generation of pro-inflammatory anti-citrullinated protein antibodies in rheumatoid arthritis. Arthritis Rheumatol. https://doi.org/10.1002/ art.40587 (2018).
- Vergroesen, R. D. et al. B cell receptor sequencing of anti-citrullinated protein antibody (ACPA) IgG-expressing B cells indicates a selective advantage for the introduction of N-glycosylation sites during somatic hypermutation. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **77**, 955–958 (2018).
- Steen, J. et al. Human plasma cell derived monoclonal antibodies to post translationally modified proteins recognize amino acid motifs rather than specific proteins. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* https://doi.org/10.1002/art.40699 (2018).
- Lu, D. R. et al. T cell dependent affinity maturation and innate immune pathways differentially drive autoreactive B cell responses in rheumatoid arthritis. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* https://doi.org/10.1002/art.40578 (2018).
- Rombouts, Y. et al. Extensive glycosylation of ACPA-IgG variable domains modulates binding to citrullinated antigens in rheumatoid arthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **75**, 578–585 (2016).
- Lloyd, K. A. et al. Variable domain N-linked glycosylation and negative surface charge are key features of monoclonal ACPA: implications for B cell selection. *Eur. J. Immunol.* 48, 1030–1045 (2018).
- Roosnek, E. & Lanzavecchia, A. Efficient and selective presentation of antigen-antibody complexes by rheumatoid factor B cells. *J. Exp. Med.* **173**, 487–489 (1991).

Competing interests

V.M. declares that she has given lectures supported by pharmacological companies (BMS, Janssen, Pfizer and Sobis) within her duty at the Karolinska Institute (and with financial compensation to the Karolinska Institute). C.G. declares no competing interests.

🛛 соит

Hyperferritinaemia and hyperuricaemia — a causal connection?

Pascal Richette and Augustin Latourte

A variety of comorbidities of gout exist, but most of these associations are not causally linked. Mendelian randomization analysis of genome-wide association study data now suggests that iron overload might increase serum uric acid levels and hence the risk of gout flares.

Refers to Fatima, T. et al. The relationship between ferritin and urate levels and risk of gout. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* **20**, 179 (2018).

People with gout or isolated hyperuricaemia often have a variety of comorbidities, such as renal failure and hypertension, as well as other components of metabolic syndrome, such as obesity. These comorbidities contribute to the high levels of cardiovascular mortality in gout, but the link between comorbidities and hyperuricaemia is complex. Obesity and comorbidities such as chronic kidney disease increase the risk of developing gout because they both increase serum uric acid levels by impairing urinary uric acid excretion¹. Some observational studies indicate that hyperuricaemia and gout might contribute to cardiovascular diseases, metabolic syndrome and renal failure¹. However, exploring the causality between hyperuricaemia and outcomes from observational studies is limited by potential confounders and reverse causality. Hence, a new study from Fatima et al.2 utilizes Mendelian randomization, which has been used previously to detect causal associations. An earlier umbrella review (a review that analyses data from multiple sources) of associations between hyperuricaemia and multiple health outcomes from observational studies concluded that causality of these associations disappears once Mendelian randomization analysis is applied³. Thus, convincing evidence has been lacking to add a causal link to the association of serum uric acid levels and comorbidities.

Fatima et al.² add to our understanding of the relationship between hyperuricaemia and hyperferritinaemia, a relatively neglected association given the clinical focus has been on the high prevalence of obesity and liver function abnormality in patients with gout. Elevated serum ferritin levels are fairly common in the general population and can result either from increased ferritin synthesis or from increased release of ferritin by damaged cells, as can occur in patients with metabolic disorder. Not surprisingly, an association between hyperferritinaemia and hyperuricaemia has been reported previously¹. However, whether this association is causal has not been investigated until now.

Fatima et al.² aimed to replicate the observational association between hyperferritinaemia and hyperuricaemia or gout using large data sets from New Zealand (n = 320participants) and the USA (n = 10,976)participants). It needs to be noted that the majority of participants were overweight $(BMI > 25 \text{ kg/m}^2)$ or obese $(BMI > 30 \text{ kg/m}^2)$ and hence the population probably included many individuals with metabolic syndrome. Furthermore, ~90% of patients with hyperferritinaemia in routine medical practice do not actually have iron overload. Hyperferritinaemia and iron overload should not be confused or used as interchangeable terms, and given that all data sets studied by Fatima et al.² show the mean transferrin saturation coefficient is lower than 45% (the cut-off for iron overload), conclusions regarding the association between gout and iron overload should be made with some caution. Nevertheless, the association with ferritin levels is of interest.

Using regression analyses adjusted for age, sex, BMI and C-reactive protein levels, the researchers identified a positive association between ferritin levels and serum urate, and also between ferritin levels and gout in some, but not all, data sets. This heterogeneity of results across the different studied populations and the non-adjustment for factors known to increase ferritin levels raises some issues with regards to the robustness

several methodologies such as RNA sequencing and time-of-flight mass cytometry (CyToF) for this purpose. The isolation of antigenspecific lymphocytes (both B and T cells) might reveal signals that would otherwise be easily missed by generic approaches that analyse entire subsets of cells without pre-selecting for the autoreactive cells. Using tetramer methodology, Lu et al.⁷ provide intriguing insight into RA pathogenesis and implicate the existence of distinct scenarios that shape the respective autoreactive B cell subpopulations in RA. Studies like this one will hopefully inspire future efforts to characterize the underlying activation and differentiation history of autoreactive lymphocyte populations to help understand the mechanisms by which B cell tolerance breaks down in RA. Such insights could ultimately lead to therapeutic approaches that interfere with RA pathogenesis.

Vivianne Malmström • and Caroline Grönwall • Division of Rheumatology, Department of Medicine, Karolinska Institutet, Karolinska University Hospital, Center for Molecular Medicine, Stockholm, Sweden.

> **e-mail: Vivianne.Malmstrom@ki.se* https://doi.org/10.1038/s41584-018-0094-5

- Malmström, V., Catrina, A. I. & Klareskog, L. The immunopathogenesis of seropositive RA: from triggering to targeting. *Nat. Rev. Immunol.* **17**, 60–75 (2017).
- Falkenburg, W. J. J., von Richthofen, H. J. & Rispens, T. On the origin of rheumatoid factors: insights from analyses of variable region sequences. *Semin. Arthritis Rheum.* https://doi.org/10.1016/ j.semarthrit.2018.06.006 (2018).
- Titcombe, P. J. et al. Pathogenic citrulline-multispecific B cell receptor clades in rheumatoid arthritis. Arthritis Rheumatol. https://doi.org/10.1002/art.40590 (2018).
- Elliott, S. E. et al. Affinity maturation drives epitope spreading and generation of pro-inflammatory anti-citrullinated protein antibodies in rheumatoid arthritis. Arthritis Rheumatol. https://doi.org/10.1002/ art.40587 (2018).
- Vergroesen, R. D. et al. B cell receptor sequencing of anti-citrullinated protein antibody (ACPA) IgG-expressing B cells indicates a selective advantage for the introduction of N-glycosylation sites during somatic hypermutation. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **77**, 955–958 (2018).
- Steen, J. et al. Human plasma cell derived monoclonal antibodies to post translationally modified proteins recognize amino acid motifs rather than specific proteins. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* https://doi.org/10.1002/art.40699 (2018).
- Lu, D. R. et al. T cell dependent affinity maturation and innate immune pathways differentially drive autoreactive B cell responses in rheumatoid arthritis. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* https://doi.org/10.1002/art.40578 (2018).
- Rombouts, Y. et al. Extensive glycosylation of ACPA-IgG variable domains modulates binding to citrullinated antigens in rheumatoid arthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **75**, 578–585 (2016).
- Lloyd, K. A. et al. Variable domain N-linked glycosylation and negative surface charge are key features of monoclonal ACPA: implications for B cell selection. *Eur. J. Immunol.* 48, 1030–1045 (2018).
- Roosnek, E. & Lanzavecchia, A. Efficient and selective presentation of antigen-antibody complexes by rheumatoid factor B cells. *J. Exp. Med.* **173**, 487–489 (1991).

Competing interests

V.M. declares that she has given lectures supported by pharmacological companies (BMS, Janssen, Pfizer and Sobis) within her duty at the Karolinska Institute (and with financial compensation to the Karolinska Institute). C.G. declares no competing interests.

🛛 соит

Hyperferritinaemia and hyperuricaemia — a causal connection?

Pascal Richette and Augustin Latourte

A variety of comorbidities of gout exist, but most of these associations are not causally linked. Mendelian randomization analysis of genome-wide association study data now suggests that iron overload might increase serum uric acid levels and hence the risk of gout flares.

Refers to Fatima, T. et al. The relationship between ferritin and urate levels and risk of gout. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* **20**, 179 (2018).

People with gout or isolated hyperuricaemia often have a variety of comorbidities, such as renal failure and hypertension, as well as other components of metabolic syndrome, such as obesity. These comorbidities contribute to the high levels of cardiovascular mortality in gout, but the link between comorbidities and hyperuricaemia is complex. Obesity and comorbidities such as chronic kidney disease increase the risk of developing gout because they both increase serum uric acid levels by impairing urinary uric acid excretion¹. Some observational studies indicate that hyperuricaemia and gout might contribute to cardiovascular diseases, metabolic syndrome and renal failure¹. However, exploring the causality between hyperuricaemia and outcomes from observational studies is limited by potential confounders and reverse causality. Hence, a new study from Fatima et al.2 utilizes Mendelian randomization, which has been used previously to detect causal associations. An earlier umbrella review (a review that analyses data from multiple sources) of associations between hyperuricaemia and multiple health outcomes from observational studies concluded that causality of these associations disappears once Mendelian randomization analysis is applied³. Thus, convincing evidence has been lacking to add a causal link to the association of serum uric acid levels and comorbidities.

Fatima et al.² add to our understanding of the relationship between hyperuricaemia and hyperferritinaemia, a relatively neglected association given the clinical focus has been on the high prevalence of obesity and liver function abnormality in patients with gout. Elevated serum ferritin levels are fairly common in the general population and can result either from increased ferritin synthesis or from increased release of ferritin by damaged cells, as can occur in patients with metabolic disorder. Not surprisingly, an association between hyperferritinaemia and hyperuricaemia has been reported previously⁴. However, whether this association is causal has not been investigated until now.

Fatima et al.² aimed to replicate the observational association between hyperferritinaemia and hyperuricaemia or gout using large data sets from New Zealand (n = 320)participants) and the USA (n = 10,976)participants). It needs to be noted that the majority of participants were overweight $(BMI > 25 \text{ kg/m}^2)$ or obese $(BMI > 30 \text{ kg/m}^2)$ and hence the population probably included many individuals with metabolic syndrome. Furthermore, ~90% of patients with hyperferritinaemia in routine medical practice do not actually have iron overload. Hyperferritinaemia and iron overload should not be confused or used as interchangeable terms, and given that all data sets studied by Fatima et al.² show the mean transferrin saturation coefficient is lower than 45% (the cut-off for iron overload), conclusions regarding the association between gout and iron overload should be made with some caution. Nevertheless, the association with ferritin levels is of interest.

Using regression analyses adjusted for age, sex, BMI and C-reactive protein levels, the researchers identified a positive association between ferritin levels and serum urate, and also between ferritin levels and gout in some, but not all, data sets. This heterogeneity of results across the different studied populations and the non-adjustment for factors known to increase ferritin levels raises some issues with regards to the robustness

of the findings. It is tempting to speculate that the positive association might arise from confounders, particularly metabolic syndrome and non-alcoholic fatty liver disease⁵, in which both urate and ferritin levels are elevated⁶.

An intriguing finding from the observational analysis was the association between ferritin and gout flares, but the mechanism underlying this association is unclear. The authors speculate that the iron content of animal-based foods could contribute to the risk of flares, as occurs with high dietary purine intake. Because iron-rich foods are unlikely to trigger flare by causing acute crystallization of monosodium urate in synovial fluid, one hypothesis could be that other components in food are responsible for triggering gout attacks. One candidate might be free fatty acids, which are sharply increased after heavy eating⁷.

Interestingly, the authors tried to identify causality between iron and urate (or ferritin and urate) using a two-sample Mendelian randomization analysis. The genetic variants used as instrumental variables were five single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) associated with iron-related phenotypes and three SNPs associated with serum urate levels. These SNPs were selected from two previously published genome-wide association studies (GWAS) the Genetics of Iron Status Consortium and the Global Urate Genetics Consortium. In single-instrument analysis, the rs1800562 variant of HFE (encoding the human haemochromatosis protein), which is strongly associated with both iron and ferritin levels in GWAS⁸, was shown to causally increase serum uric acid levels. By contrast, causality was not detected between any of the three urate instruments SLC2A9 rs12498742, SLC16A9 rs1171614 or SLC22A12 rs478607 and iron or ferritin levels, a finding similar to that reported in a phenome-wide association study and Mendelian randomization analysis of the UK Biobank⁹. This exciting finding suggests that genetically controlled iron overload could be a risk factor for hyperuricaemia. Surprisingly, so far the association between hereditary haemochromatosis (the prototype disease for primary iron overload caused by homozygous or compound heterozygous mutation of HFE) and gout has not been reported.



Credit: Erhui1979/DigitalVision Vectors

However, one study of 738 patients with the *HFE* mutation C282Y found an association between ferritin and serum uric acid levels in multivariate analysis¹⁰, supporting the findings of Fatima et al.²

Although a mechanism by which iron overload might raise serum uric acid levels is not known, one explanation could be that iron induces expression of the enzyme xanthine oxidase and thus increases production of uric acid, as has been reported previously¹⁰. This increase in serum uric acid levels could, in turn, protect from the oxidative stress generated by non-transferrin-bound iron. Indeed, uric acid could function as an iron chelator by generating a urate-Fe³⁺ complex, limiting the production of hydroxyl radicals¹⁰.

In conclusion, iron overload might be added to the list of factors known to increase serum uric acid levels. However, this finding is quite unexpected, as an association between hereditary haemochromatosis and gout has not been reported in observational studies. Further data are therefore required to confirm a causal association, for example by showing that phlebotomy, which is the standard of care for patients with hereditary haemochromatosis and iron overload, can decrease serum uric acid levels. Pascal Richette* and Augustin Latourte Rheumatology Department, Hôpital Lariboisière, INSERM U1132, 2 rue Ambroise Paré, Paris, France.

*e-mail: pascal.richette@aphp.fr

https://doi.org/10.1038/s41584-018-0100-y

- Dalbeth, N., Merriman, T. R. & Stamp, L. K. Gout. Lancet 388, 2039–2052 (2016).
- Fatima, T. et al. The relationship between ferritin and urate levels and risk of gout. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* 20, 179 (2018).
- Li, X. et al. Serum uric acid levels and multiple health outcomes: umbrella review of evidence from observational studies, randomised controlled trials, and Mendelian randomisation studies. *BMJ* 357, j2376 (2017).
- Chio, A. J. et al. The association between serum ferritin and uric acid in humans. *Free Radic. Res.* 39, 337–342 (2005).
- 5. Kuo, C. F. et al. Gout and risk of non-alcoholic fatty liver
- disease. Scand. J. Rheumatol. **39**, 466–471 (2010).
 Liu, Z. et al. Dose-response relationship of serum uric acid with metabolic syndrome and non-alcoholic fatty liver disease incidence: a meta-analysis of prospective studies. Sci. Rep. **5**, 14325 (2015).
- Richette, P. & Bardin, T. Purine-rich foods: an innocent bystander of gout attacks? *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 71, 1435–1436 (2012).
- Benyanmin, B. et al. Novel loci affecting iron homeostasis and their effects in individuals at risk for hemochromatosis. *Nat. Commun.* 5, 4926 (2014).
- Li, X. et al. MR-PheWAS: exploring the causal effect of SUA level on multiple disease outcomes by using genetic instruments in UK Biobank. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 77, 1039–1047 (2018).
- Flais, J. et al. Hyperferritinemia increases the risk of hyperuricemia in HFE-hereditary hemochromatosis. *Joint Bone Spine* 84, 293–297 (2017).

Competing interests

The authors declare no competing interests.

Effects of the IL-23–IL-17 pathway on bone in spondyloarthritis

Ellen M. Gravallese^{1*} and Georg Schett²

Abstract | Over the past several years, a pathophysiological role for the IL-23–IL-17 pathway in human disease has been defined. A subset of rheumatic diseases, including psoriatic arthritis (PsA) and ankylosing spondylitis (AS), are now acknowledged to be triggered by dysregulated IL-23–IL-17 pathway activation. Genetic evidence links the IL-23–IL-17 pathway to inflammation in these rheumatic diseases, and mechanistic data from mice support a functional role for IL-23–IL-17 pathway activation in the development of enthesitis and in entheseal bone formation. Furthermore, analysis of human tissue samples, as well as data from clinical trials, also supports a role for activation of the IL-23–IL-17 pathway in these diseases. The unique bone phenotype that occurs in PsA and AS is a surprising coexistence of both systemic bone loss and periosteal and entheseal bone formation and is likely to be the result of the actions of IL-23 and/or IL-17 on bone. However, the effects of these cytokines on bone cells are complex, and controversy remains regarding their exact roles in the specific bone microenvironments relevant to PsA and AS.

Experimental evidence has increasingly demonstrated that several human diseases, including psoriatic arthritis (PsA) and ankylosing spondylitis (AS), which are included under the heading of spondyloarthritis (SpA), as well as psoriasis and Crohn's disease, are triggered by activation of the IL-23-IL-17 pathway. The pro-inflammatory cytokines IL-23 and IL-17 are important targets for current anti-inflammatory drug therapies, and activation of the IL-23-IL-17 pathway is required during immune activation in host defence against invading pathogens, as well as for maintaining the barrier function of mucosal and other body surfaces¹. Pathological activation of the IL-23-IL-17 pathway, in the context of certain genetic backgrounds, can lead to chronic inflammatory diseases including psoriasis, PsA and AS. Rheumatic diseases that are associated with activation of the IL-23-IL-17 pathway have a distinct skeletal phenotype that is characterized by the concomitant presence of bone loss and pathological new bone formation. Although the roles of IL-23 and IL-17 in precipitating inflammatory diseases have been reviewed elsewhere^{2,3}, this Review focuses specifically on the changes to bone that are seen in conjunction with chronic, pathological activation of the IL-23-IL-17 pathway. Current understanding of the molecular regulation of bone by these cytokines in the light of both mechanistic and clinical data is also discussed.

The IL-23–IL-17 pathway

IL-23 is a heterodimeric cytokine comprising two subunits (p19 and p40) and is produced by activated myeloid cells, predominantly dendritic cells (DCs) and monocyte or macrophage lineage cells, whereas IL-17 is produced by T cells, natural killer cells and innate lymphoid cells (ILCs)^{4,5}. Production of IL-23 is induced by the engagement of pattern recognition receptors on myeloid cells by bacterial products such as lipopolysaccharide and other danger-associated molecular patterns5. IL-23 is critically involved in the communication between myeloid cells and T cells and, together with IL-1β, IL-6 and transforming growth factor- β (TGF β), promotes the polarization of activated T cells into T helper 17 (T_H17) cells⁶. IL-23 also stabilizes the phenotype of T_H17 cells and improves the pro-inflammatory potential of these cells^{7,8}. To date, $T_{\rm H}$ 17 cells are the best described source of IL-17A, a pro-inflammatory effector cytokine that is physiologically involved in immune responses and in the homeostasis of epithelial barriers such as the skin and the intestine¹. Although T_H17 cells constitute an important source of IL-17A, other immune cells bearing the IL-23 receptor (IL-23R), including group 3 ILCs (ILC3s)9, γδ T cells and CD8⁺ cytotoxic T cells, can also produce IL-17A when activated10. Notably, IL-23 not only induces IL-17A production but also triggers the activation of other cytokines, including IL-21, IL-22 and IL-17F, which orchestrate epithelial responses, lymphocyte proliferation and augmentation of inflammation¹¹.

IL-23–IL-17 in pathogenesis

Genetic, mechanistic and clinical data support the concept that IL-23–IL-17 pathway activation is associated with the development of a distinct group of inflammatory rheumatic diseases, including PsA and AS.

¹Division of Rheumatology, Department of Medicine, University of Massachusetts Medical School, Worcester, MA, USA.

²Department of Internal Medicine 3, Friedrich Alexander University Erlangen-Nuremberg and Universitatsklinikum Erlangen, Erlangen, Germany.

*e-mail: ellen.gravallese@ umassmed.edu https://doi.org/10.1038/

s41584-018-0091-8

Key points

- IL-23 is produced by activated myeloid cells, whereas IL-17 is predominantly produced by T cells and innate lymphoid cells.
- Several lines of evidence support a role for the IL-23–IL-17 pathway in the pathogenesis of psoriatic arthritis (PsA) and ankylosing spondylitis (AS).
- Bone changes that occur in PsA and AS include systemic bone loss, articular erosions and entheseal bone formation and reflect the combined effects of IL-23 and IL-17.
- IL-17A promotes osteoclastogenesis directly, as well as indirectly, through the production or induction of receptor-activator of nuclear factor-kB ligand (RANKL) expression, whereas the effects of IL-23 on osteoclasts are pleotropic.
- IL-17A exhibits differential effects on the maturation of osteoblast precursor cells to osteoblasts depending upon the stage of differentiation of the cellular precursor.
- IL-17A blockade inhibits articular bone erosion and might also retard systemic bone loss in PsA and AS and enthesophyte formation in PsA.

Genetic evidence

The results of gene association studies have shown that patients with PsA share the same variants of IL23R as do patients with psoriasis¹². An association between the IL23R locus and AS also exists¹³, suggesting common pathogenic mechanisms in these diseases. Genetic and epigenetic fine mapping studies of inflammatory diseases and their causal variants also provide evidence for a close relationship between AS and non-rheumatic inflammatory diseases, including psoriasis and inflammatory bowel disease, that are associated with alterations in mucosal barrier functions¹⁴. In addition, overlap exists between risk alleles for AS and genes related to the IL-17 pathway, as demonstrated in a study that used an integrated genomics approach¹⁵. The identification of protective alleles in IL23R that lead to diminished phosphorylation of signal transducer and activator of transcription 3 (STAT3) and impaired production of IL-17 supports the idea that activation of the IL-23–IL-17 pathway is controlled at a genetic level^{16,17}.

HLA-B27 is strongly associated with the risk of developing AS, and HLA-B27 transgenic rats develop inflammation, articular erosions and bone proliferation similar to that seen in humans with AS18. In addition, evidence exists that the presence of HLA-B27 is associated with factors that regulate bone remodelling. For example, a study in which the sera of 241 individuals was examined demonstrated that HLA-B27-positive individuals had substantially lower serum concentrations of sclerostin and Dickkopf-related protein 1 (DKK1), which are both inhibitors of the Wnt signalling pathway, than HLA-B27-negative individuals regardless of whether they had SpA or uveitis alone or were healthy¹⁹. Low serum sclerostin concentrations have also been linked to increased formation of syndesmophytes in patients with AS²⁰. By contrast, serum concentrations of Indian hedgehog, a regulator of endochondral ossification, were substantially higher in HLA-B27-positive individuals than in HLA-B27-negative individuals¹⁹; these data suggest that the presence of HLA-B27 itself modulates the expression of these important regulators of bone homeostasis. Conversely, a study that used in vitro differentiation systems to examine both direct bone formation and bone formation that occurs through endochondral ossification found no difference in bone formation in the presence or absence of HLA-B27 (REF.²¹). Therefore,

additional studies are needed to further clarify the direct role of HLA-B27 in bone formation in SpA.

Mechanistic evidence from animal models

In addition to genetic evidence that links the IL-23-IL-17 pathway to specific rheumatic diseases, mechanistic data in mice support the functional role of IL-23-IL-17 pathway activation in the development of these diseases. Hence, mice that overexpress IL-23 develop enthesitis and peripheral arthritis²². In this model, IL-23 activated resident T cells within entheseal sites, causing them to produce IL-17A, IL-22 and IL-17F and trigger local inflammation²². Other rodent models that have features that mimic human PsA or AS are also characterized by IL-23-IL-17 pathway activation. For example, CD4⁺ T cells in HLA-B27 transgenic rats produce IL-17 (REF.²³). Furthermore, blockade of IL-17A function with anti-IL-17 antibodies prevented the development of AS-like features in the spine of SKG mice (which spontaneously develop arthritis and peri-spinal inflammation)²⁴. Finally, male BXSB×NZB mice, which spontaneously develop enthesitis, are characterized by expansion of the IL-17-secreting $T_{\rm H}17$ cell population²⁵. Taken together, these data²²⁻²⁵ imply a causal relationship between IL-23-IL-17 pathway activation and the development of entheseal inflammation, which is a hallmark of human PsA and AS.

Clinical evidence

Evidence from analyses of cell and tissue samples from patients with PsA or AS also supports a role for activation of the IL-23–IL-17 pathway in human disease. In AS, peripheral blood samples from patients have increased numbers of T_H17 cells²⁶, T_H22 cells²⁷ and $\gamma\delta$ T cells²⁸, and serum concentrations of IL-17 and IL-23 are also increased compared with those in healthy individuals²⁹. Furthermore, synovial tissue from patients with PsA contains cells that express IL-23 and/or IL-17 (REF.³⁰), and IL-17-producing cells are present in the facet joints of patients with AS³¹. ILC3s are also present in human entheseal tissue³².

Additionally, data from clinical trials in patients with PsA or AS support the relevance of IL-17 in these diseases; targeting IL-17A by use of the neutralizing antibodies secukinumab and ixekizumab ameliorated inflammation in both PsA and AS33-35. A direct role for IL-23 in the pathogenesis of PsA has been shown by the clinical efficacy of ustekinumab, an antibody directed against the common p40 subunit of IL-12 and IL-23 (REFS^{36,37}). Furthermore, IL-23 targeting has been shown to achieve superior control of enthesitis over targeting TNF in patients with PsA³⁸. However, although targeting IL-23 is effective in PsA, the results of a 2018 randomized, double-blind, phase II study of risankizumab, an antibody directed against the p19 subunit of IL-23, showed no efficacy for this approach in patients with AS³⁹ despite promising initial data from an open label trial of ustekinumab in patients with AS⁴⁰. These results suggest that IL-23 might not be an essential cytokine in the pathogenesis of inflammation in patients with established AS but might have a role in the initiation phase of this disease.

Bone phenotype in PsA and AS

Diseases such as PsA and AS have a profound effect on bone and serve to highlight the unique and specific microenvironments that exist within bone⁴¹. Given that in both diseases there is evidence for robust activation of the IL-23–IL-17 pathway, the manifestations of bone changes in PsA and AS reflect the specific signature of the combined effects of IL-23 and IL-17 on the human skeleton. Similar to other chronic inflammatory diseases, including rheumatoid arthritis (RA) and Crohn's disease, PsA and AS are associated with premature systemic bone loss (FIG. 1a). Hence, in the long bones and vertebrae of patients with PsA or AS, both trabecular and cortical bone are lost and osteopenia and/or osteoporosis ensue^{42,43}. AS is associated with increased fracture risk⁴⁴, a fact that seems also to be true in PsA⁴⁵. Overall, systemic bone loss in AS and PsA seems to be somewhat less pronounced than that observed in RA, which might reflect the absence of additional factors in AS and PsA that promote bone loss, such as antibodies directed towards citrullinated proteins, an important pathogenic feature in RA but not in AS or PsA. These anti-citrullinated protein antibodies (ACPAs) promote osteoclastogenesis even in the absence of inflammation⁴⁶ and are associated with systemic bone loss in RA before the onset of clinical disease⁴⁷.

By contrast, prominent focal new bone formation occurs in AS and PsA (FIG. 1b), which distinguishes these diseases from RA, in which localized bone changes are essentially catabolic in nature. New bone formation in



b Local bone changes



Fig. 1 | **Effects of IL-23 and IL-17 on bone. a** | Diseases associated with overexpression of IL-23 and/or IL-17 induce systemic bone loss characterized by a decrease in cortical and trabecular bone. This effect is caused by a negative net balance of bone remodelling in which increased osteoclast-mediated bone resorption and decreased osteoblast-mediated bone formation occur. **b** | At the local level, particularly at entheseal sites, IL-23 and/or IL-17 instigate an inflammatory response at periosteal areas, which leads to fracture repair-like bone apposition and to the formation of enthesophytes. MSC, mesenchymal stem cell.

AS and PsA is a localized process that begins at specific anatomical sites^{48,49}; entheseal inflammation seems to be closely linked to new bone formation in PsA and AS. Newly formed bone appears as bony spurs originating from periosteal sites that are juxtaposed to the insertions of tendons and ligaments. Notably, this process is not linked to the remodelling process within the skeleton but rather resembles a response-to-injury process. Mechanistically, bony spurs that form in PsA and AS at both peripheral and axial skeletal sites are generated through an endochondral bone formation sequence that in many instances mimics fracture healing, in which a cartilage scaffold is formed and then subsequently remodelled into bone. Paradoxically, IL-23 and IL-17 seem to indirectly promote this process at entheseal sites, as both cytokines are involved in expanding entheseal inflammation, thereby instigating an exaggerated repair response in bone. Thus, IL-23-IL-17 pathway activation is associated with both systemic catabolic and localized anabolic bone changes.

Immune regulation of bone

Whereas glucocorticoid treatment, age and the postmenopausal state are classically seen as the main risk factors for bone loss in inflammatory diseases, the central role of inflammation as a direct trigger for bone loss has long been underappreciated. In fact, inflammation is one of the most powerful triggers of bone loss in mammalian species⁵⁰. The net loss of bone in the context of inflammation is usually a result of an increase in bone resorption by osteoclasts combined with a decrease in bone formation by osteoblasts. This imbalance in bone homeostasis elicited by inflammation is powerful enough to precipitate premature bone loss and to increase fracture risk. Moreover, chronically high concentrations of acute phase reactants are associated with an increase in fracture risk⁵¹, underscoring the key role of inflammation in controlling bone mass.

Increasingly, insights into the molecular regulation of osteoclasts and osteoblasts by inflammation-borne factors, and into specific immune-bone cell interactions, have led to an improved understanding of the determinants of bone changes during inflammation. For example, the expression of receptor-activator of nuclear factor-κB ligand (RANKL; also known as TNFSF11) by activated T cells⁵²⁻⁵⁴ links immune activation with increased bone resorption. Furthermore, RANKL expression is induced in resident mesenchymal cells by several key pro-inflammatory cytokines, including TNF, IL-1 and IL-6 (REF.55). One study of cell type-specific deletion of RANKL has shown that synovial fibroblast-derived, but not T cell-derived, RANKL has a key role in articular bone erosion in the setting of inflammatory arthritis⁵⁶. In addition, the anti-RANKL antibody denosumab also inhibits inflammatory bone loss^{57,58}, supporting the concept that the induction of osteoclast differentiation is an important effector pathway by which inflammation promotes the degradation of bone in human rheumatic diseases. Consequently, the use of denosumab has been approved in Japan to protect patients with RA from bone erosion⁵⁹.

Notably, the cytokine repertoire that is engaged in specific disease processes determines the pattern of bone

disease that manifests. TNF, IL-1 and IL-6 are classic bone-degrading cytokines that directly (by binding to osteoclasts or their precursor cells) or indirectly (by inducing RANKL expression on mesenchymal cells) induce osteoclast differentiation and bone resorption. Thus, in diseases in which these cytokines are prevalent, such as RA, the resulting bone phenotype is one of bone loss. Other cytokines, however, have markedly different regulatory effects on bone. For example, type I and type II interferons effectively antagonize RANKL-mediated signalling in osteoclasts and thereby protect bone from osteoclast-mediated resorption⁶⁰. Other cytokines that inhibit bone loss include IL-4, IL-13 and IL-33, which are involved in the differentiation of $T_{\mu}2$ cells and are upregulated in allergic diseases such as asthma. These cytokines effectively inhibit osteoclast differentiation by both direct and indirect mechanisms⁶¹. Therefore, the predominant cytokines expressed in a given immune-mediated or inflammatory disease determine the respective outcome for bone. In this respect, an in-depth understanding of the influence of the IL-23-IL-17 pathway on bone cells is required to fully explain the bone changes that occur in PsA and AS (FIG. 2).

Effects of IL-17 on bone

IL-17 and osteoclasts. The systemic bone loss and focal bone erosions that occur in PsA (and also in some patients with AS) suggest that activation of the IL-23-IL-17 pathway induces the differentiation of bone-resorbing osteoclasts. The first recognition that IL-17 influences bone homeostasis came from Kotake and colleagues, who reported that IL-17 potently induces osteoclastogenesis in an osteoblast-osteoclast co-culture system62. Mechanistically, in this setting, IL-17 induced the expression of RANKL on osteoblasts, which promoted the robust induction of osteoclast differentiation. The notion that IL-17-induced osteoclast differentiation is RANKL-dependent was additionally supported by the fact that osteoprotegerin (OPG; also known as TNFRSF11B), a soluble decoy receptor for RANKL, completely blocked IL-17-mediated osteoclastogenesis⁶². Subsequent studies confirmed the pro-osteoclastogenic effect of IL-17 (REFS^{63,64}), and T_H17 cells are now known to be a key T cell subset in the stimulation of osteoclastogenesis, supporting osteoclast differentiation by releasing IL-17 and by expressing RANKL65. In a mouse model of collagen-induced arthritis and in patients with RA, so-called exFOXP3 $\rm T_{\rm H}17$ cells, which are $\rm T_{\rm H}17$ cells that have lost expression of the regulatory T cell-associated transcription factor FOXP3 and that express high levels of RANKL, seem to be the most potently osteoclastogenic T cell subset⁶⁶. Classic $T_H 17$ cells also have a more potent pro-osteoclastogenic effect than yo T cells, which represent an additional source of IL-17 (REF.⁶⁷).

IL-17 also exerts direct effects on osteoclasts^{68,69}. Most prominently, osteoclast lineage cells exposed to IL-17 upregulate RANK, the receptor for RANKL, which improves the osteoclastogenic potential of RANKL in these cells⁶⁹. In addition to its direct effects on bone cells, IL-17 is also pro-inflammatory, which adds to its effects on bone resorption in arthritis. For instance, IL-17A induces the expression of classic pro-inflammatory



Fig. 2 | Effects of IL-23 and IL-17 on osteoclasts and osteoblasts. Dendritic cells (DCs) and monocytes produce IL-23, which induces the production of IL-17 by T helper 17 (T_{H} 17) cells and $\gamma\delta$ T cells. IL-17 increases receptor-activator of nuclear factor- κ B (RANK) expression on osteoclast precursor cells and RANK ligand (RANKL) expression on mesenchymal stem cells (MSCs). T_{H} 17 cells and $\gamma\delta$ T cells also produce RANKL themselves. These processes induce osteoclast differentiation. The direct effect of IL-23 on osteoclast precursor cells to induce or inhibit osteoclastogenesis remains controversial. IL-17 also has an effect on MSCs, potentially inducing MSC proliferation and promoting their differentiation into osteoblasts. However, IL-17 causes the inhibition of Wnt signalling and osteoblast differentiation in committed osteoblasts. T_H17 cells also produce IL-22 in response to IL-23, which in turn has an effect on inflammation and possibly also on bone formation in spondyloarthritis.

cytokines (including TNF, IL-1 and IL-6)^{70,71} by stromal cells and macrophages, and these cytokines function downstream of IL-17A to affect osteoclastogenesis.

Overall, current data provide substantial evidence for a catabolic function for IL-17A in bone homeostasis that is mirrored by the induction of osteoclastogenesis, thereby explaining the development of bone erosions and osteopenia and/or osteoporosis typically seen in patients with PsA or AS. In support of this concept, blockade of IL-17A by the neutralizing antibodies ixekizumab and secukinumab retarded the progression of bone erosions in patients with PsA^{35,72}.

IL-17 and osteoblasts. In addition to the articular and systemic bone loss that occurs in PsA and AS, the prominent entheseal bone formation that occurs in these diseases suggests that either IL-17 or IL-23 itself promotes osteoblast differentiation and subsequent bone formation. Osteoblasts are derived from cells of the mesenchymal lineage, but controversy remains regarding the

effects of IL-17A on the differentiation and function of these cells. The results of some studies indicate that IL-17A induces osteoblast differentiation from human mesenchymal stem cells (MSCs)^{73,74}, suggesting that IL-17A would be protective against generalized bone loss. In support of this concept, bone loss induced by ovariectomy was increased in mice deficient for IL-17 receptor A (IL-17RA), the receptor for IL-17A⁷⁵.

However, conflicting data have shown that IL-17A inhibits osteoblast differentiation, as blockade of IL-17A and IL-17RA-deficiency protected mice from bone loss following ovariectomy⁷⁶. Further support for this concept came from two studies that demonstrated that IL-17A exerts inhibitory effects on osteoblast differentiation and function. In one study, Uluckan et al.⁷⁷ investigated whether IL-17A expression in skin could result in systemic bone loss using two mouse models that mimic human psoriasis: the *K14IL17A*^{ind} mouse, in which IL-17A is expressed under the control of the keratin 14 promoter, leading to epidermal IL-17A expression

and a psoriasis-like skin condition, and mice with epithelial deletion of transcription factor JUNB (JUNB^{∆ep} mice), which also results in epidermal IL-17A expression. These models both resulted in systemic bone loss caused by a decrease in osteoblast activity rather than by an increase in osteoclast activity. Furthermore, blockade of IL-17A signalling using an IL-17A blocking antibody reversed the bone loss phenotype in JUNB^{Δep} mice⁷⁷, consistent with the concept that IL-17A is an inhibitor of osteoblast function and bone formation and that blockade of IL-17A promotes bone formation. In murine cells, IL-17A inhibited the mRNA and protein expression of markers of late osteoblast differentiation, such as osteocalcin, and of early osteocyte differentiation, such as dentin matrix acidic phosphoprotein 1 (DMP1) and phosphate-regulating neutral endopeptidase77. This effect was associated with the profound downregulation of genes involved in the Wnt pathway, including Axin2, Wisp1 and Bmp4, suggesting that IL-17A actively suppresses the differentiation of osteoblast precursor cells into osteoblasts and osteocytes.

In another study, Shaw et al.⁷⁸ also found an osteoblast inhibitory effect of IL-17A. In the K/B×N serum transfer model of arthritis, IL-17A-deficient mice developed more periosteal bone formation than wild-type mice despite the fact that the severities of inflammation and articular bone erosion were similar in both groups of mice78. IL-17A also inhibited calvarial osteoblast differentiation in vitro and affected the Wnt signalling pathway by inducing expression of the Wnt antagonist soluble frizzled related protein 1 (sFRP1), which inhibits bone formation. Notably, antibody blockade of sFRP1 led to a reduction in the inhibitory effect of IL-17A on osteoblast differentiation⁷⁸. The results of these studies^{77,78} that indicate that IL-17A inhibits osteoblast differentiation are also in agreement with the results of a study by Kim et al.79 that showed the suppressive effects of IL-17 on rat calvarial osteoblast differentiation in vitro and on bone regeneration in a rat calvarial defect model in vivo.

By contrast, however, Ono et al.⁸⁰ used a femoral cortical bone defect drill hole model to demonstrate that IL-17A, which is produced in large amounts by $\gamma\delta$ T cells immediately after injury to bone, promoted bone formation and healing by stimulating mesenchymal progenitor cells to proliferate and differentiate into osteoblasts. This model recapitulated the process of intramembranous bone formation. In this study⁸⁰, IL-17A-deficient mice had impaired fracture healing owing to defective osteoblast-mediated bone formation. These results are consistent with the results of a previous study⁸¹ that showed that T cells promote osteoblast differentiation in early fracture repair via the production of IL-17F.

Although these data^{77–80} are seemingly contradictory, the osteoblast precursor cells that were examined in vitro in these studies were different. Uluckan et al.⁷⁷, Shaw et al.⁷⁸ and Kim et al.⁷⁹ used calvarial osteoblasts, which are cells already committed to the osteoblast lineage, whereas Ono et al.⁸⁰ negatively selected a population of mesenchymal precursor cells from repair tissue within the cortical bone defects. Finally, human MSCs express IL-17RA⁷³, and IL-17A and IL-17F derived from T_H17 cells induce the differentiation of MSCs into osteoblasts in vitro, as evidenced by the induction of alkaline phosphatase activity and matrix mineralization⁸². Taken together, these data^{73–82} suggest that the effect of IL-17A on osteoblast differentiation probably depends upon the cell type exposed to IL-17A, the differentiation stage of that cell and perhaps also the timing and duration of cytokine exposure (FIG. 2).

Effects of IL-23 on bone

IL-23 and osteoclasts. Conflicting data exist as to how IL-23, an essential inducer of T_H17 cell differentiation, influences osteoclast formation. Clearly, IL-23 promotes the differentiation of osteoclasts indirectly via the induction of T_H17 cell polarization and IL-17A production in vivo⁸³⁻⁸⁵; however, the direct effects of IL-23 on osteoclastogenesis are less well understood. IL-23 has been suggested to induce osteoclastogenesis directly in human cells in the absence of osteoblasts or exogenous soluble RANKL⁸³. Osteoclastogenesis induced by IL-23 from monocyte lineage cells was inhibited by an anti-IL-17 antibody, by etanercept (a TNF inhibitor) and by OPG, demonstrating that IL-17, TNF and RANKL are all involved in IL-23-mediated osteoclastogenesis⁸³. However, questions remain as to whether these direct effects of IL-23 have been clearly demonstrated, as monocyte lineage cells are poor sources of RANKL and IL-17. More convincing evidence that IL-23 might directly promote osteoclast differentiation comes from studies that demonstrated the induction of RANK expression on osteoclast precursor cells upon stimulation by IL-23 (REF.⁸⁶) and the activation of DNAX-activation protein 12 (DAP12; also known as TYROBP) by IL-23, which is part of a RANKL-independent pathway for osteoclast differentiation⁸⁷.

Conversely, direct inhibitory (rather than stimulatory) effects of IL-23 on osteoclasts have been reported. For example, exposure of monocytes to IL-23 inhibited osteoclast differentiation in murine cells in vitro and in an in vivo model^{88,89}. Furthermore, genetic data from mice suggest that IL-23 has protective effects on bone under steady state conditions, as a 30% decrease in bone mass was demonstrated in mice deficient for the p19 subunit of IL-23 (REF.⁸⁹). In addition, IL-23 induced the production of granulocyte-macrophage colony-stimulating factor (GM-CSF), a well-known inhibitor of osteoclast differentiation, by T_H17 cells, and this induction limited bone resorption⁸⁹. However, as IL-17 and RANKL expressed by T_H17 cells favour osteoclast differentiation and bone resorption, the net effect of IL-23 on bone might therefore be converted to a catabolic one83-85 (which might additionally be supported by the pro-inflammatory actions of IL-23 demonstrated in mouse models of arthritis^{83,84,90}). Hence, although the net effect of IL-23 on osteoclasts during steady state conditions might be regulatory in nature, IL-23 could also activate osteoclast differentiation in the context of inflammatory disease. This concept is also supported by data showing that therapeutic inhibition of IL-23 by ustekinumab limits the progression of bone erosions in patients with PsA⁹¹.

An important, yet underappreciated, effect of IL-23 on osteoclastogenesis and early bone loss in

autoimmune diseases is the ability of IL-23 to downregulate the enzyme β -galactoside α -2,6-sialyltransferase 1 (ST6Gal1), which controls the sialylation of antibodies⁹². De-sialylated antibodies, which are generated in the pro-inflammatory environment triggered by IL-23, not only induced the release of effector cytokines by macrophages but also strongly induced osteoclast differentiation and bone resorption in vitro and in vivo in mice⁹³. Hence, IL-23 might be important in autoimmune-mediated bone loss, especially in the early phases of diseases such as RA, in which ACPAs and rheumatoid factor are important triggers of osteoclast differentiation⁴⁶. However, the effects of IL-23 on ST6Gal1 in PsA and AS remain unknown.

IL-23 and osteoblasts. In contrast to IL-17, IL-23 did not have any effects on the differentiation of osteoblasts (as measured by alkaline phosphatase activity), or on their proliferation, nor did it induce RANKL expression in osteoblasts⁸⁸ in vitro. In addition, although mesenchymal cells and osteoblasts express IL-17RA, they lack expression of IL-23R⁹⁴.

Potential effects of IL-22 on bone

Another important cytokine in the IL-23-IL-17 pathway is IL-22, which is produced by a number of immune cells, including bone marrow DCs, T_H17 cells, $T_{\rm H}22$ cells, ILC3s, $\gamma\delta$ T cells and CD8⁺IL-17⁺ T cells⁹⁵. IL-22 is thought to be important in the pathogenesis of PsA and AS, as it is produced by enthesis-resident T cells in mice that overexpress IL-23 (REF.²²). IL-22 also promoted local osteoblast differentiation in these mice through the upregulation of STAT3 (presumably in osteoblast precursor cells), thereby inducing the expression of genes that regulate bone formation²². Additionally, IL-22 promotes hyperproliferation of keratinocytes in the skin and of synovial fibroblasts derived from the joints of patients with PsA^{96,97}. The results of a 2018 study98 lend support for a role for IL-22 in the pathogenesis of PsA. The authors used a new model of PsA in which mice have T cell-specific expression of a hyperactive Stat3 allele (R26Stat3Cstopfl/flCD-4Cre mice) and develop IL-17-driven psoriasiform skin lesions, tendonitis and/or enthesitis, articular bone erosion and osteopenia. Treatment of these mice with an IL-17-neutralizing antibody or deletion of IL-22 led to an improvement in both skin and bone disease manifestations98, thereby implicating IL-22 as well as IL-17 in the pathogenesis of PsA.

IL-22 can also promote osteoclastogenesis through the induction of RANKL expression by synovial fibroblasts⁹⁹. However, whether IL-22 is involved in articular bone erosion in PsA or AS is not yet known. IL-22 might also affect osteoblast differentiation. The results of a study in which the effects of IL-22 on human MSCs were examined demonstrate that IL-22 promotes the proliferation and migration of MSCs in an inflammatory environment⁹⁴ and might directly promote their differentiation into osteoblasts¹⁰⁰. In addition, primary osteoblasts do not express receptors for IL-22 (REF.⁹⁴). Therefore, additional studies are needed to clarify the effects of IL-22 on bone in PsA and AS.

Emerging concepts

Bone changes in PsA and AS are a remarkable combination of exaggerated bone resorption with a simultaneous increase in bone formation. In this regard, PsA and AS exhibit a unique bone phenotype that is probably a result of the distinct cytokine activation pattern in these diseases. Substantial evidence exists in support of the hypothesis that both IL-17 and IL-23 are involved in the pathogenesis of inflammation in PsA and AS. Inflammation of the synovial membrane in these diseases might be caused by a direct extension of disease activity at inflamed entheseal sites, especially if these structures are adjacent to one another, as in so-called synovio-entheseal complexes¹⁰¹. Both cytokines also have profound effects on bone remodelling. So how can such diverse effects be explained, and why does it seem that bone responds differently to IL-17 and IL-23 at specific anatomical sites?

The prevailing evidence from studies on the effects of IL-17 and IL-23 on bone suggests that both cytokines trigger net bone loss by directly or indirectly affecting osteoclasts; IL-17 and IL-23 stimulate the bone-resorbing behaviour of osteoclasts and downregulate compensatory bone formation. This IL-23-IL-17 pathway-induced imbalance in bone homeostasis would explain, at least in part, the systemic bone loss that occurs in patients with AS or PsA, and these cytokines therefore represent two specific effector molecules involved in immune-mediated bone loss in these diseases. Bone erosions arise from an imbalance in bone remodelling at skeletal sites that are directly exposed to the inflamed, cytokine-rich synovial membrane. As a consequence of interactions with the inflamed synovium, osteoclastogenesis is induced, leading to the degradation of bone. The IL-23-IL-17 pathway-mediated skewing of physiological bone remodelling towards a negative net balance, and the induction of progressive bone loss, might therefore also contribute to the articular bone erosions that form in the peripheral joints and the sacroiliac joints of patients with these diseases.

By contrast, new bone formation in patients with PsA or AS is a localized process that affects distinct anatomical sites. In this process, IL-23 and IL-17 are involved in an inflammatory stress response to injury, which is accompanied by localized new bone formation in the cortical bone that resembles fracture repair. In this context, IL-23 and IL-17 might produce an inflammatory microenvironment that encourages bone responses rather than directly executing such responses. Other factors are also likely to be involved, including prostaglandin E₂ (a known inducer of osteoblast differentiation¹⁰² and IL-22 (REF.¹⁰⁰). IL-17A, despite being an inhibitor of osteoblast function and being able to trigger systemic bone loss, might also directly contribute to this process by promoting the local differentiation of mesenchymal precursor cells in this response-to-injury setting¹⁰³, as results gained using the cortical bone defect drill hole model would suggest⁸⁰. Notably, however, if IL-17A does indeed inhibit osteoblast differentiation, then blockade of this cytokine could help to promote bone formation, particularly if the inhibition of IL-17A does not also eliminate inflammation, as it might not in all clinical settings.

	PsA and AS	RA
Mechanisms	Mechano-inflammation	Autoimmune inflammation
	Mild or no acute phase	Acute phase
	MHC class I (HLA-Cw6 and HLA-B27)	MHC class II (HLA-DR4)
	No humoral autoreactivity	Autoantibodies
Manifestations	Enthesitis	Synovitis
	Axial disease frequent	Axial disease rare
	DIP disease frequent	DIP disease absent
	Bony spur formation	Bone erosion
Medications	IL-17 (and/or IL-23) inhibitors and TNF inhibitors	IL-6 inhibitors and TNF inhibitors

Fig. 3 | **Essential characteristics of IL-17-dependent forms of arthritis.** A '3M-model' (mechanisms, manifestations and medications) of the key differences between spondyloarthritis (namely, psoriatic arthritis (PsA) and ankylosing spondylitis (AS)) and rheumatoid arthritis (RA). With respect to bone, PsA and AS are characterized by an entheseal-driven, IL-17-dependent inflammation that leads to new bone formation (enthesophytes). DIP, distal interphalangeal joint.

Implications for treatment

Blockade of IL-17A is an effective approach for controlling the clinical signs and symptoms of inflammation in patients with PsA and AS. By contrast, IL-17 blockade is not effective in patients with RA, suggesting the existence of essential differences between different forms of arthritis in their mechanistic origin and clinical manifestations (FIG. 3). Hence, the 'mechano-inflammation' that occurs in PsA and AS, which is MHC class I-mediated, is essentially not autoimmune in origin and is not dependent on IL-6 but is dependent on IL-17. Accordingly, blockade of IL-17A with ixekizumab or secukinumab, as well as of IL-12 and/or IL-23 with ustekinumab, inhibited the progression of bone erosions in peripheral arthritis in patients with PsA^{35,72,91}. Furthermore, in two double-blind, placebo-controlled trials (MEASURE 1 and MEASURE 2), treatment with secukinumab led to substantial improvements in the signs and symptoms of AS^{33,104}. Structural bone changes in patients with AS have also been assessed by measuring the progression of syndesmophyte formation in the spine using the modified Stoke Ankylosing Spondylitis Spine Score (mSASSS)¹⁰⁵. These analyses showed a mild retardation of syndesmophyte formation in patients with AS upon secukinumab treatment¹⁰⁵. This outcome is important, as structural bone damage in patients with AS is associated with a decline in function in these patients¹⁰⁶. Supporting this concept, the results of a 2018 study¹⁰⁷ in which comprehensive high-resolution imaging was used on patients with PsA suggest that IL-17 inhibition arrests the progression of not only bone erosion but also enthesophyte formation. This effect is accompanied by the preservation of bone mass and bone functional properties in patients with PsA¹⁰⁷.

Overall, the current evidence for the effects of IL-17 and/or IL-23 inhibition on halting osteoclast-mediated bone erosion is strong, whereas data on the effects of inhibition of these cytokines on new bone formation are scarce. Despite having negative effects on bone formation in the context of bone remodelling, IL-17A can also trigger entheseal inflammation and thereby influence local bone formation. This function might enable IL-17 blockade to beneficially influence enthesophyte formation in the peripheral joints and the spine of patients with PsA or AS. Additional studies to investigate the interactions between IL-17A and the regulation of inflammation and new bone formation in PsA and AS are essential.

Conclusions

The effects of IL-17A and IL-23 on bone in PsA and AS are complex. The direct effects of these cytokines on osteoclasts and on bone resorption suggest that these cytokines have a catabolic effect on bone, whereas the effects of IL-17A on osteoblast lineage cells seem to differ depending on the stage of differentiation of the cell at the time of exposure to this cytokine. Furthermore, indirect effects of IL-23 and IL-17 that encourage periosteal repair responses probably explain the seemingly paradoxical anabolic effect of these two cytokines on bone in patients with PsA or AS. The effect of the IL-23-IL-17 pathway on bone is an area of active research, and the results of both basic and clinical investigations should shed further light on these mechanisms and help to advise future therapeutic approaches.

Published online 28 September 2018

- Song, X., He, X., Li, X. & Qian, Y. The roles and functional mechanisms of interleukin-17 family cytokines in mucosal immunity. *Cell. Mol. Immunol.* 13, 418–431 (2016).
- Boutet, M. A., Nerviani, A., Gallo Afflitto, G. & Pitzalis, C. Role of the IL-23/IL-17 axis in psoriasis and psoriatic arthritis: the clinical importance of its divergence in skin and joints. *Int. J. Mol. Sci.* **19**, e530 (2018).
- Ranganathan, V., Gracey, E., Brown, M. A., Inman, R. D. & Haroon, N. Pathogenesis of ankylosing spondylitis recent advances and future directions. *Nat. Rev. Rheumatol.* 13, 359–367 (2017).
- Gaffen, S. L., Jain, R., Garg, A. V. & Cua, D. J. The IL-23-IL-17 immune axis: from mechanisms to therapeutic testing. *Nat. Rev. Immunol.* 14, 585–600 (2014).
- Oppmann, B. et al. Novel p19 protein engages IL-12p40 to form a cytokine, IL-23, with biological activities similar as well as distinct from IL-12. *Immunity* 13, 715–725 (2000).
- Cua, D. J. et al. Interleukin-23 rather than interleukin-12 is the critical cytokine for autoimmune inflammation of the brain. *Nature* 421, 744–748 (2003).

- 7. Wu, C. et al. Induction of pathogenic $T_{\rm H}17$ cells by inducible salt-sensing kinase SGK1. *Nature* **496**, 513–517 (2013).
- Ghoreschi, K. et al. Generation of pathogenic T(H)17 cells in the absence of TGF-β signalling. *Nature* 467, 967–971 (2010).
- Montaldo, E., Juelke, K. & Romagnani, C. Group 3 innate lymphoid cells (ILC3s): Origin, differentiation, and plasticity in humans and mice. *Eur. J. Immunol.* 45, 2127–2182 (2015).
- Keijsers, R. R., Joosten, I., van Erp, P. E., Koenen, H. J. & van de Kerkhof, P. C. Cellular sources of IL-17 in psoriasis: a paradigm shift? *Exp. Dermatol.* 23, 799–803 (2014).
- Razawy, W., van Driel, M. & Lubberts, E. The role of IL-23 receptor signaling in inflammation-mediated erosive autoimmune arthritis and bone remodeling. *Eur. J. Immunol.* 48, 220–229 (2018).
- Huffmeier, U. et al. Cenetic variants of the IL-23R pathway: association with psoriatic arthritis and psoriasis vulgaris, but no specific risk factor for arthritis. J. Invest. Dermatol. 129, 355–358 (2009).
- Wellcome Trust Case Control Consortium et al. Association scan of 14,500 nonsynonymous SNPs in four diseases identifies autoimmunity variants. *Nat. Cenet.* 39, 1329–1337 (2007).
- Farh, K. K. et al. Genetic and epigenetic fine mapping of causal autoimmune disease variants. *Nature* 518, 337–343 (2015).
- Uddin, M. et al. Integrated genomics identifies convergence of ankylosing spondylitis with global immune mediated disease pathways. *Sci. Rep.* 5, 10314 (2015).
- Sarin, R., Wu, X. & Abraham, C. Inflammatory disease protective R3810 IL23 receptor polymorphism results in decreased primary CD4⁺ and CD8⁺ human T cell functional responses. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* **108**, 9560–9565 (2011).
- Di Meglio, P. et al. The IL23R R381Q gene variant protects against immune-mediated diseases by impairing IL-23-induced Th17 effector response in humans. *PLoS ONE* 6, e17160 (2011).
- van Duivenvoorde, L. M. et al. Relationship between inflammation, bone destruction, and osteoproliferation in the HLA-B27/human β2 -microglobulin-transgenic rat model of spondylarthritis. *Arthritis Rheum.* 64, 3210–3219 (2012).
- Aschermann, S. et al. Presence of HLA-B27 is associated with changes of serum levels of mediators of the Wht and hedgehog pathway. *Joint Bone Spine* 83, 43–46 (2016).
- Appel, H. et al. Altered skeletal expression of sclerostin and its link to radiographic progression in ankylosing spondylitis. *Arthritis Rheum.* 60, 3257–3262 (2009).
- Neerinckx, B., Kollnberger, S., Shaw, J. & Lories, R. No evidence for a direct role of HLA-B27 in pathological bone formation in axial SpA. *RMD Open* 3, e000451 (2017).
- Sherlock, J. P. et al. IL-23 induces spondyloarthropathy by acting on ROR-yt⁺ CD3⁺CD4⁻CD4⁻ entheseal resident T cells. *Nat. Med.* 18, 1069–1076 (2012).
- Utriainen, L. et al. Expression of HLA-B27 causes loss of migratory dendritic cells in a rat model of spondyloarthritis. *Arthritis Rheum.* 64, 3199–3209 (2012).
- Ebihara, S., Date, F., Dong, Y. & Ono, M. Interleukin-17 is a critical target for the treatment of ankylosing enthesitis and psoriasis-like dermatitis in mice. *Autoimmunity* 48, 259–266 (2015).
- Abe, Y. et al. Ankylosing enthesitis associated with upregulated IFN-γ and IL-17 production in (BXSB×NZB) F(1) male mice: a new mouse model. *Mod. Rheumatol.* 19, 316–322 (2009).
- Shen, H., Goodall, J. C. & Hill Gaston, J. S. Frequency and phenotype of peripheral blood Th 17 cells in ankylosing spondylitis and rheumatoid arthritis. *Arthritis Rheum.* 60, 1647–1656 (2009).
- Zhang, L. et al. Increased frequencies of Th22 cells as well as Th17 cells in the peripheral blood of patients with ankylosing spondylitis and rheumatoid arthritis. *PLoS ONE* 7, e31000 (2012).
- 28. Kenna, T. J. et al. Enrichment of circulating interleukin-17-secreting interleukin-23 receptor-positive γ/δ T cells in patients with active ankylosing spondylitis. *Arthritis Rheum.* **64**, 1420–1429 (2012).
- Mei, Y. et al. Increased serum IL-17 and IL-23 in the patient with ankylosing spondylitis. *Clin. Rheumatol.* 30, 269–273 (2011).
- Celis, R. et al. Synovial cytokine expression in psoriatic arthritis and associations with lymphoid neogenesis and clinical features. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* 14, R93 (2012).

- 31. Appel, H. et al. Analysis of IL-17(+) cells in facet joints of patients with spondyloarthritis suggests that the innate immune pathway might be of greater relevance than the Th17-mediated adaptive immune response. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* **13**, R95 (2011).
- Cuthbert, R. J. et al. Brief report: group 3 innate lymphoid cells in human enthesis. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* 69, 1816–1822 (2017).
- Baeten, D. et al. Anti-interleukin-17A monoclonal antibody secukinumab in treatment of ankylosing spondylitis: a randomised, double-blind, placebocontrolled trial (arcet 382) 1705–1713 (2013)
- controlled trial. *Lancet* 382, 1705–1713 (2013).
 Mease, P. J. et al. Secukinumab inhibition of interleukin-17A in patients with psoriatic arthritis. *N. Engl. J. Med.* 373, 1329–1339 (2015).
- Mease, P. J. et al. Ixekizumab, an interleukin-17A specific monoclonal antibody, for the treatment of biologic-naive patients with active psoriatic arthritis: results from the 24-week randomised, double-blind, placebo-controlled and active (adalimumab)-controlled period of the phase III trial SPIRIT-P1. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **76**, 79–87 (2017).
- 36. Ritchlin, C. et al. Efficacy and safety of the anti-IL-12/23 p40 monoclonal antibody, ustekinumab, in patients with active psoriatic arthritis despite conventional non-biological and biological anti-tumour necrosis factor therapy: 6-month and 1-year results of the phase 3, multicentre, double-blind, placebocontrolled, randomised PSUMMIT 2 trial. Ann. Rheum. Dis. **73**, 990–999 (2014).
- McInnes, I. B. et al. Efficacy and safety of ustekinumab in patients with active psoriatic arthritis: 1 year results of the phase 3, multicentre, double-blind, placebocontrolled PSUMMIT 1 trial. *Lancet* 382, 780–789 (2013).
- Araujo, E. G. et al. Effects of ustekinumab versus tumor necrosis factor inhibition on enthesitis: results from the enthesial clearance in psoriatic arthritis (ECLIPSA) study. Semin. Arthritis Rheum. https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.semarthrit.2018.05.011 (2018).
- Baeten, D. et al. Risankizumab, an IL-23 inhibitor, for ankylosing spondylitis: results of a randomised, double-blind, placebo-controlled, proof-of-concept, dose-finding phase 2 study. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 77, 1295–1302 (2018).
- Poddubnyy, D., Hermann, K. G., Callhoff, J., Listing, J. & Sieper, J. Ustekinumab for the treatment of patients with active ankylosing spondylitis: results of a 28-week, prospective, open-label, proof-of-concept study (TOPAS). Ann. Rheum. Dis. **73**, 817–823 (2014).
- Walsh, N. C. et al. Osteoblast function is compromised at sites of focal bone erosion in inflammatory arthritis. *J. Bone Miner. Res.* 24, 1572–1585 (2009).
 Kocijan, R. et al. Quantitative and qualitative changes
- Kocijan, R. et al. Quantitative and qualitative changes of bone in psoriasis and psoriatic arthritis patients. *J. Bone Miner. Res.* **30**, 1775–1783 (2015).
- Devogelaer, J. P., Maldague, B., Malghem, J. & Nagant de Deuxchaisnes, C. Appendicular and vertebral bone mass in ankylosing spondylitis. A comparison of plain radiographs with single- and dual-photon absorptiometry and with quantitative computed tomography. Arthritis Rheum. 35, 1062–1067 (1992).
- Donnelly, S. et al. Bone mineral density and vertebral compression fracture rates in ankylosing spondylitis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 53, 117–121 (1994).
- Ogdie, A. et al. The risk of fracture among patients with psoriatic arthritis and psoriasis: a populationbased study. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 76, 882–885 (2017)
- Harre, U. et al. Induction of osteoclastogenesis and bone loss by human autoantibodies against citrullinated vimentin. J. Clin. Invest. **122**, 1791–1802 (2012).
- Kleyer, A. et al. Bone loss before the clinical onset of rheumatoid arthritis in subjects with anticitrullinated protein antibodies. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **73**, 854–860 (2014).
- Neerinckx, B. & Lories, R. Mechanisms, impact and prevention of pathological bone regeneration in spondyloarthritis. *Curr. Opin. Rheumatol.* 29, 287–292 (2017).
- Simon, D. et al. Analysis of periarticular bone changes in patients with cutaneous psoriasis without associated psoriatic arthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **75**, 660–666 (2016).
- Takayanagi, H. Osteoimmunology: shared mechanisms and crosstalk between the immune and bone systems. *Nat. Rev. Immunol.* 7, 292–304 (2007).
- 51. Schett, G. et al. High-sensitivity C-reactive protein and risk of nontraumatic fractures in the Bruneck study. *Arch. Intern. Med.* **166**, 2495–2501 (2006).
- 52. Gravallese, E. M. et al. Synovial tissue in rheumatoid arthritis is a source of osteoclast differentiation factor. *Arthritis Rheum.* **43**, 250–258 (2000).

- Kong, Y. Y. et al. OPGL is a key regulator of osteoclastogenesis, lymphocyte development and lymph-node organogenesis. *Nature* **397**, 315–323 (1999).
- Schett, G. Review: immune cells and mediators of inflammatory arthritis. *Autoimmunity* 41, 224–229 (2008).
- Walsh, N. C. & Gravallese, E. M. Bone loss in inflammatory arthritis: mechanisms and treatment strategies. *Curr. Opin. Rheumatol.* 16, 419–427 (2004).
- Danks, L. et al. RANKL expressed on synovial fibroblasts is primarily responsible for bone erosions during joint inflammation. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **75**, 1187–1195 (2016).
- Cohen, S. B. et al. Denosumab treatment effects on structural damage, bone mineral density, and bone turnover in rheumatoid arthritis: a twelve-month, multicenter, randomized, double-blind, placebocontrolled, phase II clinical trial. *Arthritis Rheum.* 58, 1299–1309 (2008).
- Takeuchi, T. et al. Effect of denosumab on Japanese patients with rheumatoid arthritis: a dose-response study of AMG 162 (Denosumab) in patients with rheumatold arthritis on methotrexate to validate inhibitory effect on bone erosion (DRIVE)-a 12-month, multicentre, randomised, double-blind, placebocontrolled, phase II clinical trial. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **75**, 983–990 (2016).
- Daiichi Sankyo Company. Daiichi Sankyo obtains approval for additional indication for PRALIA* subcutaneous injection 60 mg syringe. Daiichi-Sankyo https://www.daiichisankyo.com/media_investors/ media_relations/press_releases/detail/006655.html [2017].
- Takayanagi, H. et al. T cell-mediated regulation of osteoclastogenesis by signalling cross-talk between RANKL and IFN-γ. *Nature* 408, 600–605 (2000).
 Saleh, H. et al. Interleukin-33, a target of parathyroid
- Saleh, H. et al. Interleukin-33, a target of parathyroid hormone and oncostatin M, increases osteoblastic matrix mineral deposition and inhibits osteoclast formation in vitro. *Endocrinology* **152**, 1911–1922 (2011).
- Kotake, S. et al. IL-17 in synovial fluids from patients with rheumatoid arthritis is a potent stimulator of osteoclastogenesis. J. Clin. Invest. 103, 1345–1352 (1999).
- Kim, K. W., Kim, H. R., Kim, B. M., Cho, M. L. & Lee, S. H. Th17 cytokines regulate osteoclastogenesis in rheumatoid arthritis. *Am. J. Pathol.* 185, 3011–3024 (2015).
- Lee, Y. The role of interleukin-17 in bone metabolism and inflammatory skeletal diseases. *BMB Rep.* 46, 479–483 (2013).
- Sato, K. et al. Th17 functions as an osteoclastogenic helper T cell subset that links T cell activation and bone destruction. *J. Exp. Med.* 203, 2673–2682 (2006).
- Komatsu, N. et al. Pathogenic conversion of Foxp3+ T cells into T_H17 cells in autoimmune arthritis. *Nat. Med.* 20, 62–68 (2014).
- Pollinger, B. et al. Th17 cells, not IL-17⁺ γδT cells, drive arthritic bone destruction in mice and humans. *J. Immunol.* **186**, 2602–2612 (2011).
- Yago, T. et al. IL-17 induces osteoclastogenesis from human monocytes alone in the absence of osteoblasts, which is potently inhibited by anti-TNF-α antibody: a novel mechanism of osteoclastogenesis by IL-17. *J. Cell. Biochem.* **108**, 947–955 (2009).
- Adamopoulos, I. E. et al. Interleukin-17A upregulates receptor activator of NF-κB on osteoclast precursors. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* 12, R29 (2010).
- Katz, Y., Nadiv, O. & Beer, Y. Interleukin-17 enhances tumor necrosis factor alpha-induced synthesis of interleukins 1,6, and 8 in skin and synovial fibroblasts: a possible role as a "fine-tuning cytokine" in inflammation processes. *Arthritis Rheum.* 44, 2176–2184 (2001).
- Jovanovic, D. V. et al. IL-17 stimulates the production and expression of proinflammatory cytokines, IL-β and TNF-α, by human macrophages. J. Immunol. 160, 3513–3521 (1998).
- van der Heijde, D. et al. Brief report: Secukinumab provides significant and sustained inhibition of joint structural damage in a phase III study of active psoriatic arthritis. Arthritis Rheumatol. 68, 1914–1921 (2016).
- Huang, H. et al. IL-17 stimulates the proliferation and differentiation of human mesenchymal stem cells: implications for bone remodeling. *Cell Death Differ.* 16, 1332–1343 (2009).
- Osta, B., Lavocat, F., Eljaafari, A. & Miossec, P. Effects of interleukin-17A on osteogenic differentiation of isolated

human mesenchymal stem cells. *Front. Immunol.* **5**, 425 (2014).

- Goswami, J., Hernandez-Santos, N., Zuniga, L. A. & Gaffen, S. L. A bone-protective role for IL-17 receptor signaling in ovariectomy-induced bone loss. *Eur. J. Immunol.* **39**, 2831–2839 (2009).
- J. Immunol. 39, 2831–2839 (2009).
 DeSelm, C. J. et al. IL-17 mediates estrogen-deficient osteoporosis in an Act1-dependent manner. J. Cell. Biochem. 113, 2895–2902 (2012).
- Uluckan, O. et al. Chronic skin inflammation leads to bone loss by IL-17-mediated inhibition of Wnt signaling in osteoblasts. *Sci. Transl Med.* 8, 330ra37 (2016).
- Shaw, A. T., Maeda, Y. & Gravallese, E. M. IL-17A deficiency promotes periosteal bone formation in a model of inflammatory arthritis. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* 18, 104–113 (2016).
- Kim, Y. G. et al. IL-17 inhibits osteoblast differentiation and bone regeneration in rat. *Arch. Oral Biol.* 59, 897–905 (2014).
- Ono, T. et al. IL-17-producing γδ T cells enhance bone regeneration. *Nat. Commun.* 7, 10928 (2016).
 Nam, D. et al. T-Lymphocytes enable osteoblast
- Nam, D. et al. FLymphocytes enable osteoblast maturation via IL-17F during the early phase of fracture repair. *PLoS ONE* 7, e40044 (2012).
- Croes, M. et al. Proinflammatory T cells and IL-17 stimulate osteoblast differentiation. *Bone* 84, 262–270 (2016).
- Yago, T. et al. IL-23 induces human osteoclastogenesis via IL-17 in vitro, and anti-IL-23 antibody attenuates collagen-induced arthritis in rats. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* 9, R96 (2007).
- Ju, J. H. et al. IL-23 induces receptor activator of NF-κB ligand expression on CD4⁺ T cells and promotes osteoclastogenesis in an autoimmune arthritis model. *J. Immunol.* **181**, 1507–1518 (2008).
- Li, X. et al. IL-23 induces receptor activator of NF-κB ligand expression in fibroblast-like synoviocytes via STAT3 and NF-κB signal pathways. *Immunol. Lett.* 127, 100–107 (2010).
- Chen, L., Wei, X. Q., Evans, B., Jiang, W. & Aeschlimann, D. IL-23 promotes osteoclast formation by up-regulation of receptor activator of NF-xB (RANK) expression in myeloid precursor cells. *Eur. J. Immunol.* 38, 2845–2854 (2008).
- Shin, H. S. et al. Crosstalk among IL-23 and DNAX activating protein of 12 kDa-dependent pathways promotes osteoclastogenesis. *J. Immunol.* **194**, 316–324 (2015).
- Kamiya, S. et al. Effects of IL-23 and IL-27 on osteoblasts and osteoclasts: inhibitory effects on osteoclast differentiation. *J. Bone Miner. Metab.* 25, 277–285 (2007).

- Quinn, J. M. et al. IL-23 inhibits osteoclastogenesis indirectly through lymphocytes and is required for the maintenance of bone mass in mice. *J. Immunol.* 181, 5720–5729 (2008).
- Adamopoulos, I. E. et al. IL-23 is critical for induction of arthritis, osteoclast formation, and maintenance of bone mass. *J. Immunol.* **187**, 951–959 (2011).
- Kavanaugh, A. et al. Ustekinumab, an anti-IL-12/23 p40 monoclonal antibody, inhibits radiographic progression in patients with active psoriatic arthritis: results of an integrated analysis of radiographic data from the phase 3, multicentre, randomised, doubleblind, placebo-controlled PSUMMIT-1 and PSUMMIT-2 trials. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **73**, 1000–1006 (2014).
- Pfeifle, R. et al. Regulation of autoantibody activity by the IL-23-T_H17 axis determines the onset of autoimmune disease. *Nat. Immunol.* 18, 104–113 (2017).
- Harre, U. et al. Glycosylation of immunoglobulin G determines osteoclast differentiation and bone loss. *Nat. Commun.* 6, 6651 (2015).
- Zhang, J. R. et al. Different modulatory effects of IL-17, IL-22, and IL-23 on osteoblast differentiation. *Mediators Inflamm.* 2017, 5950395 (2017).
- Reinhardt, A. & Prinz, I. Whodunit? The contribution of interleukin (IL)-17/IL-22- producing vδ T cells, ad cells T cells, and innate lymphoid cells to the pathogenesis of spondyloarthritis. *Front. Immunol.* 9, 885 (2018).
- Karczewski, J., Dobrowolska, A., Rychlewska-Hanczewska, A. & Adamski, Z. New insights into the role of T cells in pathogenesis of psoriasis and psoriatic arthritis. *Autoimmunity* 49, 435–450 (2016).
 Mitra, A., Raychaudhuri, S. K. & Raychaudhuri, S. P.
- Mitra, A., Raychaudhuri, S. K. & Raychaudhuri, S. P. Functional role of IL-22 in psoriatic arthritis. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* 14, R65 (2012).
- Yang, L. et al. Augmented Th17 differentiation leads to cutaneous and synovio-entheseal inflammation in a novel model of psoriatic arthritis. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* 70, 855–867 (2018).
- Kim, K. W. et al. Interleukin-22 promotes osteoclastogenesis in rheumatoid arthritis through induction of RANKL in human synovial fibroblasts. *Arthritis Rheum.* 64, 1015–1023 (2012).
 El-Zayadi, A. A. et al. Interleukin-22 drives the
- 100. El-Zayadi, A. A. et al. Interleukin-22 drives the proliferation, migration and osteogenic differentiation of mesenchymal stem cells: a novel cytokine that could contribute to new bone formation in spondyloarthropathies. *Rheumatology* 56, 488–493 (2017).
- 101. McGonagle, D., Lories, R. J., Tan, A. L. & Benjamin, M. The concept of a "synovio-entheseal complex" and its implications for understanding joint inflammation and damage in psoriatic arthritis and beyond. *Arthritis Rheum.* 56, 2482–2491 (2007).

- Lisowska, B., Kosson, D. & Domaracka, K. Lights and shadows of NSAIDs in bone healing: the role of prostaglandins in bone metabolism. *Drug Des. Devel. Ther.* **12**, 1753–1758 (2018).
- 103. Wang, Z. et al. The positive effects of secreting cytokines IL-17 and IFN-γ on the early-stage differentiation and negative effects on the calcification of primary osteoblasts in vitro. *Int. Immunopharmacol.* 57, 1–10 (2018).
- Baeten, D. et al. Secukinumab, an interleukin-17A inhibitor, in ankylosing spondylitis. *N. Engl. J. Med.* 373, 2534–2548 (2015).
- Braun, J. et al. Effect of secukinumab on clinical and radiographic outcomes in ankylosing spondylitis: 2-year results from the randomised phase III MEASURE 1 study. Ann. Rheum. Dis. **76**, 1070–1077 (2017).
- 106. Landewe, R., Dougados, M., Mielants, H., van der Tempel, H. & van der Heijde, D. Physical function in ankylosing spondylitis is independently determined by both disease activity and radiographic damage of the spine. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **68**, 863–867 (2009).
- 107. Kampylafka, E. Resolution of synovitis and arrest of catabolic and anabolic bone changes in patients with psoriaric arthritis by IL-17 blockade with secukinumab; results from the prospective PSARTROS study. Arthritis Res. Ther. 20, 153 (2018).

Acknowledgements

The authors thank S. Williams for editorial assistance. The work of E.M.G. was partially supported by the Timothy and Elaine Peterson Research Fund (UMMS; P60037138450000). The work of G.S. was partially supported by the German Research Council (DFG; CRC1181).

Author contributions

Both authors researched the data for the article, provided substantial contributions to discussions of its content, wrote the article and reviewed and/or edited the manuscript before submission.

Competing interests

E.M.G. declares that she has received research funding from AbbVie and Eli Lilly. G.S. declares no competing interests.

Publisher's note

Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Reviewer information

Nature Reviews Rheumatology thanks A. Deodhar, E. Lubberts and the other anonymous reviewer(s) for their contribution to the peer review of this work.

Hand osteoarthritis: clinical phenotypes, molecular mechanisms and disease management

Michelle Marshall¹, Fiona E. Watt², Tonia L. Vincent² and Krysia Dziedzic¹*

Abstract | Osteoarthritis (OA) is a highly prevalent condition, and the hand is the most commonly affected site. Patients with hand OA frequently report symptoms of pain, functional limitations and frustration in undertaking everyday activities. The condition presents clinically with changes to the bone, ligaments, cartilage and synovial tissue, which can be observed using radiography, ultrasonography or MRI. Hand OA is a heterogeneous disorder and is considered to be multifactorial in aetiology. This Review provides an overview of the epidemiology, presentation and burden of hand OA, including an update on hand OA imaging (including the development of novel techniques), disease mechanisms and management. In particular, areas for which new evidence has substantially changed the way we understand, consider and treat hand OA are highlighted. For example, genetic studies, clinical trials and careful prospective imaging studies from the past 5 years are beginning to provide insights into the pathogenesis of hand OA that might uncover new therapeutic targets in the disease.

Osteoarthritis (OA) is one of the leading causes of disability worldwide¹. With the average age of the general population increasing, the impact of OA and joint pain is set to rise². Disabling hand pain is a common complaint, affecting ~12% of individuals aged over 50 years in the UK general population³. For many of these individuals, this symptom can be ascribed to hand OA, which is the most common form of OA. Hand OA is a heterogeneous condition, often involving multiple joints⁴, and can have distinct (but sometimes overlapping) patterns of joint involvement: for example, OA of the interphalangeal joints (IPJs) and/or the first carpometacarpal joint (CMCJ)⁵.

A gap exists between guidelines for the management of hand OA and current standards of treatment⁶. Health-care inititatives such as JIGSAW-E (Joint Implementation of Guidelines for Osteoarthritis in Western Europe; funded by EIT-Health) aim to close the evidence–practice gap for OA⁷ by implementing international guidelines and quality standards^{8,9}. A common misconception is that OA of the hands affects the quality of life of individuals less than OA of the lower limbs, and many patients are encouraged to believe that hand OA is an inevitable result of ageing and that nothing can be done to improve the disease symptoms¹⁰. These unfounded assumptions make prioritizing health care for hand OA a challenge.

In this Review, we provide an overview of the epidemiology, presentation and burden of hand OA and present areas where in the past 5 years new evidence has substantially changed the way we understand, consider and treat hand OA. We include updates on the imaging of hand OA and the development of novel imaging techniques, and advances in knowledge of disease mechanisms and the management of hand OA.

Epidemiology Definitions of hand OA

Hand OA can be defined in a number of ways: by the ACR clinical criteria¹¹; by structural changes determined by imaging (most frequently using plain radiography; so-called radiographic hand OA); and by radiographic changes accompanied by the presence of typical symptoms (pain, aching or stiffness; referred to as symptomatic hand OA). For the latter two categories, a range of different definitions, particularly radiographic definitions¹², has been used in the study of hand OA (BOX 1).

Radiographically, hand OA is characterized, as with other forms of OA, by joint space narrowing (JSN), osteophyte formation (which, for any joint, is pathognomonic of radiographic OA), subchondral sclerosis and subchondral cyst formation. Researchers have attempted to improve the detection of early disease features (including features that might not be evident by plain radiograph) by using MRI or ultrasonography; however, these techniques have not found a place in the diagnosis of hand OA in the clinic to date¹³.

¹Research Institute for Primary Care and Health Sciences, Arthritis Research UK Primary Care Centre, David Weatherall Building, Keele University, Keele, UK.

²Arthritis Research UK Centre for Osteoarthritis Pathogenesis, Kennedy Institute of Rheumatology, University of Oxford, Nuffield Department of Orthopaedics, Rheumatology and Musculoskeletal Sciences (NDORMS), Oxford, UK.

**e-mail: k.s.dziedzic@ keele.ac.uk* https://doi.org/10.1038/ s41584-018-0095-4

Key points

- Hand osteoarthritis (OA) is highly prevalent, and individuals with this condition frequently report symptoms of pain, functional limitations and frustration in undertaking everyday activities.
- Clinical imaging is not recommended for the diagnosis or routine monitoring of patients with hand OA unless an alternative diagnosis is suspected.
- MRI and ultrasonography findings have provided insight into hand OA pathology, but further prospective studies are required to inform on how features of the disease change over time.
- Hand OA is multifactorial in aetiology with evidence for the involvement of abnormal mechanical loading and hereditary factors, whereas the contribution of inflammation to pathogenesis remains contentious.
- Recommendations for core treatments in the management of hand OA should be integrated into clinical practice to improve the quality of care for patients.
- A greater understanding of the presentation, pathogenesis and disease course is needed to help provide targeted therapy with existing and new treatments.

Prevalence

Hand OA is a highly prevalent condition with a wellrecognized female preponderance that is particularly notable in patients with severe symptomatic disease presenting to secondary care^{14,15}. Estimates of the prevalence of hand OA vary depending on the definition of hand OA used, as well as by the age, sex and geographical area of the population studied, and can also be influenced by genetic factors, occupation and diet. Of the various hand OA definitions, radiographic hand OA is associated with the highest prevalence, ranging from 21% in a US population to 92% in a Japanese population¹⁶⁻¹⁸. By contrast, the prevalence of symptomatic hand OA is much lower than radiographic hand OA, ranging from 3% in Iranian and Chinese populations to 16% in a US population¹⁹⁻²¹. Prevalence estimates for hand OA are generally higher than those reported for hip and knee OA (hip OA: radiographic 1.0-45.0% and symptomatic 0.9-7.4%; knee OA: radiographic 7.1-70.8% and symptomatic 5.4-24.2%)¹⁶. The prevalence of hand OA is also higher in some groups of individuals, such as in patients with an HIV-1 infection, than in the general population²².

Incidence and progression

The distinction between incidence (occurrence of the disease) and progression (development towards a more advanced stage of the disease) of hand OA is somewhat arbitrary and depends on the case definition of the disease used. With this caveat in mind, in one study of a US population, the lifetime risk of developing symptomatic hand OA in at least one hand by the age of 85 years was estimated at 40%, with 47% of women and 25% of men developing the disease in this population²³. The annual incidence of hand OA varies between 0.2% and 4.7% for radiographic hand OA and between 0.1% and 1.1% for symptomatic hand OA irrespective of age, sex and geographical location²⁴⁻²⁶ (TABLE 1). The incidence of hand OA peaks at the age of 50 in women and greatly exceeds the incidence measured for men at that age²⁷. Progression of hand OA is usually slow, and only few hand joints exhibit changes in each patient²⁵. The rates of radiographic progression vary from 3.2% to

23.5% per year depending on the population studied, the grading scale used and whether the definition of progression also incorporates incident OA (that is, new-onset OA)^{24,28} (TABLE 2).

Disease presentation and burden *Signs and symptoms*

OA is considered a condition of the whole joint, rather than just the articular cartilage, and signs and symptoms can arise from the cartilage, underlying bone, synovium, muscles, tendons and ligaments (or the sites of ligament insertion into the bone)^{29,30}. Symptoms commonly include pain, stiffness and limitation or restriction of movement such as a decrease of grip and/or pinch strength. Signs of hand OA include 'nodes' of the affected IPJs (firm swellings over the superolateral and dorsal aspects of the distal interphalangeal joints (DIPJs) and proximal interphalangeal joints (PIPJs), known as Heberden and Bouchard nodes, respectively) and deformities such as squaring of the thumb base (FIG. 1). Inflammation can produce redness, warmth, effusion and/or soft tissue swelling.

Individuals with hand OA can be divided into different subgroups depending on the joints in the hands that are affected; these subgroups consist of nodal OA, first CMCJ OA and another presentation called erosive hand OA, in which the subchondral bone is affected by central erosions. First CMCJ OA is thought to occur most frequently, followed by nodal IPJ OA, a non-nodal form of IPJ OA and erosive hand OA⁵. However, apart from first CMCJ OA, which frequently occurs in isolation, there is considerable overlap in presentations among these subgroups, suggesting shared aetiologies⁵.

First CMCI OA. Patients with first CMCI OA have increased pain sensitivity, a reduced range of motion in thumb abduction and a decreased combined thumb abduction and index finger extension strength compared with healthy individuals³¹. Notable associations between self-reported pain and function have been reported for these patients. Furthermore, compared with healthy individuals, patients with this condition have reduced grip and pinch strength³², including a decrease in cylindrical grasp and key pinch strength that can begin in the early stages of disease^{33,34}. Some of these presentations might be due to changes in the structure and composition of the joint and changes in the innervation of the dorsal radial ligament, which has an important proprioceptive and stabilizing role for the thumb base³⁵. In individuals with symptomatic first CMCJ OA, the presence of both ligament ruptures and dorsal subluxation is a common finding on MRI^{36,37}. The grind test (where the examiner exerts pressure while rotating the joint to test whether pain or crepitus are elicited) has frequently been used to determine the presence of first CMCJ OA³⁸. However, in a 2014 study, the traction-shift (subluxation-relocation) test (where the examiner provokes subluxation and relocation of the joint passively to test whether pain is elicited) had higher sensitivity, specificity and positive and negative predictive values for first CMCJ OA than the grind test³⁹.

Box 1 | Commonly used definitions of hand OA by category

Clinical

- ACR hand osteoarthritis (OA) criteria¹¹: hand pain, aching or stiffness and three of the following four criteria:
- Hard tissue enlargement of two or more of ten selected joints^a
- Hard tissue enlargement of two or more distal interphalangeal joints (DIPJs)
- Fewer than three swollen metacarpophalangeal joints (MCPJs)
- Deformity of at least one of ten selected joints^a
- (As used in REFS^{55,75,211-213})

Radiographic

- Kellgren–Lawrence^{214,215} grade 2 or greater in at least one hand joint (as used in REFS^{21,22,26,75,216-221})
- Kellgren–Lawrence grade 2 or greater in at least two hand joints (as used in REFS^{135,222})
- Kellgren–Lawrence grade 2 or greater in two of three groups of hand joints (DIPJs, proximal interphalangeal joints (PIPJs), the first carpometacarpal joint (CMCJ) and/or the scaphotrapezial joint (STJ)) (as used in REFS²²³⁻²²⁵)
- Altman atlas score⁴⁴ of 1 or more for osteophytes or joint space narrowing in one or more hand joints (as used in REFS²²⁶⁻²²⁶)

Symptomatic

- Hand pain, aching or stiffness and the presence of at least one hand joint with a Kellgren–Lawrence grade 2 or greater (as used in REFS^{20,21,22})
- Hand pain, aching or stiffness and the presence of Kellgren–Lawrence grade 2 or greater in the same joint, with at least one hand joint affected (as used in REF.²⁶)
- Hand joint symptoms and the presence of at least one hand joint with radiographic OA in the same hand (as used in REF.²³)





Nodal OA. Nodes are the hallmark of nodal OA and most frequently affect the DIPJs (Heberden nodes), followed by the thumb IPJs and the PIPJs (Bouchard nodes). The pattern of joints affected by nodes is similar to the pattern of joints affected by radiographic features⁴⁰, but although the presence of nodes is associated with underlying radiographic OA, IPJ OA can present with tenderness and bony enlargement without nodal involvement⁴¹. Nodal OA occurs more often in women than in men and occurs most often in the dominant hand, suggesting the involvement of mechanical and hormonal factors⁴⁰. Patients with nodal OA frequently have synovitis, osteophytes, cartilage loss and central and marginal erosions⁴²; aesthetic discomfort is also common⁴³. A strong positive association between the presence of nodes and radiographic OA (in particular, the occurrence of JSN) supports the notion that a clinical observation of nodes can be taken as an indication of hand OA without the need for radiographic assessment⁴⁰.

Erosive hand OA. The predominant features of erosive hand OA are central erosions and collapse of the subchondral bone. The term erosive OA is arguably a misnomer, as central erosions are evident in many patients to some degree depending on the imaging modality used44,45; hence, this condition probably represents an extreme phenotype of these changes. Although erosive hand OA is commonly considered a separate disease, increasing evidence suggest that this condition is a severe form of hand OA^{42,46,47}. Erosive hand OA can affect the first CMCI as well as the IPIs, but patients rarely have erosive OA of both the first CMCJ and the IPJs (most patients have central erosions exclusively in one or the other)48. Erosive OA of the IPJ occurs predominantly in women, whereas erosive OA of the first CMCJ occurs more often in men than in women⁴⁸. Erosive hand OA has a higher clinical burden than non-erosive forms of hand OA, and the associated disability might be as severe as that associated with rheumatoid arthritis (RA), depending on the setting^{49,50}.

Inflammatory changes, including synovitis and tenosynovitis (determined clinically as soft tissue swelling and by ultrasonography) and effusions and central and marginal erosions (determined by MRI), are frequently observed in patients with either erosive hand OA or nodal OA⁴². The frequency and patterns of joints affected by erosive disease and severe non-erosive forms of hand OA are similar^{46,47}. However, progression of synovitis, joint effusion and radiographic OA occurs more frequently in patients with erosive hand OA than in patients with non-erosive forms of hand OA (independently of the amount of synovitis and radiographic structural damage present at baseline)^{51,52}. Furthermore, the findings of a 2016 study indicated that patients with erosive hand OA had a higher level of inflammation (including a higher power Doppler activity, which is an indicator of the level of vascularization) than patients with non-erosive hand OA, suggesting that the inflammatory phenotype differs in erosive and non-erosive forms of hand OA⁵². This concept requires further investigation.

Individual and societal burden

The presence of hand OA frequently affects the ability of an individual to undertake everyday activities^{53,54}. Symptomatic hand OA is associated with poor self-reported general health, although the strength of this association varies by country and is often partially mediated by impaired physical hand function⁵⁵. In a number of studies, the presence of hand OA and pain related to hand OA has been associated with atherosclerosis and cardiovascular disease^{56–60}. This association is analogous to the increased cardiovascular mortality observed in patients with painful OA of the large joints compared with the general population⁶¹; this increased

Table 1 Reported inciden	lable 1 Reported incidence rates for hand osteoarthritis						
Study	Population	n	Incidence	Follow-up time period	Annual incidence		
Radiographic hand osteoar	thritis						
Haugen et al. (2017) ²⁵	OAI (study cohort), USA	407	18.9%	4 years	4.7%		
Haugen et al. (2011) ²¹	Framingham, USA	810	• Women: 34.6% • Men: 33.7%	Median 8.7 (IQR 7.9–9.5) years	• Women: 4.0% • Men: 3.9%		
Paradowski et al. (2010) ²⁴⁴	Lund, Sweden	97	14.4%	Mean 9.6 (SD 0.4) years	1.5%		
Chaisson et al. (1997) ²²¹	Framingham, USA	458	• Overall: 83% • Women: 87% • Men: 76%	24 years	• Overall: 3.5% • Women: 3.6% • Men: 3.2%		
Bagge et al. (1992) ²⁴⁵	Goteborg, Sweden	74	• DIPJ: 13.6% • PIPJ: 13.6% • First CMCJ: 4.9%	4 years	• DIPJ: 3.4% • PIPJ: 3.4% • First CMCJ: 1.2%		
Kallman et al. (1990) ²⁴	BLSA (study cohort), USA	84	 Individuals aged <40 years: 56/1,000 person-years Individuals aged 40–59 years: 69/1,000 person-years Individuals aged ≥60 years: 106/1,000 person-years 	 Age < 60: mean 23.5 (SEM±0.25) years Age ≥ 60: mean 16.9 (SEM±0.45) 	 Individuals aged ≤40 years: 0.2% Individuals aged 40–59 years: 0.3% Individuals aged ≥60 years: 0.6% 		
Plato et al. (1979) ²⁴⁶	BLSA (study cohort), USA	65	47.7%	Mean 13.45 (range 12.00–16.00) years	3.5%		
Symptomatic hand osteoar	thritis						
Haugen et al. (2011) ²¹	Framingham, USA	810	• Women: 9.7% • Men: 4.0%	Median 8.7 (IQR 7.9–9.5) years	• Women: 1.1% • Men: 0.5%		
Oliveria et al. (1995) ²⁶	Massachusetts, USA	~130,000	100/100,000 person-years	1 year	0.1%		
Clinical diagnosis of hand o	osteoarthritisª						
Yu et al. (2015) ²⁴⁷	CIPCA (database), UK	94,955	1.3%	1 year	1.3%		
Prieto-Alhambra et al. (2014) ²⁷	SIDIAP (database), Spain	3,266,826	2.4/1,000 person-years	Median 4.45 (IQR 4.19–4.98) years	0.1%		

----.

BLSA, Baltimore Longitudinal Study of Aging; CIPCA, Consultations in Primary Care Archive; CMCJ, carpometacarpal joint; DIPJ, distal interphalangeal joint; IQR, interquartile range; OAI, Osteoarthritis Initiative; PIPJ, proximal interphalangeal joint; SD, standard deviation; SEM, standard error of the mean; SIDIAP, Sistema d'Informació per al Desenvolupament de la Investigació en Atenció Primària. ^aConsultation rate for clinical diagnosis.

> mortality is assumed to be caused by decreased load-bearing exercises, but the association with hand OA suggests the involvement of other factors. Conversely, some data from the past 3 years would indicate that individuals with hand OA have a similar risk of all-cause and cardiovascular disease-specific mortality to the general population^{61,62}.

> Patients with hand OA are frequently dissatisfied with the appearance of their hands, especially patients with Heberden and Bouchard nodes, joint deformity and/or erosive hand OA43. Aesthetic dissatisfaction has negative effects on the patient symptoms, including increasing the level of pain and stiffness and decreasing the function of the hand; aesthetic dissatisfaction is also associated with depression, anxiety and negative perceptions by the patients about their illness^{43,63,64}. Patients with hand OA can have a distorted mental representation of pain in the hand, and normalization of this distortion by multisensory illusions might offer pain relief55.

> Although much is known about the economic burden of hand OA in terms of the direct costs of some treatments, less is known about the indirect costs of this condition such as loss of productivity⁶⁶⁻⁶⁸. For example, in one study, arthroplasty surgery for first CMCJ OA often

resulted in substantial time off work69. Further research is required in this area.

Imaging

Radiography

For decades, radiography has been used to determine the presence and severity of hand OA and to examine disease progression in both clinical and research settings, including in randomized controlled trials (RCTs)^{70,71}. This technology is widely available, inexpensive and is an acceptable procedure to patients. However, the inability to view non-bony structures (such as the joint capsule, synovium, ligaments and tendons and their entheseal attachment to the bone) using radiography and the insensitivity of this technique in detecting structural pathology limit its utility in both settings compared with other imaging modalities. For these reasons, and as hand OA can often be reliably diagnosed on the basis of clinical presentations, EULAR and the National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE) do not recommend imaging for the routine diagnosis of hand OA^{8,72}, although imaging might be useful in excluding other conditions^{72,73}. Routine imaging is not recommended for clinical monitoring unless there is an unexpected and

Table 2 | Reported progression rates for hand osteoarthritis

Study	Population	n	Progression	Follow-up time period	Annual progression rate	
Radiographic definition (w	vith incorporatio	n of incidence ra	te)			
Haugen et al. (2017) ²⁵	OAI (study cohort), USA	994	59.4%	4 years	14.9%	
Haugen et al. (2017) ⁷⁶	Oslo, Norway	69	62.3%	Mean 4.7 (SD 0.4) years	13.3%	
Bijsterbosch et al. (2014) ²⁴⁸ and Bijsterbosch et al. (2011) ²⁴⁹	GARP (study cohort), Netherlands	236	• Overall: 52.5% • Osteophyte progression: 44.9% • JSN progression: 25.8%	Mean 6.1 (range 5.0–7.8) years	 Overall: 8.6% Osteophyte progression: 7.4% JSN progression: 4.2% 	
Bijsterbosch et al. (2013) ¹³¹	GARP (study cohort), Netherlands	161	• Overall: 60% • Osteophyte progression: 53% • JSN progression: 32%	6 years	 Overall: 10.0% Osteophyte progression: 8.8% JSN progression: 5.3% 	
Bijsterbosch et al. (2013) ¹³¹	GARP (study cohort), Netherlands	128	• Overall: 39% • Osteophyte progression: 24% • JSN progression: 29%	2 years	 Overall: 19.5% Osteophyte progression: 12.0% JSN progression: 14.5% 	
Paradowski et al. $(2013)^{250}$ and Paradowski et al. $(2010)^{244}$	Lund, Sweden	118	59.3%	Mean 9.6 (SD 0.4) years	6.2%	
Yusuf et al. (2011) ²⁵¹	GARP (study cohort), Netherlands	164	33.5%	Mean 6.0 (SD 0.6)	5.6%	
Botha-Scheepers et al. (2009) ²⁵²	GARP (study cohort), Netherlands	172	 Osteophyte progression: 21.5% JSN progression: 19.2% 	2 years	 Osteophyte progression: 10.8% JSN progression: 9.6% 	
Botha-Scheepers et al. (2007) ²⁸	GARP (study cohort), Netherlands	184	 Osteophyte progression: 47% (probands) and 42% (siblings) JSN progression: 34% (probands) and 37% (siblings) 	2 years	 Osteophyte progression: 23.5% (probands) and 21.0% (siblings) JSN progression: 17.0% (probands) and 18.5% (siblings) 	
Cvijetić et al. (2004) ²⁵³	Croatia	186	 DIPJs: 59.9% (women) and 54.5% (men) PIPJs: 34.9% (women) and 33.7% (men) First CMCJ: 41.2% (women) and 49.9% (men) 	10 years	 DIPJs: 6.0% (women) and 5.5% (men) PIPJs: 3.5% (women) and 3.4% (men) First CMCJ: 4.1% (women) and 5.0% (men) 	
Kallman et al. (1990) ²⁴	BLSA (study cohort), USA	177	 Individuals aged <40 years: 50% Individuals aged 40–59 years: 50% Individuals aged ≥60 years: 50% 	 Individuals aged <40 years: 15.8 years Individuals aged 40–59 years: 12.4 years Individuals aged ≥60 years: 8.9 years 	 Individuals aged 40 years: 3.2% Individuals aged 40–59 years: 4.0% Individuals aged ≥60 years: 5.6% 	
Radiographic definition (without incorporation of incidence rate)						
Haugen et al. (2011) ²¹	Framingham, USA	464	• Women: 96.4% • Men: 91.4%	Median 8.7 (IQR 7.9–9.5) years	• Women: 11.1% • Men: 10.5%	
Güler-Yüksel et al. (2011) ²²²	GARP (study cohort), Netherlands	181	31.7%	2 years	15.9%	
Hassett et al. (2006) ²⁵⁴	Chingford, UK	 Osteophytes: 222 JSN: 308 	 Osteophyte progression: 72.5% JSN progression: 64.0% 	11 years	 Osteophyte progression: 6.6% JSN progression: 5.8% 	
Plato et al. (1979) ²⁴⁶	BLSA (study cohort), USA	29	72.4%	Mean 13.45 (range 12.00–16.00) years	5.4%	
MRI-based definition (with	incorporation o	f incidence rate)				
Haugen et al. (2017) ⁷⁶	Oslo, Norway	69	58.0%	Mean 4.7 (SD 0.4) years	12.3%	

BLSA, Baltimore Longitudinal Study of Aging; CMCJ, carpometacarpal joint; DIPJ, distal interphalangeal joint; GARP, Genetics, Arthrosis and Progression; IQR, interquartile range; JSN, joint space narrowing; OAI, Osteoarthritis Initiative; PIPJ, proximal interphalangeal joint; SD, standard deviation.



Fig. 1 | **Features of hand osteoarthritis.** A photographic image of an individual's hand showing squaring of the thumb base and bony enlargement, nodes and deformity of the interphalangeal joints and the corresponding radiograph displaying osteophytes, joint space narrowing (JSN) and subchondral sclerosis at the thumb base and interphalangeal joints are provided.

rapid change in symptoms or clinical characteristics that suggest an alternative diagnosis such as RA or psoriatic arthritis (PsA⁷².)

Radiography still has a place in the research setting; however, which scoring methods to use are still debated and might depend on the objective of the study and the population studied (for example, patients with erosive versus patients with non-erosive forms of hand OA)^{74,75}. Although radiography might have a low sensitivity in detecting features in early disease, the ability of this technique to detect hand OA progression over 5 years is similar to that of 1.0 Tesla MRI, although these imaging modalities do not always detect progression in the same joints⁷⁶. Given that the cost of radiography is lower than that of MRI, radiography is the suggested imaging modality of choice in observational studies with a long follow-up period⁷⁶.

Advances in ultrasonography and MRI

In the past 10 years, the use of ultrasonography and MRI for assessing patients with hand OA has increased, providing greater insight into the pathology of the disease and increased evidence that these imaging modalities have a higher sensitivity than radiography in determining the presence of pathological features such as osteophytes, JSN and central erosions^{47,77–81}. Using ultrasonography and MRI, researchers have shown that inflammatory changes in the synovium and at the enthesis of the hands are a common finding in hand OA^{30,82,83}. Bone marrow lesions (BMLs) are also detectable in the hands by MRI (consistent with other joints affected by OA)^{30,84}.

Ultrasonography enables real-time multiplanar imaging at a relatively low cost. With this approach, inflammatory and structural changes can be observed without the use of ionizing radiation or the need for a contrast agent; however, this technique is operator-dependent, and bony structures such as cysts and BMLs cannot be detected. Several ultrasonography scoring systems for hand OA have been developed for grading pathological features as well as for use in research studies^{80,85,86}. On the basis of inter-observer and inter-reliability scores, the Outcome Measures in Rheumatology (OMERACT) group has endorsed the scoring of osteophytes using the Mathiessen atlas^{13,80}. However, although ultrasonography is reliable for determining healthy cartilage or a total loss of cartilage, the use of the ultrasonographic atlas for grading the severity of cartilage pathology is not supported¹³. Ultrasonography findings have good concordance with MRI findings^{42,87}, but the associations between ultrasonography findings and symptoms have differed across various studies^{36,82,83,88,89}

Although MRI is more expensive and takes a longer time to scan patients than other imaging modalities, this imaging modality is important in OA research (including in clinical trials), as it enables the visualization of all joint structures through different pulse sequences in multiple planes⁹⁰. The Oslo hand OA MRI scoring system includes assessments of osteophytes, JSN, central erosions, cysts, BMLs, malalignment, collateral ligament pathology, synovitis and flexor tenosynovitis in the DIPJs and PIPJs⁹¹. This scoring system has good intra-rater and inter-rater reliability, has good construct validity (in relation to joint tenderness) and has higher sensitivity in determining the presence of osteophytes and erosions than radiography, CT or ultrasonography; however, this approach is time consuming because of the number of features and sites that require examination^{81,91-93}. In patients with erosive hand OA, the presence of synovitis and BMLs has been assessed by the Oslo hand OA MRI scoring system, and has shown good intra-rater and inter-rater reliability and is associated with clinical symptoms, demonstrating good construct validity94.

The Oslo hand OA MRI scoring system has been refined, and the updated version, referred to as the HOAMRIS scoring system, includes measurements of the volume and extent of damage to the joint surface (to enable an improved assessment of central erosions compared with the Oslo hand MRI scoring system), excludes the assessment of collateral ligament pathology and flexor tenosynovitis and combines the assessments of the proximal and the distal joint surfaces (which were graded separately for the Oslo scoring system) for grading central erosions, cysts and BMLs95. The HOAMRIS scoring system has good inter-reader reliability for cross-sectional readings but has lower longitudinal reliability, which is thought to be because of the small range of change scores for many of the features. The responsiveness of this scoring system to change (as assessed by the standardized response means) at the patient level (that is, the sum scores for all DIPJs and PIPJs) is good for all assessed features, except for cysts and BMLs96.

A number of imaging features are associated with disease progression. For example, incident synovitis and BMLs determined on MRI are associated with incident joint tenderness after 5 years⁹⁷. Baseline MRI-defined

synovitis, BMLs and JSN predict radiographic progression in hand OA over 2 and 5 years^{98,99}. Baseline and persistent ultrasonography features including synovitis, joint effusion and power Doppler ultrasonographic activity in hand joints are associated with radiographic progression in the same joints after 2 and 5 years^{100,101}.

Researchers have used ultrasonography to measure the treatment response of individuals with hand OA after intramuscular and intra-articular injections of steroid or other agents^{36,102,103}. However, understanding how inflammatory features in individual hand joints change over time is important to determine whether ultrasonography is a valid measure of assessing response to treatment. In a longitudinal study of patients with hand OA, inflammatory features that included synovial thickening, effusion or a power Doppler ultrasonography signal were consistently present in most patients over a 3-month period; however, in individual joints, the inflammatory features changed over time, with persistent inflammatory features found in only 19% of the hand joints¹⁰⁴. Further investigation in other study populations and over different time periods is recommended before ultrasonography is used as the primary outcome measure in assessing treatment response in individuals' hand joints.

Developments in CT

CT enables more detailed visualization of the bone structures than radiography, MRI or ultrasonography (although this approach requires a high dose of ionizing radiation); hence, in the past few years, this technology has been used for research purposes in hand OA. By using high-resolution peripheral quantitative CT (HR-pQCT), a technique that is based on CT but is able to achieve higher resolution images over a smaller field of view, researchers could show that new bone formation is more common at the cartilage-bone interface and joint margins in hand OA than in PsA¹⁰⁵. Additionally, disease-associated bone formation is located predominately on the palmar and dorsal sites in hand OA, whereas PsA has more widespread involvement, suggesting that different mechanisms of aberrant bone formation occur in these two conditions¹⁰⁵. Findings from 3D CT imaging show that the curvature of the trapezial and first metacarpal articular surface of patients with early CMCJ OA differs from that of younger or older healthy individuals¹⁰⁶. Additionally, using MicroCT (radiographic imaging in 3D on a small scale), researchers have identified differences in the structure and configuration of the trapezium trabecular bone in individuals with and without first CMCJ OA¹⁰⁷. These findings indicate that morphological changes of the bones and joints can occur at the thumb base in hand OA.

Novel imaging methods in development

Following the advancement of laser technology, several optical imaging modalities have been developed that might be applicable to hand OA¹⁰⁸ (BOX 2), including diffuse optical tomography, fluorescence optical imaging and optical coherence tomography as well as related techniques such as photoacoustic imaging. These techniques offer low-risk (non-ionizing radiation) imaging,

differentiation between the soft tissues in the hand and fast processing times¹⁰⁸. To date, these techniques have been predominantly used for in vitro and ex vivo applications, whereas their use in vivo, particularly in patients with hand OA, is limited and is still undergoing development and testing¹⁰⁹. The use of systemic contrast agents for some of these applications might limit their use and acceptability to patients.

Symptoms and structural pathology

Discordance or weak associations between clinical symptoms and radiographic structural changes are frequently reported in OA, and hand OA is no exception¹¹⁰. However, it is possible that imaging modalities that are more sensitive than those currently in use could reveal stronger associations. In a 2015 systematic review of various cross-sectional studies, the researchers concluded that MRI-defined BMLs, osteophytes, bone attrition and cysts were not associated with hand pain severity¹¹¹. However, various MRI-defined features (such as moderate or severe synovitis, BMLs, central erosions, cartilage attrition and osteophytes), in addition to various ultrasonography-determined features (such as osteophytes, synovitis and the absence of joint cartilage), have been associated with tenderness in the same joints79,92,110. Furthermore, the cumulative effects of OA in multiple hand joints is associated with more severe hand pain¹¹², functional limitation⁹² and weaker grip and pinch strength^{18,92,113}. Little is known about the course of symptoms in hand OA over time and how they relate to structural pathology. Inflammation (as determined by ultrasonography) has been associated with the progression of radiographic hand OA and the subsequent development of bone erosions^{114,115}; however, further longitudinal research will enable a better understating of the disease processes and could help identify potential targets for treatment.

Disease mechanisms

Studying the pathogenesis of hand OA is difficult: researchers have limited access to diseased tissue, and for tissue that is available, the quantities obtained for molecular analysis are small. Healthy donor tissue (to use as a control) is rarely available, and no animal models of hand OA exist. In addition to the epidemiological and in depth prospective imaging studies detailed above, our understanding of hand OA disease pathways comes from a combination of genetic data analysis and the outcomes (positive or negative) of clinical studies.

An important question to address is whether hand OA shares similar pathogenic pathways with OA at other joint sites. Of the common aetiological factors, perhaps the most important factor is abnormal mechanical loading. Although the joints of the hands are not weight bearing, they are nonetheless load bearing. Evidence for the involvement of mechanical loading in the development of hand OA is best demonstrated by the higher prevalence of OA in the dominant hand than in the non-dominant hand (80% of right-handed individuals with hand OA are predominately affected in their right hand)¹¹⁶ and the lack of disease in the immobilized hand (for example, owing to hemiparesis or polio) of some

Box 2 | Novel and alternative imaging methods in development applicable to hand OA

Diffuse optical tomography and photoacoustic imaging

In diffuse optical tomography (DOT), light from the near-infrared spectral region is passed through tissues, and the spatial and temporal variation in light absorption and scattering is measured and used to construct tomographic images²³⁰. Using 3D DOT, researchers could distinguish between distal interphalangeal joints affected by osteoarthritis (OA) and healthy joints²³¹. After further methodological refinements, this technique could distinguish between patients with hand OA and patients with psoriatic arthritis or healthy individuals²³². Incorporating photoacoustic imaging with DOT improves the image resolution, enabling better differentiation of bone from soft tissue²³³.

Fluorescence optical imaging

In fluorescence optical imaging (FOI), tissues are illuminated with a light source that can range from ultraviolet to infrared; this light excites fluorophores that have been introduced through a fluorescence contrast media that accumulates at sites of inflammation^{234,235}. In one study investigating the use of FOI in OA, which looked at joints of the hand, the researchers noted that although similar proportions of individuals with inflammation were distinguished using FOI and grey-scale or power Doppler ultrasonography in patients with either OA or rheumatoid arthritis, a particular phase of fluorescent dye flooding in (phase 2) FOI might be more informative in OA²³⁶.

Optical coherence tomography

Optical coherence tomography (OCT) employs light from the infrared end of the spectrum, which is passed through the tissues under investigation; the resulting reflections are measured, and cross-sectional images are produced. OCT can be used to visualize cartilage in the first carpometacarpal joint and to detect early changes including thickening of the cartilage and changes to the articular surface that are consistent with histology findings²³⁷. Additionally, overlaying the OCT images onto CT images can help with the visualization of cartilage²³⁷.

Trabecular bone texture

The texture of trabecular bone is quantifiable, and changes in bone texture are observable in early OA at the knee^{238,239}. Work using directional fractal signals has now extended this finding to the smaller regions of the hands, and the use of augmented variance orientation transform (AVOT) has the potential to be useful in the early detection and prediction of hand OA²⁴⁰.

Positron emission mammography

Positron emission mammography (PEM) is a nuclear medicine modality that has been used to detect or characterize breast cancer. The PEM scanner has a small field of view but is comparable to a standard PET or CT scan for evaluating hand OA²⁴¹.

Photography

A system for scoring hand OA from photographs offers an alternative method of diagnosing hand OA to clinical or radiographic assessment and is a commonly used, reliable and valid method of scoring hand OA^{242,243}. It offers researchers a feasible alternative method of data collection, which might be of particular use for large population-based studies or studies covering wide geographic or remote areas.

patients with OA of the other hand^{117,118}. Inflammatory changes in the entheses of the interphalangeal joints of patients with hand OA suggest that this tissue is an important area of stress¹¹⁹. Several features are unique to hand OA. For instance, unlike OA of the large joints, the incidence of hand OA peaks around the time of menopause²⁷, the early inflammatory phase of disease seems to pre-date bone remodelling, and joint tenderness often seems to improve in individuals over time (T.L.V., unpublished observations).

Genetics of hand OA

Genetic studies can provide powerful insights into pathogenesis. Hand OA has the highest estimated heritability of all types of OA (approximately 60%)¹²⁰. A comprehensive review published in 2008 summarized all genetic studies in hand, hip, knee and spine OA, drawing from the literature published up until 2006^{121} . This study revealed just two candidate gene associations that had been replicated for hand OA: genetic variants in *ACAN* (encoding aggrecan, an integral component of the extracellular matrix in cartilaginous tissue) and *HFE* (encoding homeostatic iron regulator, a protein associated with haemochromatosis)¹²¹. Since this study, five genome-wide association studies (GWASs)¹²²⁻¹²⁶ and numerous candidate gene studies have been published. For convenience, gene candidates can be grouped into three areas according to their putative role in disease (FIG. 2): those that are associated with growth factor signalling^{123,124,127-130}, those that contribute to the integrity and calcification of the extracellular matrix of cartilage^{122,125,131-135} and those that relate to inflammatory pathways^{126,136-140}. Two GWASs in hand OA deserve further attention. The first was a study in Iceland in which two loci were identified: one on chromosome 1, a rare variant associated with severe hand OA (no further allelic characterization was given), and a second common set of variants on chromosome 15, all in ALDH1A2 (REF.¹²⁶). ALDH1A2 encodes the enzyme retinal dehydrogenase 2 (ALDH1A2), which catalyses the synthesis of cellular retinoic acid. The polymorphic variants in ALDH1A2 are hypomorphic (that is, associated with lower levels of ALDH1A2 in hand OA cartilage)¹⁴¹. Retinoic acid is essential for forelimb development in the embryo and is a potentially interesting target, as this metabolite has anti-inflammatory effects on many different cell types including chondrocytes142. Paradoxically, chondrocyte biologists use retinoic acid to stimulate cartilage catabolism (albeit at supra-physiological levels)143.



Fig. 2 | **Predicted molecular drivers of hand osteoarthritis by genetic association.** Mechanical load is central to the pathogenesis of hand osteoarthritis (OA) and influences growth factor bioavailability, inflammation and matrix degradation. The genes shown in this figure have been linked to radiographic or symptomatic hand OA in at least one study (some of which have not been replicated). ERK; extracellularsignal-regulated kinase; PI3K, phosphoinositide 3-kinase. ^aGenetic associations that were identified by genome-wide scans (the other associations were identified using candidate gene approaches).

The second study, a 2017 GWAS from the Netherlands, identified a locus on chromosome 12, close to MGP^{125} . This gene, also identified in a previous candidate gene study¹³³, encodes matrix Gla protein (MGP), which is responsible for preventing calcification of cartilage; the hypomorphic function associated with the risk variant might predispose individuals to abnormal chondrocal-cinosis and altered biomechanical properties of the cartilage. MGP is known to be regulated by transforming growth factor- β (TGF β), and so it is of interest that candidate gene studies from the past few years have added further support for the association of hand OA with polymorphic variants in genes encoding TGF β family members^{131,132,136}. These associations are consistent with the purported chondroprotective role of TGF β in the joint.

Sex hormones and hand OA

All types of OA have a higher prevalence in postmenopausal women than in premenopausal women, but the relationship that hand OA has with the typical time of menopause onset seems to be unique and robust^{27,144}. For instance, perimenopausal symptoms (such as hot flushes and irregular menstrual cycles) commonly occur at the time of presentation with hand OA¹⁴⁴. Whether this relationship is due to the loss of the established anti-inflammatory and pro-reparative effects of oestrogen or related to fluctuations in other sex hormones is currently unclear. Both oestrogen and testosterone regulate the expression of ALDH1A family members¹⁴⁵, and it is tempting to speculate that there might be important crosstalk between retinoic acid and oestrogen signalling in the perimenopausal period.

Inflammation and hand OA

The role of inflammation in hand OA remains particularly contentious. Although it is widely accepted that inflammatory changes (including clinical and imaging-based synovitis) occur in disease, these changes are typically relatively modest in hand OA compared with inflammatory arthritides such as RA¹⁴⁶, and the pathogenic role of inflammation is far from certain. Data from prospective imaging studies show that baseline synovitis on MRI or ultrasonography predicts radiographic progression or central erosion, respectively^{99,114,115,147} However, it is worth bearing in mind that the presence of BMLs and JSN also predicts progressive disease⁹⁹, and so it is possible that inflammation is a consequence rather than a cause of progressive disease.

A wide range of OA serum or plasma biomarkers have been investigated in hand OA, which can provide insight into disease development. These biomarkers include various inflammatory markers, such as C-reactive protein and adipokines, and markers of cartilage or bone homeostasis, such as type II collagen^{148,149}. In one small sub-study of 18 patients from a 2016 hand OA clinical trial, serum IL-1 levels were associated with loss of hand function and radiological erosions¹⁵⁰. Although this study raises the possibility that erosive and non-erosive OA have different biomarker profiles, to date, biomarker characterization remains less developed for hand OA than it is for OA at other sites such as the knee. Currently, there are no validated serum or plasma biomarkers for diagnosing hand OA, stratifying its severity or predicting its progression or response to treatment.

Results from clinical trials can also aid in the understanding of disease pathogenesis. Intra-articular steroid therapy is routinely used in many cases to treat symptomatic hand OA. A 2015 RCT of 60 patients with symptomatic hand OA showed that steroid (triamcinolone) injection in combination with lidocaine (a local anaesthetic) resulted in a statistically significant improvement in the patients' hands in terms of pain on movement and physician's assessment of swelling compared with treatment with lidocaine alone¹⁵¹. Interestingly, lidocaine injection alone resulted in a striking response in the patients in this study, and five secondary disease activity measures did not differ between the two groups. The emphasis on targeting inflammation in hand OA has been further unsettled by the negative results of several RCTs in hand OA using traditional anti-inflammatory or 'anti-synovial' agents. These findings include a failure to demonstrate a difference between placebo treatment and treatment with hydroxychloroquine^{152,153}, anti-TNF agents^{154,155} or IL-1-targeting strategies¹⁵⁶.

Advances in therapy

The management of hand OA combines both non-pharmacological and pharmacological approaches. Surgical treatments are offered to those with severe symptoms and for whom conservative approaches have failed²⁹. In this section, we describe findings from original studies produced within the past 5 years for core recommendations (a range of self-management support), first-line analgesia and novel pharmacological targets.

Non-pharmacological therapies

In a 2017 systemic review, Lue and colleagues¹⁵⁷ provided an update on an earlier review¹⁵⁸ of non-surgical therapies for hand OA, and the reader is directed to this manuscript for an appraisal of the quality of some of the studies discussed below. In this section, a summary of the core and adjunctive treatments and surgery are briefly provided.

Core interventions: self-management support. Self-management programmes for hand OA can include a range of approaches such as providing the patient with written information on hand OA and self-management approaches, giving advice on hand exercises and joint education (such as joint protection strategies and pacing of activities), weight management strategies and using new models of care^{159,160}. For example, Moe et al.¹⁶⁰ concluded that the use of an integrated, multidisciplinary care model, although not superior in clinical outcomes, resulted in greater patient-reported satisfaction than usual care.

Written information on the underlying disease and self-management approaches, such as the OA guidebook¹⁶¹, are essential components of the core management of hand OA, although limited evidence is available for the effectiveness of hand OA education alone. In the trial that tested an OA consultation model (which consisted of an OA guidebook, an OA consultation with a general practitioner and a subsequent follow-up with a practice nurse in a dedicated OA clinic), the supply of written information by general practitioners and practice nurses to patients increased from 4% to 28% in the model OA consultation arm, whereas no changes from baseline were observed in the control arm (which consisted of usual care alongside a resource pack of written advice for patients)162. Although implementation of this model did not improve the health status of patients, it did improve the implementation of clinical guidelines (the NICE OA recommendations) by clinicians and allied health professionals, along with the use of self-management approaches159.

Education on maintaining joint health is often described as 'joint protection education' or 'joint education'. In the SMOOTH (Self-Management of Osteoarthritis of the Hand) study, which included community-dwelling adults (aged 50 years and over) with ACR-defined hand OA, the individuals who attended occupational therapy classes for joint protection education (using written patient information from an Arthritis Research UK booklet¹⁶³) were twice as likely to respond to treatment than those who did not attend the classes¹⁶⁴.

Several trials of hand exercise for hand OA¹⁶⁵⁻¹⁶⁷ have been published in the past few years, along with a Cochrane systematic review¹⁶⁸. Exercise is recognized as an effective analgesic therapy for those with OA at any site¹⁶⁹. However, despite continued efforts to identify the specific benefits of exercises for hand OA, the Cochrane review¹⁶⁸ found that the magnitude of the benefit of exercise and which exercises should be prescribed are still uncertain. For complex interventions, blinding the therapist or patient to the intervention is difficult, and in large studies, self-report questionnaires are often used, which contribute to a low quality rating of the study when assessed in systematic reviews. The findings suggest that recommending one approach to exercise over another is not possible at present for hand OA. Few studies have investigated the cost-effectiveness of exercise in the management of hand OA, but findings from the SMOOTH study show that hand exercises, delivered in classes by occupational therapists, could be a cost-effective approach over 12 months⁶⁶.

The association of obesity and hand OA is continually debated^{170,171}. Weight management forms part of a holistic approach to managing OA in general, and as hand OA often coexists with OA in other sites, consultations for hand OA provide an opportunity to offer weight management advice and referral to services if a patient is overweight, as recommended by NICE quality standards^{8,9}.

Adjunctive conservative therapies. Several systematic reviews have been published in the past few years on the use of non-surgical treatments for first CMCJ OA^{172,173}. Local treatments such as splints (pre-fabricated or custom orthotics worn on the affected joint) might offer warmth, support and stabilization of joints that are normally painful on movement. However, there continues to be uncertainty about the exact mechanism of action of splints and regarding their optimal design and instructions for use to maximize adherence and safety. Soft splints, off the shelf splints and splints worn at night-time might be more acceptable to patients than hard splints, custom made splints or splints to be worn during the day¹⁷⁴⁻¹⁷⁶.

Researchers have investigated splints or orthoses for first CMCJ OA¹⁷⁷⁻¹⁸¹ and IPJ OA^{157,172,173,182} as well as pressure gloves for hand arthritis¹⁸³. However, currently, what type of splint is best is unclear, and data are inconsistent as to whether splints provide symptom relief in the hand¹⁵⁷. The use of splints does improve function and pinch strength in patients with first CMCJ OA^{172,173}. Most studies of splinting have a high risk of bias because of difficulties in establishing or maintaining participant blinding or including true sham devices, but the inclusion of a placebo splint in new upcoming studies such as the OTTER (OA of the Thumb Therapy) trial gives an opportunity to address some of the key limitations of previous trials of splinting¹⁷⁴⁻¹⁷⁶.

Other non-pharmacological therapies. Several other therapies that have been tested for the treatment of hand OA include spa therapy¹⁸⁴, joint mobilization¹⁸⁵, taping¹⁸⁶ and ultrasound therapy¹⁸⁷. Although evidence is limited for the efficacy of such treatments, these approaches have been recommended in various clinical guidelines for the management of hand OA such as the EULAR Hand OA recommendations^{29,188,189}.

Pharmacological therapies

First-line analgesia: topical treatments. Topical NSAIDs are recommended in international and national guidelines as a first-line pharmacological treatment option for symptomatic hand OA (owing to their superior safety profile to oral analgesics^{8,188} and improved efficacy compared with oral paracatamol¹⁹⁰ and placebo¹⁹¹). Overall, topical NSAIDs are superior to placebo for relieving pain and improving function in OA¹⁹¹. Although salicylate gel is associated with higher with-drawal rates owing to adverse events, the remaining topical NSAIDs are not associated with any increased local or systemic adverse events¹⁹¹. The benefits of top-ical NSAIDs have been summarized elsewhere¹⁹², but there is still uncertainty over the relative efficacy of top-ical NSAIDs compared with the efficacy of other topical treatments such as capsaicin.

Topical capsaicin, an extract of hot chilli pepper, is recommended for the treatment of OA pain⁸, but studies of this treatment in hand OA are limited. In a 2014 systematic review¹⁹³ of RCTs of topical capsaicin use in OA, which included five double-blind RCTs and one case-crossover trial, only one study included patients with hand OA. Capsaicin was reported to be safe and well tolerated across all the included studies, with no evidence of systemic toxicity¹⁹³. This treatment is associated with mild burning at the application site, which peaks after 1 week and declines over time¹⁹³. Capsaicin might therefore be more suited to patients who lack inflammatory signs and have persistent pain or neuropathic symptoms, which aligns with the use of capsaicin for neuropathic pain associated with other conditions. Capsaicin treatment efficacy warrants further investigation.

Local analgesia. Injecting drugs such as glucocorticoids directly into the joints provides local symptomatic relief and offers another option in addition to core treatment. Interest in the use of intra-articular injection therapy in hand OA continues^{151,194–198}, as this approach is preferable to surgical approaches in elderly patients with comorbidities¹⁹⁸.

The benefits and harms of intra-articular therapies were assessed in a 2016 systematic literature review and meta-analysis; this analysis included trials that investigated the efficacy or safety of any intra-articular therapy in first CMCJ and IPJ OA compared with placebo or other treatments for which pain was the main outcome¹⁹⁸. A total of 13 trials (including 864 patients with hand OA, 11 trials of patients with OA of the first CMCJ and 2 trials of patients with OA of the IPJs) were included. The results of a meta-analysis of two trials comparing intra-articular corticosteroids and placebo treatment in patients with first CMCJ OA indicated that intra-articular corticosteroids resulted in no improvement in pain. Synthetic hyaluronan also seemed inefficacious compared with placebo in patients with first CMCJ OA. However, in one trial of patients with OA of the IPJs, the patients receiving corticosteroids had considerable improvements in pain during movement compared with the patients receiving placebo151. The authors of the systematic review198 concluded that intra-articular injection of corticosteroids or hyaluronan do not seem more effective than placebo in first CMCJ OA. However, the placebo response can be large, and intra-articular use in combination with other modalities such as splinting might still be a relevant option.

Adjunctive analgesia. Paracetamol is prescribed for hand OA if topical treatments are ineffective or not tolerated⁸, although the effect size of this therapy in the treatment of large joint OA might be smaller than previously thought¹⁹⁰. If ineffective, and following careful assessment of the risks and benefits to the individual, oral NSAIDs (such as naproxen), cyclooxygenase 2 (COX2; also known as PTGS2) inhibitors or opiates might be introduced. These drugs should generally be used sparingly and only when required to limit the risk of toxicity. A proton pump inhibitor should be prescribed along with NSAIDs to protect against NSAID-induced gastrointestinal adverse events¹⁹⁹. In a 2015 study of patients with first CMCJ OA²⁰⁰, in the small number of participants included in the final analysis (n = 19), the patients receiving naproxen had a considerable reduction in brain activity in areas commonly associated with pain perception compared with those patients receiving placebo.

The use of several novel agents has been investigated for the treatment of hand OA and typically involves the re-purposing of disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs or biologic therapies licensed for use in RA: these therapies include adalimumab, a monoclonal antibody to TNF¹⁵⁴, hydroxychloroquine¹⁵³, doxycycline²⁰¹ and GCSB-5, a herb extract²⁰². Evidence from these studies suggests that adalimumab and hydroxychloroquine are not effective in treating hand OA pain^{153,154}. Further studies are needed to identify oral treatments that improve hand pain or modify the course of disease. Several drug trials in OA, including ongoing trials, might be relevant to hand OA and have been reviewed elsewhere²⁰³. The ongoing clinical trials include drugs that inhibit inflammatory mechanisms (such as GM-CSF²⁰⁴ and anti-IL-6 (REF.²⁰⁵), but novel targets relevant to other OA mechanisms might be needed to move the field forward.

Nutraceuticals are not recommended by NICE for the management of OA, but researchers have investigated their effects in hand OA. In a systematic review of oral chondroitin for OA, including hand OA, chondroitin treatment (alone or in combination with glucosamine) was associated with a short-term benefit in terms of pain relief compared with placebo (although most of the studies assessed were of low quality)²⁰⁶. The low risks associated with chondroitin might account for its popularity as an over-the-counter supplement in individuals with hand OA, but more evidence is needed to advocate the use of this supplement in routine clinical practice.

Surgery. Surgery in hand OA is recommended for patients who are refractory to non-surgical management⁸. In a survey of 163 patients with first CMCJ OA, the results confirmed that patients predominantly visit hand surgeons seeking treatment to reduce pain and that improvements in function and aesthetic image are a lower priority for these patients²⁰⁷. The findings highlight the need to elicit patients' expectations before treatment and to discuss potential treatment outcomes in order to achieve optimal gain from surgery. Placebo-controlled RCTs for many surgical procedures carried out for the treatment of hand OA are lacking.

Guidelines and implementation

Guidelines have previously been published that address the clinical management of hand OA^{8,29,208,209}, including the newly released 2018 update from EULAR¹⁸⁸. However, ensuring the uptake of guidelines in clinical practice is challenging^{159,162}. Improvements are needed in the ways of recording hand OA diagnosis in primary care and evaluating the quality of hand OA care, including the implementation of guidelines. Demonstrating an association between the implementation of clinical guidelines and improvements in the health status and function of patients is difficult in real world settings¹⁵⁹. This field of investigation is growing; for example, ways in which to measure the quality of care that include valid quality indicators and demonstrate the effects of implementation are now high on the research agenda.

Regarding research guidelines, a preliminary core set of outcomes has been developed by OMERACT using Delphi exercises and systematic literature review²¹⁰. In clinical trials of symptom modification, the minimum outcomes should include assessments of pain, physical function, joint activity and hand strength as well as global patient assessment. For clinical trials examining structure modification as well as observational studies, structural damage should also be examined²¹⁰. Finally, guidelines on imaging in hand OA clinical trials are also available⁷¹.

Conclusion

Hand OA is a common, disabling, heterogeneous condition. Studies in the past few years have provided some advances in our understanding of the burden and underlying mechanisms of hand OA as well as

regarding hand OA therapy, but there is much still to understand. Localized therapies for hand OA such as hand exercises and topical treatments offer small but clinically important amounts of symptomatic relief in hand OA and should arguably be more widely used. Hydroxychloroquine, previously used anecdotally off label to treat severe forms of the disease, is now known to be ineffective in the treatment of established symptomatic radiographic hand OA and should not be used in such patients. The lack of efficacy of many anti-rheumatic drugs in hand OA has catalysed a re-evaluation of potential disease targets. The disappointing results from clinical trials reaffirm the need for a better understanding of basic underlying disease mechanisms, and arguably a better method for identifying and stratifying patients with early disease and/or who are at high risk of progression, at a time when disease processes might be susceptible to intervention.

In primary care management, the diagnosis of hand OA without the use of imaging is still recommended by international guidelines⁸. A better approach for classifying and coding the disease is needed. Such an approach is essential for improving the delivery of quality care for this common condition. Guidelines such as the newly updated 2018 EULAR recommendations¹⁸⁸ for the management of hand OA will continue to improve the quality of care for patients with hand OA, provided that steps are taken to accelerate the implementation of such guidance into every day practice.

Published online 10 October 2018

- Global Burden of Disease Study 2013 Collaborators. Global, regional, and national incidence, prevalence, and years lived with disability for 301 acute and chronic diseases and injuries in 188 countries, 1990–2013: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease study 2013. *Lancet* 386, 743–800 (2015).
- Cross, M. et al. The global burden of hip and knee osteoarthritis: estimates from the global burden of disease 2010 study. Ann. Rheum. Dis. **73**, 1323–1330 (2015).
- Dziedzic, K. et al. The impact of musculoskeletal hand problems in older adults: findings from the North Staffordshire Osteoarthritis Project (NorStOP). *Rheumatology (Oxford)*. 46, 963–967 (2007).
- Kloppenburg, M. & Kwok, W.Y. Hand osteoarthritis a heterogeneous disorder. *Nat. Rev. Rheumatol.* 8, 22–31 (2011).
- Marshall, M. et al. Subsets of symptomatic hand osteoarthritis in community-dwelling older adults in the United Kingdom: prevalence, inter-relationships, risk factor profiles and clinical characteristics at baseline and 3-years. Osteoarthr. Cartil. 21, 1674–1684 (2013).
- Kloppenburg, M. Hand osteoarthritisnonpharmacological and pharmacological treatments. *Nat. Rev. Rheumatol.* **10**, 242–251 (2014).
- EIT Health. Joint implementation of guidelines for oSteoArthritis in Western Europe (JICSAW-E). *EIT Health* https://www.eithealth.eu/jigsaw-e (2018).
- National Institute for Health & Care Excellence. Osteoarthritis: care and management in adults. NICE https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/cg177 (2014).
- National Institute for Health & Care Excellence. Osteoarthritis. NICE https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/ qs87 (2015).
- Dziedzic, K. S. et al. Self management, joint protection and exercises in hand osteoarthritis: a randomised controlled trial with cost effectiveness analyses. *BMC Musculoskelet. Disord.* 12, 156 (2011).
- 11. Altman, R. et al. The American College of Rheumatology criteria for the classification and

reporting of osteoarthritis of the hand. *Arthritis Rheum.* **33**, 1601–1610 (1990). Marshall, M., Dziedzic, K. S., van der Windt, d.A.

- Hammer, H. B. et al. Global ultrasound assessment of structural lesions in osteoarthritis: a reliability study by the OMERACT ultrasonography group on scoring cartilage and osteophytes in finger joints. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **75**, 402–407 (2016).
- Srikanth, V. K. et al. A meta-analysis of sex differences prevalence, incidence and severity of osteoarthritis. *Osteoarthr. Cartil.* 13, 769–781 (2005).
- Punzin, L., Ramonda, R. & Sfriso, P. Erosive osteoarthritis. *Best. Pract. Res. Clin. Rheumatol.* 18, 739–758 (2004).
- Pereira, D. et al. The effect of osteoarthritis definition on prevalence and incidence estimates: a systematic review. Osteoarthr. Cartil. 19, 1270–1285 (2011).
- Sowers, M., Lachance, L., Hochberg, M. & Jamadar, D. Radiographically defined osteoarthritis of the hand and knee in young and middle-aged African American and Caucasian women. *Osteoarthr. Cartil.* 8, 69–77 (2000).
- Kodama, R. et al. Prevalence of hand osteoarthritis and its relationship to hand pain and grip strength in Japan: the third survey of the ROAD study. *Mod. Rheumatol.* 26, 767–773 (2016).
- Davatchi, F. et al. Epidemiology of rheumatic diseases in Iran from analysis of four COPCORD studies. Int. J. Rheum. Dis. 19, 1056–1062 (2016)
- Zhang, Y. et al. Lower prevalence of hand osteoarthritis among Chinese subjects in Beijing compared with white subjects in the United States: the Beijing Osteoarthritis study. *Arthritis Rheum.* 48, 1034–1040 (2003).
- Haugen, I. K. et al. Prevalence, incidence and progression of hand osteoarthritis in the general population: the Framingham Osteoarthritis study. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **70**, 1581–1586 (2011).

- Tomi, A.-L. et al. Increased prevalence and severity of radiographic hand osteoarthritis in patients with HIV-1 infection associated with metabolic syndrome: data from the cross-sectional METAFIB-OA study. 75, 2101–2107 (2016).
- Qin, J. et al. Lifetime risk of symptomatic hand osteoarthritis: the Johnston County Osteoarthritis Project. Arthritis Rheumatol. 69, 1204–1212 (2017).
- Kallman, D. A., Wigley, F. M., Scott Jr, W. W., Hochberg, M. C. & Tobin, J. D. The longitudinal course of hand osteoarthritis in a male population. *Arthritis Rheum.* 33, 1323–1332 (1990).
- Haugen, I. K., Magnusson, K., Turkiewicz, A. & Englund, M. The prevalence, incidence, and progression of hand osteoarthritis in relation to body mass index, smoking, and alcohol consumption. *J. Rheumatol.* 44, 1402–1409 (2017).
- Prieto-Alhambra, D. et al. Incidence and risk factors for clinically diagnosed knee, hip and hand osteoarthritis: influences of age, gender and osteoarthritis affecting other joints. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 73, 1659–1664 (2014).
- Botha-Scheepers, S. A. et al. Influence of familial factors on radiologic disease progression over two years in siblings with osteoarthritis at multiple sites: a prospective longitudinal cohort study. *Arthritis Rheum.* 57, 626–632 (2007).
- Zhang, W. et al. EULAR evidence based recommendations for the management of hand osteoarthritis: report of a task force of the EULAR Standing Committee for International Clinical Studies Including Therapeutics (ESCISIT). Ann. Rheum. Dis. 66, 377–388 (2007).
- Tan, A. L. et al. High-resolution magnetic resonance imaging for the assessment of hand osteoarthritis. *Arthritis Rheum.* 52, 2355–2365 (2005).

- Villafañe, J. H. & Valdes, K. Combined thumb abduction and index finger extension strength: a comparison of older adults with and without thumb carpometacarpal osteoarthritis. *J. Manipulative. Physiol. Ther.* 36, 238–244 (2013).
- Cantero-Téllez, R., Martín-Valero, R. & Cuesta-Vargas, A. Effect of muscle strength and pain on hand function in patients with trapeziometacarpal osteoarthritis. A cross-sectional study. *Reumatol Clin.* 11, 340–344 (2015).
- Coughlan, M. J. et al. Reduction in cylindrical grasp strength is associated with early thumb carpometacarpal osteoarthritis. *Clin. Orthop. Relat. Res.* 475, 522–528 (2017).
- Mobargha, N., Ludwig, C., Ladd, A. L. & Hagert, E. Ultrastructure and innervation of thumb carpometacarpal ligaments in surgical patients with osteoarthritis. *Clin. Orthop. Relat. Res.* 472, 1146–1154 (2014).
- Mallinson, P. Ì., Tun, J. K., Farnell, R. D., Campbell, D. A. & Robinson, P. Osteoarthritis of the thumb carpometacarpal joint: correlation of ultrasound appearances to disability and treatment response. *Clin. Radiol.* 68, 461–465 (2013).
- Dumont, C. et al. Osteoarthritis of the carpometacarpal joint of the thumb: a new MR imaging technique for the standardized detection of relevant ligamental lesions. *Skeletal Radiol.* 43, 1411–1420 (2014).
- Merritt, M. M., Roddey, T. S., Costello, C. & Olson, S. Diagnostic value of clinical grind test for carpometacarpal osteoarthritis of the thumb. *J. Hand Ther.* 23, 261–267 (2010).
 Choa, R. M., Parviz, N. & Giele, H. P. A prospective
- Choa, R. M., Parviz, N. & Giele, H. P. A prospective case-control study to compare the sensitivity and specificity of the grind and traction-shift (subluxation-relocation) clinical tests in osteoarthritis of the thumb carpometacarpal joint. *J. Hand Surg. Eur.* **39**, 282–285 (2014).
- Rees, F. et al. Distribution of finger nodes and their association with underlying radiographic features of osteoarthritis. *Arthritis Care. Res. (Hoboken)*. 64, 533–538 (2012).
- Thaper, A., Zhang, W., Wright, G. & Doherty, M. Relationship between Heberden's nodes and underlying radiographic changes of osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 64, 1214–1216 (2005).
- Vlychou, M., Koutroumpas, A., Alexiou, I., Fezoulidis, I. & Sakkas, L. I. High-resolution ultrasonography and 3.0 T magnetic resonance imaging in erosive and nodal hand osteoarthritis: high frequency of erosions in nodal osteoarthritis. *Clin. Rheumatol.* 32, 755–762 (2013).
- Hodkinson, B., Maheu, E., Michon, M., Carrat, F. & Berenbaum, F. Assessment and determinants of aesthetic discomfort in hand osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 71, 45–49 (2012).
- Altman, R. D. & Gold, G. E. Atlas of individual radiographic features in osteoarthritis, revised. Osteoarthr. Cartil. 15, A1–A56 (2007).
- Verbruggen, G. & Veys, E. M. Numerical scoring systems for the anatomic evolution of osteoarthritis of the finger joints. *Arthritis Rheum.* **39**, 308–320 (1996).
- Marshall, M. et al. Erosive osteoarthritis: a more severe form of radiographic hand osteoarthritis rather than a distinct entity? *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 74, 136–141 (2015).
- Addimanda, O. et al. Clinical and radiographic distribution of structural damage in erosive and nonerosive hand osteoarthritis. *Arthritis Care. Res.* (*Hoboken*). 64, 1046–1053 (2012).
- Kwok, W. Y. et al. The prevalence of erosive osteoarthritis in carpometacarpal joints and its clinical burden in symptomatic community-dwelling adults. Osteoarthr. Cartil. 22, 756–763 (2014).
- Kwok, W. Y. et al. Comparison of clinical burden between patients with erosive hand osteoarthritis and inflammatory arthritis in symptomatic communitydwelling adults: the Keele clinical assessment studies. *Rheumatology (Oxford)*. 52, 2260–2267 (2013).
- Wittoek, R., Cruyssen, B. V. & Verbruggen, G. Predictors of functional impairment and pain in erosive osteoarthritis of the interphalangeal joints: comparison with controlled inflammatory arthritis. *Arthritis Rheum.* 64, 1430–1436 (2012).

- Kortekaas, M. C., Kwok, W. Y., Reijnierse, M., Huizinga, T. W. & Kloppenburg, M. In erosive hand osteoarthritis more inflammatory signs on ultrasound are found than in the rest of hand osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **72**, 930–934 (2013).
- Haugen, I. K. et al. Synovitis and radiographic progression in non-erosive and erosive hand osteoarthritis: is erosive hand osteoarthritis a separate inflammatory phenotype? *Osteoarthr. Cartil.* 24, 647–654 (2016).
- Bukhave, E. B. & Huniche, L. Activity problems in everyday life—patients' perspectives of hand osteoarthritis: "try imagining what it would be like having no hands". *Disabil. Rehabil.* 36, 1636–1643 (2014).
- Bukhave, E. B., Ia Cour, K. & Huniche, L. The meaning of activity and participation in everyday life when living with hand osteoarthritis. *Scand. J. Occup. Ther.* 21, 24–30 (2014).
- van Schoor, N. M. et al. Impact of clinical osteoarthritis of the hip, knee and hand on self-rated health in six European countries: the European Project on OSteoArthritis. *Qual. Life. Res.* 25, 1423–1432 (2016).
- Hall, A. J. et al. Association between osteoarthritis and cardiovascular disease: systematic review and meta-analysis. *Eur. J. Prev. Cardiol.* 23, 938–946 (2016).
- Koutroumpas, A. et al. Erosive hand osteoarthritis is associated with subclinical atherosclerosis and endothelial dysfunction. *Int. J. Biomed. Sci.* 9, 217–223 (2013).
- Jonsson, H. et al. Hand osteoarthritis in older women is associated with carotid and coronary atherosclerosis: the ACES Reykjavik study. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 68, 1696–1700 (2009).
- Courties, A. et al. Coronary heart disease is associated with a worse clinical outcome of hand osteoarthritis: a cross-sectional and longitudinal study. *RMD Open* 3, e000344 (2017).
- Haugen, I. K. et al. Hand osteoarthritis in relation to mortality and incidence of cardiovascular disease: data from the Framingham Heart Study. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 74, 74–81 (2015).
- Kluzek, S. et al. Painful knee but not hand osteoarthritis is an independent predictor of mortality over 23 years follow-up of a population-based cohort of middle-aged women. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **75**, 1749–1756 (2016).
- 62. Liu, R. et al. Mortality in osteoarthritis patients. *Scand. J. Rheumatol.* **44**, 70–73 (2015).
- Neuprez, A. et al. Aesthetic discomfort in hand osteoarthritis: results from the Llege Hand Osteoarthritis Cohort (LIHOC). *Arthritis Res. Ther.* 17, 346 (2015).
- Liu, R., Damman, W., Kaptein, A. A., Rosendaal, F. R. <u>&</u> Kloppenburg, M. Coping styles and disability in patients with hand osteoarthritis. *Rheumatology* (*Oxford*), 55, 411–418 (2016).
- (Oxford). 55, 411–418 (2016).
 Gilpin, H. R., Moseley, G. L., Stanton, T. R. & Newport, R. Evidence for distorted mental representation of the hand in osteoarthritis. *Rheumatology (Oxford).* 54, 678–682 (2015).
- Oppong, R. et al. Joint protection and hand exercises for hand osteoarthritis: an economic evaluation comparing methods for the analysis of factorial trials. *Rheumatology (Oxford)*. 54, 876–883 (2015).
- Becker, S. J. et al. Medical services and associated costs vary widely among surgeons treating patients with hand osteoarthritis. *Clin. Orthop. Relat. Res.* 473, 1111–1117 (2015).
- Marks, M. et al. Healthcare costs and loss of productivity in patients with trapeziometacarpal osteoarthritis. *J. Hand. Surg. Eur.* 40, 927–934 (2015).
- Wolf, J. M., Atroshi, I., Zhou, C., Karlsson, J. & Englund, M. Sick leave after surgery for thumb carpometacarpal osteoarthritis: a population-based study. *J. Hand Surg. Am.* 43, 439–447 (2018).
 Kloppenburg, M. et al. OARSI clinical trials
- Kloppenburg, M. et al. OARSI clinical trials recommendations: design and conduct of clinical trials for hand osteoarthritis. *Osteoarthr. Cartil.* 23, 772–786 (2015).
- Hurter, D. J. et al. OARSI clinical trials recommendations: hand imaging in clinical trials in osteoarthritis. Osteoarthr. Cartil. 23, 732–746 (2015).
- Sakellariou, G. et al. EULAR recommendations for the use of imaging in the clinical management of peripheral joint osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **76**, 1484–1494 (2017).

- Matsos, M. et al. Ultrasound of the hands and feet for rheumatological disorders: influence on clinical diagnostic confidence and patient management. *Skeletal Radiol.* 38, 1049–1054 (2009).
- Maheu, E. et al. Reproducibility and sensitivity to change of four scoring methods for the radiological assessment of osteoarthritis of the hand. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **66**, 464–469 (2007).
- Bijsterbosch, J. et al. Reliability, sensitivity to change and feasibility of three radiographic scoring methods for hand osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **70**, 1465–1467 (2011).
- Haugen, I. K., Slatkowsky-Christensen, B., Faraj, K., van der Heijde, D. & Kvien, T. K. The comparison of magnetic resonance imaging and radiographs to assess structural progression over 5 years in hand osteoarthritis. *Rheumatology (Oxford)*. 56, 371–377 (2017).
- Keen, H. I. et al. Can ultrasonography improve on radiographic assessment in osteoarthritis of the hands? A comparison between radiographic and ultrasonographic detected pathology. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 67, 1116–1120 (2008).
- Abraham, A. M., Pearce, M. S., Mann, K. D., Francis, R. M. & Birrell, F. Population prevalence of ultrasound features of osteoarthritis in the hand, knee and hip at age 63 years: the Newcastle thousand families birth cohort. *BMC Musculoskelet. Disord.* 15, 162 (2014).
- Usón, J. et al. Symptomatic and asymptomatic interphalageal osteoarthritis: an ultrasonographic study. *Reumatol Clin.* 10, 278–282 (2014).
- Mathiessen, A. et al. Ultrasonographic assessment of osteophytes in 127 patients with hand osteoarthritis: exploring reliability and associations with MRI, radiographs and clinical joint findings. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 72, 51–56 (2013).
- Haugen, I. K. et al. Comparison of features by MRI and radiographs of the interphalangeal finger joints in patients with hand osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 71, 345–350 (2012).
- Keen, H. I. et al. An ultrasonographic study of osteoarthritis of the hand: synovitis and its relationship to structural pathology and symptoms. *Arthritis Rheum.* 59, 1756–1763 (2008).
- Kortekaas, M. C. et al. Pain in hand osteoarthritis is associated with inflammation: the value of ultrasound. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 69, 1367–1369 (2010).
- Liu, R. et al. Bone marrow lesions on magnetic resonance imaging in hand osteoarthritis are associated with pain and interact with synovitis. Osteoarthr. Cartil. 25, 1093–1099 (2017).
- Keen, H. I. et al. The development of a preliminary ultrasonographic scoring system for features of hand osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 67, 651–655 (2008).
- lagnocco, A. et al. The reliability of musculoskeletal ultrasound in the detection of cartilage abnormalities at the metacarpo-phalangeal joints. *Osteoarthr. Cartil.* 20, 1142–1146 (2012).
- Wittoek, R. et al. Reliability and construct validity of ultrasonography of soft tissue and destructive changes in erosive osteoarthritis of the interphalangeal finger joints: a comparison with MRI. Ann. Rheum. Dis. **70**, 278–283 (2011).
- Kortekaas, M. C., Kwok, W. Y., Reijnierse, M., Huizinga, T. W. & Kloppenburg, M. Osteophytes and joint space narrowing are independently associated with pain in finger joints in hand osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **70**, 1835–1837 (2011).
- Spolidoro Paschoal, N. O. et al. Interphalangeal joint sonography of symptomatic hand osteoarthritis: clinical and functional correlation. *J. Ultrasound Med.* 36, 311–319 (2017).
- Guermazi, A., Roemer, F. W. & Hayashi, D. Imaging of osteoarthritis: update from a radiological perspective. *Curr. Opin. Rheumatol.* 23, 484–491 (2011).
- Haugen, I. K. et al. Hand osteoarthritis and MRI: development and first validation step of the proposed Oslo hand osteoarthritis MRI score. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 70, 1033–1038 (2011).
- Haugen, I. K. et al. Associations between MRI-defined synovitis, bone marrow lesions and structural features and measures of pain and physical function in hand osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheym. Dis.* **71**, 899–904 (2012)
- osteoarthritis. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 71, 899–904 (2012).
 Kortekaas, M. C. et al. Magnetic resonance imaging in hand osteoarthritis: intraobserver reliability and criterion validity for clinical and structural characteristics. J. Rheumatol. 42, 1224–1230 (2015).
- Ramonda, R. et al. A recently developed MRI scoring system for hand osteoarthritis: its application in a clinical setting. *Clin. Rheumatol.* 35, 2079–2086 (2016).

- Haugen, I. K. et al. Iterative development and reliability of the OMERACT Hand Osteoarthritis MRI Scoring System. J. Rheumatol. 41, 386–391 (2014).
- Haugen, I. K. et al. The longitudinal reliability and responsiveness of the OMERACT Hand Osteoarthritis Magnetic Resonance Imaging Scoring System (HOAMRIS). J. Rheumatol. 42, 2486–2491 (2015).
- Haugen, I. K. et al. Increasing synovitis and bone marrow lesions are associated with incident joint tenderness in hand osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **75**, 702–708 (2016).
- Damman, W. et al. Bone marrow lesions and synovitis on MRI associate with radiographic progression after 2 years in hand osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **76**, 214–217 (2017).
- Haugen, I. K. et al. MRI findings predict radiographic progression and development of erosions in hand osteoarthritis. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 75, 117–123 (2016).
- 100. Kortekaas, M. C., Kwok, W. Y., Reijnierse, M. & Kloppenburg, M. Inflammatory ultrasound features show independent associations with progression of structural damage after over 2 years of follow-up in patients with hand osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **74**, 1720–1724 (2015).
- 101. Mathiessen, A., Slatkowsky-Christensen, B., Kvien, T. K., Hammer, H. B. & Haugen, I. K. Ultrasound-detected inflammation predicts radiographic progression in hand osteoarthritis after 5 years. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **75**, 825–830 (2016).
- 102. Keen, H. I., Wakefield, R. J., Hensor, E. M., Emery, P. & Conaghan, P. G. Response of symptoms and synovitis to intra-muscular methylprednisolone in osteoarthritis of the hand: an ultrasonographic study. *Rheumatology* (Oxford). 49, 1093–1100 (2010).
- Klauser, A. S. et al. Sonographic criteria for therapy follow-up in the course of ultrasound-guided intraarticular injections of hyaluronic acid in hand osteoarthritis. *Eur. J. Radiol.* 81, 1607–1611 (2012).
 Kortekaas. M. C. et al. Follow-up study of inflammatory
- 104. Kortekaas, M. C. et al. Follow-up study of inflammatory ultrasound features in hand osteoarthritis over a period of 3 months: variable as well as constant. Osteoarthr. Cartil. 22, 40–43 (2014).
- Finzel, S. et al. Inflammatory bone spur formation in psoriatic arthritis is different from bone spur formation in hand osteoarthritis. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* 66, 2968–2975 (2014).
- Halilaj, E. et al. The morphology of the thumb carpometacarpal joint does not differ between men and women, but changes with aging and early osteoarthritis. J. Biomech. 47, 2709–2714 (2014).
- Lee, A. T. et al. Trapezium trabecular morphology in carpometacarpal arthritis. *J. Hand. Surg. Am.* 38, 309–315 (2013).
- National Institutes of Health. Optical Imaging. NIH https://report.nih.gov/NIHfactsheets/ViewFactSheet. aspx?csid=105 (2013).
- 109. Gompels, L. L., Lim, N. H., Vincent, T. & Paleolog, E. M. In vivo optical imaging in arthritis—an enlightening future? *Rheumatology (Oxford)*. 49, 1436–1446 (2010).
- 110. Haugen, I. K., Slatkowsky-Christensen, B., Bøyesen, P., van der Heijde, D. & Kvien, T. K. Cross-sectional and longitudinal associations between radiographic features and measures of pain and physical function in hand osteoarthritis. *Osteoarthr. Cartil.* 21, 1191–1198 (2013).
- 111. Barr, A. J. et al. A systematic review of the relationship between subchondral bone features, pain and structural pathology in peripheral joint osteoarthritis. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* **17**, 228 (2015).
- 112. Magnusson, K. et al. Diabetes is associated with increased hand pain in erosive hand osteoarthritis: data from a population-based study. *Arthritis Care Res.* (Hoboken). **67**, 187–195 (2015).
- Lee, H. J., Paik, N. J., Lim, J. Y., Kim, K. W. & Gong, H. S. The impact of digit-related radiographic osteoarthritis of the hand on grip-strength and upper extremity disability. *Clin. Orthop. Relat. Res.* **470**, 2202–2208 (2012).
 Mancarella, L. et al. Ultrasound detected inflammation
- 114. Mancarella, L. et al. Ultrasound detected inflammation is associated with the development of new bone erosions in hand osteoarthritis: a longitudinal study over 3.9 years. *Osteoarthr. Cartil.* 23, 1925–1932 (2015).
- 115. Mancarella, L., Addimanda, O., Cavallari, C. & Meliconi, R. Synovial inflammation drives structural damage in hand osteoarthritis: a narrative literature review. *Curr. Rheumatol. Rev.* **13**, 43–50 (2017).
- 116. Damman, W. et al. Do comorbidities play a role in hand osteoarthritis disease burden? Data from hand osteoarthritis secondary care cohort. *J. Rheumatol.* 44, 1659–1666 (2017).

- 117. Brandt, K. D., Dieppe, P. & Radin, E. L. Commentary: is it useful to subset 'primary' osteoarthritis? A critique based evidence regarding the etiopathogenesis of osteoarthritis. *Semin. Arthritis Rheum.* **39**, 81–95 (2009).
- Droz-Bartholet, F., Verhoeven, F., Prati, C. & Wendling, D. Prevention of hand osteoarthritis by hemiparesis. Arthritis Rheumatol. 68, 647 (2016).
- 119. Tan, A. L. et al. Combined high-resolution magnetic resonance imaging and histological examination to explore the role of ligaments and tendons in the phenotypic expression of early hand osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **65**, 1267–1272 (2006).
- Ishimori, M. L. et al. Heritability patterns in hand osteoarthritis: the role of osteophytes. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* **12**, R180 (2010).
- 121. Ryder, J. J. et al. Genetic associations in peripheral joint osteoarthritis and spinal degenerative disease: a systematic review. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 67, 584–591 (2008).
- Stefänsson, S. E. et al. Genomewide scan for hand osteoarthritis: a novel mutation in matrilin-3. *Am. J. Hum. Cenet.* **72**, 1448–1459 (2003).
 Zhai, G. et al. A genome-wide association study
- 123. Zhai, G. et al. A genome-wide association study suggests that a locus within the ataxin 2 binding protein 1 gene is associated with hand osteoarthritis: the Treat-OA consortium. J. Med. Genet. 46, 614–616 (2009).
- 124. Kerkhof, H. J. M. et al. A genome-wide association study identifies an osteoarthritis susceptibility locus on chromosome 7q22. *Arthritis Rheum.* **62**, 499–510 (2010).
- 125. Hollander, den, W. et al. Genome-wide association and functional studies identify a role for matrix Gla protein in osteoarthritis of the hand. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 76, 2046–2053 (2017).
- 126. Styrkarsdottir, U. et al. Severe osteoarthritis of the hand associates with common variants within the ALDH1A2 gene and with rare variants at 1p31. Nat. Cenet. 46, 498–502 (2014).
- 127. Hämäläinen, S. et al. Genetic influences on hand osteoarthritis in Finnish women—a replication study of candidate genes. *PLOS ONE* 9, e97417 (2014).
- 128. Zhang, R. et al. A comprehensive meta-analysis of association between genetic variants of *CDF5* and osteoarthritis of the knee, hip and hand. *Inflamm. Res.* 64, 405–414 (2015).
- 129. Zhang, F. et al. Association between KLOTHO gene and hand osteoarthritis in a female Caucasian population. *YJOCA* **15**, 624–629 (2007).
- 130. Meulenbelt, I. et al. A genetic association study of the IGF-1 gene and radiological osteoarthritis in a population-based cohort study (the Rotterdam study). *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 57, 371–374 (1998).
- Bijsterbosch, J. et al. Association study of candidate genes for the progression of hand osteoarthritis. Osteoarthr. Cartil. 21, 565–569 (2013).
- 132. Taipale, M., Solovieva, S., Leino-Arjas, P. & Männikkö, M. Functional polymorphisms in asporin and CILP together with joint loading predispose to hand osteoarthritis. *BMC Genet.* 18, 108 (2017).
- 133. Misra, D. et al. Matrix Gla protein polymorphism, but not concentrations, is associated with radiographic hand osteoarthritis. J. Rheumatol 38, 1960–1965 (2011).
- 134. Suk, É.-K. et al. Association of ENPP1 gene polymorphisms with hand osteoarthritis in a Chuvasha population. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* 7, R1082–R1090 (2005).
- Kämäräinen, O.-P. et al. Aggrecan core protein of a certain length is protective against hand osteoarthritis. *YJOCA* 14, 1075–1080 (2006).
- 136. Hämäläinen, S., Solovieva, S., Vehmas, T., Leino-Arjas, P. & Hirvonen, A. Variations in the TNF_a gene and their interactions with the IL4R and IL10 genes in relation to hand osteoarthritis. *BMC Musculoskelet Disord*. **15**, 311 (2014).
- Vargiolu, M. et al. Interleukin-4/interleukin-4 receptor gene polymorphisms in hand osteoarthritis. Osteoarthr. Cartil. 18, 810–816 (2010).
- Blumenfeld, O. et al. Association of interleukin-6 gene polymorphisms with hand osteoarthritis and hand osteoporosis. *Cytokine* 69, 94–101 (2014).
- 139. Näkki, A. et al. Allelic variants of IL1R1 gene associate with severe hand osteoarthritis. *BMC Med. Genet.* 11, 50 (2010).
- 140. Moxley, G., Han, J., Stern, A. G. & Riley, B. P. Potential influence of IL1B haplotype and IL1A-IL1B-IL1RN extended haplotype on hand osteoarthritis risk. *VJOCA* 15, 1106–1112 (2007).
- 141. Zhu, L. et al. Polymorphic variants in *ALDH1A2* determine the expression level of ALDH1A2 and

CYP19A1 in the cartilage of patients undergoing trapeziectomy for severe thumb osteoarthritis. *Osteoarthr. Cartil.* **26**, (Suppl. 1) S157 (2018).

- 142. Ho, L J. et al. Retinoic acid blocks pro-inflammatory cytokine-induced matrix metalloproteinase production by down-regulating JNK-AP-1 signaling in human chondrocytes. *Biochem. Pharmacol.* **70**, 200–208 (2005).
- 143. Stanton, H. et al. Investigating ADAMTS-mediated aggrecanolysis in mouse cartilage. *Nat. Protoc.* 6, 388–404 (2011).
- 144. Watt, F. E. Hand osteoarthritis, menopause and menopausal hormone therapy. *Maturitas* 83, 13–18 (2016).
- Petrosino, J. M., Disilvestro, D. & Ziouzenkova, O. Aldehyde dehydrogenase 1A1: friend or foe to female metabolism? *Nutrients* 6, 950–973 (2014).
- 146. Hussain, S. et al. Ultrasonography-detected subclinical inflammation in patients with hand osteoarthritis and established rheumatoid arthritis: a comparison between two different pathologies using the same ultrasound examination protocol. *Musculoskeletal Care* 16, 26–31 (2018).
- Kortekaas, M. C., Kwok, W. Y., Reijnierse, M., Stijnen, T. & Kloppenburg, M. Association of inflammation with development of erosions in patients with hand osteoarthritis: a prospective ultrasonography study. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* 68, 392–397 (2016).
 Lennerová, T., Pavelka, K. & Šenolt, L. Biomarkers of
- Lennerová, T., Pavelka, K. & Šenolt, L. Biomarkers of hand osteoarthritis. *Rheumatol. Int.* 38, 725–735 (2018).
- Fioravanti, A. et al. Can adipokines serum levels be used as biomarkers of hand osteoarthritis? *Biomarkers* 23, 265–270 (2018).
- 150. Roux, C. H. et al. MRI and serum biomarkers correlate with radiographic features in painful hand osteoarthritis. *Clin. Exp. Rheumatol.* **34**, 991–998 (2016).
- 151. Spolidoro Paschoal, N. O., Natour, J., Machado, F. S., de Oliveira, H. A. & Furtado, R. N. Effectiveness of triamcinolone hexacetonide intraarticular injection in interphalangeal joints: a 12-week randomized controlled trial in patients with hand osteoarthritis. *J. Rheumatol.* 42, 1869–1877 (2015).
- 152. Lee, W. et al. Efficacy of hydroxychloroquine in hand osteoarthritis: a randomized, double blind, placebo-controlled trial. *Arthritis Care Res. (Hoboken)* **70**, 1320–1325 (2017).
- 153. Kingsbury, S. R. et al. Hydroxychloroquine effectiveness in reducing symptoms of hand osteoarthritis: a randomized trial. *Ann. Intern. Med.* 168, 385–389 (2018).
- 154. Chevalier, X. et al. Adalimumab in patients with hand osteoarthritis refractory to analgesics and NSAIDs: a randomised, multicentre, double-blind, placebocontrolled trial. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 74, 1697–1705 (2015).
- 155. Aitken, D. et al. A randomised double-blind placebo-controlled crossover trial of HUMira (adalimumab) for erosive hand OsteoaRthritis- the HUMOR trial. Osteoarthr. Cartil. 26, 880–887 (2018).
- 156. Kloppenburg, M. et al. A phase 2a, placebo-controlled, randomized study of ABF981, an anti-interleukin-1a and -1 β dual variable domain immunoglobulin, to treat erosive hand osteoarthritis (EHOA) [abstract OP0168]. Ann. Rheum. Dis. **76**, (Suppl. 2) 122 (2017).
- 157. Lue, S., Koppikar, S., Shaikh, K., Mahendira, D. & Towheed, T. E. Systematic review of non-surgical therapies for osteoarthritis of the hand: an update. *Osteoarthr. Cartil.* 25, 1379–1389 (2017).
- Mahendira, D. & Towheed, T. E. Systematic review of non-surgical therapies for osteoarthritis of the hand: an update. Osteoarthr. Cartil. 17, 1263–1268 (2009).
- Dziedzic, K. S. et al. Implementing core NICE guidelines for osteoarthritis in primary care with a model consultation (MOSAICS): a cluster randomised controlled trial. Osteoarthr. Cartil. 26, 43–53 (2018).
 Moe, R. H. Effectiveness of an integrated
- 160. Moe, R. H. Effectiveness of an integrated multidisciplinary osteoarthritis outpatient program versus outpatient clinic as usual: a randomized controlled trial. J. Rheumatol. 43, 411–418 (2016).
- 161. Arthritis Research UK. A guidebook for people who have osteoarthritis. *Keele University* www. arthritisresearchuk.org/arthritis-information/ keele-oa-guide.aspx (2014).
- 162. Jordan, K. P. et al. Effect of a model consultation informed by guidelines on recorded quality of care of osteoarthritis (MOSAICS): a cluster randomised controlled trial in primary care. Osteoarthr. Cartil. 25, 1588–1597 (2017).

- 163. Arthritis Research UK. Osteoarthritis of the hand. *Keele University* www.keele.ac.uk/media/keeleuniversity/ ri/primarycare/OA%20Hand%20Leaflet%20v.0.10% 2002.02.18%20LC%20[1).pdf (2017).
- Dziedzic, K. et al. Self-management approaches for osteoarthritis in the hand: a 2 x 2 factorial randomised trial. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **74**, 108–118 (2015).
 Kjeken, I., Grotle, M., Hagen, K. B. & Østerås, N.
- 165. Kjeken, I., Grotle, M., Hagen, K. B. & Østerås, N. Development of an evidence-based exercise programme for people with hand osteoarthritis. *Scand. J. Occup. Ther.* 22, 103–116 (2015).
- Scand. J. Occup. Ther. 22, 103–116 (2015).
 166. Hennig, T. et al. Effect of home-based hand exercises in women with hand osteoarthritis: a randomised controlled trial. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 74, 1501–1508 (2015).
- 167. Østerås, N. et al. Limited effects of exercises in people with hand osteoarthritis: results from a randomized controlled trial. Osteoarthr. Cartil. 22, 1224–1233 (2014).
- 168. Østerås, N. Exercise for hand osteoarthritis. *Cochrane Database Syst. Rev.* **31**, CD010388 (2017).
- 169. Uthman, O. A. et al. Exercise for lower limb osteoarthritis: systematic review incorporating trial sequential analysis and network meta-analysis. *BMJ* 347, f5555 (2013).
- 170. Magnusson, K. et al. Body mass index and progressive hand osteoarthritis: data from the Oslo hand osteoarthritis cohort. *Scand. J. Rheumatol.* 44, 331–336 (2015).
- Jiang, L. Body mass index and hand osteoarthritis susceptibility: an updated meta-analysis. *Int. J. Rheum. Dis.* 19, 1244–1254 (2016).
- 172. Spaans, A. J. Conservative treatment of thumb base osteoarthritis: a systematic review. J. Hand Surg. Am. 40, 16–21 (2015).
- Bertozzi, L. Investigation of the effect of conservative interventions in thumb carpometacarpal osteoarthritis: systematic review and meta-analysis. *Disabil Rehabil.* 37, 2025–2043 (2015).
- Gooberman-Hill, R. et al. Designing a placebo device: involving service users in clinical trial design. *Health Expect.* 16, 100–110 (2013).
- 175. Arthritis Research UK. Osteoarthritis of the thumb therapy (OTTER) trial. University of Southampton https://www.southampton.ac.uk/healthsciences/ research/projects/osteoarthritis_of_the_thumb_ therapy.page (2018).
- 176. National Institute for Health Research. Osteoarthritis thumb therapy trial II. *NIHR* https://ukctg.nihr.ac. uk/trials/trial-details/trial-details?trialNumber= ISRCTN54744256 (2018).
- 177. Bani, M. A. et al. A custom-made neoprene thumb carpometacarpal orthosis with thermoplastic stabilization: an orthosis that promotes function and improvement in patients with the first carpometacarpal joint osteoarthritis. *Prosthet. Orthot. Int.* **38**, 79–82 (2014).
- 178. Hamann, N. et al. Stabilization effectiveness and functionality of different thumb orthoses in female patients with first carpometacarpal joint osteoarthritis. *Clin. Biomech.* 29, 1170–1176 (2014).
- 179. Grenier, M. L., Mendonca, R. & Dalley, P. The effectiveness of orthoses in the conservative management of thumb CMC joint osteoarthritis: an analysis of functional pinch strength. J. Hand Ther. 29, 307–313 (2016).
- Valdes, K., Naughton, N. & Algar, L. Linking ICF components to outcome measures for orthotic intervention for CMC OA: a systematic review. *J. Hand Ther.* 29, 396–404 (2016).
- 181. Vegt, A. E. et al. The effect of two different orthoses on pain, hand function, patient satisfaction and preference in patients with thumb carpometacarpal osteoarthritis: a multicentre, crossover, randomised controlled trial. *Bone Joint J.* **99-B**, 237–244 (2017).
- Watt, F. E. et al. Night-time immobilization of the distal interphalangeal joint reduces pain and extension deformity in hand osteoarthritis. *Rheumatology* (Oxford). 53, 1142–1149 (2014).
- Hammond, A., Jones, V. & Prior, Y. The effects of compression gloves on hand symptoms and hand function in rheumatoid arthritis and hand osteoarthritis: a systematic review. *Clin. Rehabil.* **30**, 213–224 (2016).
- 184. Fortunati, N. A., Fioravanti, A., Seri, G., Cinelli, S. & Tenti, S. May spa therapy be a valid opportunity to treat hand osteoarthritis? A review of clinical trials and mechanisms of action. *Int. J. Biometeorol.* 60, 1–8 (2016).
- 185. Villafañe, J. H. & Herrero, P. Conservative treatment of myofascial trigger points and joint mobilization for

management in patients with thumb carpometacarpal osteoarthritis. J. Hand Ther. **29**, 89–92 (2016).

- 186. Wade, R. G., Paxman, C. B., Tucker, N. C. & Southern, S. Kinesiology taping reduces the pain of finger osteoarthritis: a pilot single-blinded twogroup parallel randomized trial. *J. Pain. Res.* 11, 1281–1288 (2018).
- Paolillo, A. R., Paolillo, F. R., João, J. P., João, H. A. & Bagnato, V. S. Synergic effects of ultrasound and laser on the pain relief in women with hand osteoarthritis. *Lasers Med. Sci.* **30**, 279–286 (2015).
 Kloopenbure, M. et al. 2018 update of the EULAR
- Kloppenburg, M. et al. 2018 update of the EULAR recommendations for the management of hand osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* https://doi.org/ 10.1136/annrheumdis-2018-213826 (2018).
- 189. Kroon, F., Kloppenburg, M., Schoones, J. & Carmona, L. Systematic literature review (SLR) for the 2018 update of the EULAR management recommendations for hand osteoarthritis (OA). Ann. Rheum. Dis. 77, 1133 (2018)
- 190. Zou, K. et al. Examination of overall treatment effect and the proportion attributable to contextual effect in osteoarthritis: meta-analysis of randomised controlled trials. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 75, 1964–1970 (2016).
- 191. Zeng, C. et al. Relative efficacy and safety of topical non-steroidal anti-inflammatory drugs for osteoarthritis: a systematic review and network meta-analysis of randomised controlled trials and observational studies. *Br. J. Sports. Med.* 52, 642–650 (2018).
- 192. Rannou, F., Pelletier, J. P. & Martel-Pelletier, J. Efficacy and safety of topical NSAIDs in the management of osteoarthritis: evidence from real-life setting trials and surveys. *Semin. Arthritis Rheum.* 45, S18–S21 (2016).
- 193. Laslett, L. L. & Jones, G. Capsaicin for osteoarthritis pain. Prog. Drug Res. 68, 277–291 (2014).
- 194. Monfort, J. et al. Comparative efficacy of intra-articular hyaluronic acid and corticoid injections in osteoarthritis of the first carpometacarpal joint: results of a 6-month single-masked randomized study. *Joint Bone Spine.* 82, 116–121 (2015).
- 195. Jahangiri, A., Moghaddam, F. R. & Najafi, S. Hypertonic dextrose versus corticosteroid local injection for the treatment of osteoarthritis in the first carpometacarpal joint: a double-blind randomized clinical trial. *J. Orthop. Sci.* **19**, 737–743 (2014).
- 196. McCann, P. A., Wakeley, C. J. & Amirfeyz, R. The effect of ultrasound guided steroid injection on progression to surgery in thumb CMC arthritis. *Hand Surg.* 19, 49–52 (2014).
- 197. Trellu, S., Dadoun, S., Berenbaum, F., Fautrel, B. & Gossec, L. Intra-articular injections in thumb osteoarthritis: a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. *Joint Bone Spine.* 82, 315–319 (2015).
- Kroon, F. P., Rubio, R., Schoones, J. W. & Kloppenburg, M. Intra-articular therapies in the treatment of hand osteoarthritis: a systematic literature review. *Drugs Aging*. 33, 119–133 (2016).
 National Institute for Health & Care Excellence.
- National Institute for Health & Care Excellence. Non-steroidal anti-inflammatory drugs. NICE https:// www.nice.org.uk/advice/ktt13/resources/nonsteroidalantiinflammatory-drugs-58757951055301 (2015).
 Sanders, D. et al. Pharmacologic modulation of hand
- 200. Sanders, D. et al. Pharmacologic modulation of hand pain in osteoarthritis: a double-blind placebo-controlled functional magnetic resonance imaging study using naproxen. Arthritis Rheumatol. 67, 741–751 (2015).
- Ma, J., Talukdar, R. & Gainers-Hasugluw, V. Pilot open observations on doxycycline treatment for erosive osteoarthritis of the hand. J. Clin. Rheumatol. 21, 38–39 (2015).
- Park, J. K. et al. Efficacy and tolerability of GCSB-5 for hand osteoarthritis: a randomized, controlled trial. *Clin. Ther.* 38, 1858–1868 (2016).
- Watt, F. E. & Gulati, M. New drug treatments for osteoarthritis: what is on the horizon? *EMJ* 2, 50–58 (2017).
- 204. Grevan, D. E. et al. Preclinical characterisation of the GM-CSF receptor as a therapeutic target in rheumatoid arthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 74, 1924–1930 (2015).
- US National Library of Medicine. *ClinicalTrials.gov* https://clinicaltrials.gov/ct2/show/NCT02477059 (2018).
- 206. Singh, J. A., Noorbaloochi, S., MacDonald, R. & Maxwell, L. J. Chondroitin for osteoarthritis. *Cochrane Database Syst. Rev.* 28, CD005614 (2015).
- Frouzakis, R., Herren, D. B. & Marks, M. Evaluation of expectations and expectation fulfillment in patients treated for trapeziometacarpal osteoarthritis. *J. Hand Surg. Am.* 40, 483–490 (2015).
- 208. Hochberg, M. C. et al. American College of Rheumatology 2012 recommendations for the use of

nonpharmacologic and pharmacologic therapies in osteoarthritis of the hand, hip, and knee. *Arthritis Care Res. (Hoboken).* **64**, 465–474 (2012).

- Manara, M. et al. Italian Society for Rheumatology recommendations for the management of hand osteoarthritis. *Reumatismo* 65, 167–185 (2013).
- Kloppenburg, M. et al. Report from the OMERACT Hand Osteoarthritis Working Group: set of core domains and preliminary set of instruments for use in clinical trials and observational studies. J. Rheumatol. 42, 2190–2197 (2015).
- Riyazi, N. et al. Evidence for familial aggregation of hand, hip, and spine but not knee osteoarthritis in siblings with multiple joint involvement: the GARP study. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 64, 458–443 (2005).
- 212. Andrianakos, A. A. et al. Prevalence of symptomatic knee, hand, and hip osteoarthritis in Greece. The ESORDIG study. J. Rheumatol. 33, 2507–2513 (2006).
- 213. Castell, M. V. et al. Osteoarthritis and frailty in elderly individuals across six European countries: results from the European Project on OSteoArthritis (EPOSA). *BMC Musculoskelet. Disord.* **15**, 359 (2015).
- 214. Kellgren, J. H. & Lawrence, J. S. Radiological assessment of osteo-arthrosis. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 16, 494–502 (1957).
- 215. Kellgren, J. H., Jeffrey, M. R. & Ball, J. The Epidemiology of Chronic Rheumatism: Atlas of Standard Radiographs of Arthritis Vol. 2 (Blackwell Scientific Publications, Oxford, UK, 1963).
- 216. Sowers, M. et al. Progression of osteoarthritis of the hand and metacarpal bone loss. A twenty-year followup of incident cases. *Arthritis. Rheum.* 34, 36–42 (1991).
- Hochberg, M. et al. Bone mineral density and osteoarthritis: data from the Baltimore Longitudinal Study of Aging. Osteoarthr. Cartil. 12, 45–48 (2004).
- Wilder, F. V., Barrett, J. P. & Farina, E. J. Joint-specific prevalence of osteoarthritis of the hand. *Osteoarthr. Cartil.* 14, 953–957 (2006).
- 219. Toba, N. et al. Prevalence and involvement patterns of radiographic hand osteoarthritis in Japanese women: the Hizen-Oshima study. J. Bone Miner. Metab. 24, 344–348 (2006).
- Kalichman, L. & Hernández-Molina, G. Hand osteoarthritis: an epidemiological perspective. *Semin. Arthritis. Rheum.* **39**, 465–476 (2010).
- 221. Chaisson, C. E. et al. Radiographic hand osteoarthritis: incidence, patterns, and influence of pre-existing disease in a population based sample. *J. Rheumatol.* 24, 1337–1343 (1997).
- Güler-Yüksel, M. et al. Accelerated metacarpal bone mineral density loss is associated with radiographic progressive hand osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 70, 1625–1630 (2011).
- 223. Hirsch, R. et al. Association of hand and knee osteoarthritis: evidence for a polyarticular disease subset. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 55, 25–29 (1996).
- Dahaghin, S. et al. Prevalence and pattern of radiographic hand osteoarthritis and association with pain and disability (the Rotterdam study). *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 64, 682–687 (2005).
- 225. Saleh, A. S. et al. Arterial stiffness and hand osteoarthritis: a novel relationship? Osteoarthr. Cartil. 15, 357–361 (2009).
- 226. Stankovich, J. et al. Investigation of chromosome 2q in osteoarthritis of the hand: no significant linkage in a Tasmanian population. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 61, 1081–1084 (2002).
- Cooley, H. M. et al. The association between hormonal and reproductive factors and hand osteoarthritis. *Maturitas* 45, 257–265 (2003).
 Szoeke, C. E. I. et al. Factors affecting the prevalence
- 228. Szoeke, C. E. I. et al. Factors affecting the prevalence of osteoarthritis in healthy middle-aged women: data from the longitudinal Melbourne Women's Midlife Health Project. *Bone* **39**, 1149–1155 (2006).
- Zhang, Y. et al. Prevalence of symptomatic hand osteoarthritis and its impact on functional status among the elderly: the Framingham Study. Am. J. Epidemiol. 156, 1021–1027 (2002).
- 230. Hielscher, A. H. et al. Near-infrared diffuse optical tomography. *Dis Markers* **18** 313–337 (2002)
- tomography. Dis. Markers. 18, 313–337 (2002).
 231. Yuan, Z., Zhang, Q., Sobel, E. & Jiang, H. Comparison of diffusion approximation and higher order diffusion equations for optical tomography of osteoarthritis. J. Biomed. Ont. 14, 054013 (2009).
- J. Biomed. Opt. 14, 054013 (2009). 232. Yuan, Z., leong, F. H., Jiang, H. & Sobel, E. S. Osteoarthritis and psoriatic arthritis: findings in three-dimensional biophotonics imaging. Biomed. Mater. Eng. 24, 3063–3071 (2014).

- Xi, L. & Jiang, H. Integrated photoacoustic and diffuse optical tomography system for imaging of human finger joints in vivo. J. Biophoton. 9, 213–217 (2016).
- Etrych, T. et al. Fluorescence optical imaging in anticancer drug delivery. J. Control. Release. 226, 168–181 (2016).
- Werner, S. G. et al. Inflammation assessment in patients with arthritis using a novel in vivo fluorescence optical imaging technology. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **71**, 504–510 (2012).
- 236. Glimm, A. M., Werner, S. G., Burmester, G. R., Backhaus, M. & Ohrndorf, S. Analysis of distribution and severity of inflammation in patients with osteoarthritis compared to rheumatoid arthritis by ICG-enhanced fluorescence optical imaging and musculoskeletal ultrasound: a pilot study. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **75**, 566–570 (2016).
- 237. Cernohorsky, P. et al. In-situ imaging of articular cartilage of the first carpometacarpal joint using co-registered optical coherence tomography and computed tomography. J. Biomed. Opt. 17, 060501 (2012).
- Lynch, J. A., Hawkes, D. J. & Buckland-Wright, J. C. Analysis of texture in macroradiographs of osteoarthritic knees using the fractal signature. *Phys. Med. Biol.* 36, 709–722 (1991).
- Wolski, M., Podsiadlo, P., Stachowiak, G. W., Lohmander, L. S. & Englund, M. Differences in trabecular bone texture between knees with and without radiographic osteoarthritis detected by directional fractal signature method. *Osteoarthr. Cartil.* 18, 684–690 (2010).
- 240. Wolski, M., Podsiadlo, P. & Stachowiak, G. W. Directional fractal signature methods for trabecular bone texture in hand radiographs: data from the Osteoarthritis Initiative. *Med. Phys.* **41**, 081914 (2014).
- 241. Mhlanga, J. C., Carrino, J. A., Lodge, M., Wang, H. & Wahl, R. L. 18F-FDG PET of the hands with a dedicated high-resolution PEM system (arthro-PET): correlation with PET/CT, radiography and clinical parameters. *Eur. J. Nucl. Med. Mol. Imag.* **41**, 2337–2345 (2014).
- 242. Jonsson, H. et al. The use of digital photographs for the diagnosis of hand osteoarthritis: the ACES-Reykjavik study. BMC Musculoskelet. Disord. 13, 20 (2012).
- 243. Marshall, M. et al. Reliability of assessing hand osteoarthritis on digital photographs and associations

with radiographic and clinical findings. *Arthritis Care Res. (Hoboken).* **66**, 828–836 (2014).

- 244. Paradowski, P. T., Lohmander, L. S. & Englund, M. Natural history of radiographic features of hand osteoarthritis over 10 years. *Osteoarthr. Cartil.* 18, 917–922 (2010).
- Bage, E., Bjelle, A., Valkenburg, H. A. & Svanborg, A. Prevalence of radiographic osteoarthritis in two elderly European populations. *Rheumatol. Int.* **12**, 33–38 (1992).
- Plato, C. C. & Norris, A. H. Osteoarthritis of the hand: age-specific joint-digit prevalence rates. *Am. J. Epidemiol.* **109**, 169–180 (1979).
- Yu, D. et al. Annual consultation incidence of osteoarthritis estimated from population-based health care data in England. *Rheumatology (Oxford)* 54, 2051–2060 (2015).
- Bijsterbosch, J. et al. Clustering of hand osteoarthritis progression and its relationship to progression of osteoarthritis at the knee. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **73**, 567–572 (2014).
- Bijsterbosch, J. et al. Clinical and radiographic disease course of hand osteoarthritis and determinants of outcome after 6 years. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **70**, 68–73 (2011).
- Paradowski, P. T., Lohmander, L. S. & Englund, M. The association between metacarpal ratio, radiographic hand and knee osteoarthritis and its progression after meniscectomy. *Osteoarthr. Cartil.* 21, 1053–1057 (2013).
- Yusuf, E. et al. Association between leptin, adiponectin and resistin and long-term progression of hand osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **70**, 1282–1284 (2011).
- Botha-Scheepers, S. et al. Progression of hand osteoarthritis over 2 years: a clinical and radiological follow-up study. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 68, 1260–1264 (2009).
- Čvijetić, S., Kurtagić, N. & Ozegović, D. D. Osteoarthritis of the hands in the rural population: a follow-up study. *Eur. J. Epidemiol.* **19**, 687–691 (2004).
- 254. Hassett, G., Hart, D. J., Doyle, D. V., March, L. & Spector, T. D. The relation between progressive osteoarthritis of the knee and long term progression of osteoarthritis of the hand, hip, and lumbar spine. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **65**, 623–628 (2006).

Acknowledgements

The work of M.M. and K.D. is supported by the Arthritis Research UK Primary Care Centre (20202), and the work of K.D. is partially funded by a Knowledge Mobilisation Research Fellowship (KMRF-2014-03-002) from the UK National Institute for Health Research (NIHR). The work of T.L.V. and F.E.W. is supported by the Arthritis Research UK Centre for Osteoarthritis Pathogenesis (20205 and 21621) and in part by the NIHR Oxford Biomedical Research Centre (the work of F.E.W.). The views expressed are those of the authors and not necessarily those of the UK National Health. Service (NHS), the NIHR or the UK Department of Health.

Author contributions

The authors contributed equally to all aspects of the article.

Competing interests

M.M. declares she has no competing interests. F.E.W. declares that she has received clinical study research funding from Astellas and Pfizer. T.L.V. declares that she was a member of a hand osteoarthritis (OA) advisory board for GlaxoSmithKline in 2017. K.D. declares that she is a member of the 2018 EULAR Guidelines Committee for the management of hand OA.

Publisher's note

Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Review criteria

The aim of this Review is to update earlier reviews^{4,6} published in *Nature Reviews Rheumatology* with evidence from a search over the past 5 years for new original studies, Cochrane reviews and international guidelines. A search for original articles that examined hand osteoarthritis and were published between 1 January 2012 and 10 October 2017 was performed in MEDLINE. The title and abstracts were searched using the following terms: "osteoarthritis" or "OA" and "hand", "finger", "thumb", "interphalangeal", "inter phalangeal", "IPJ", "metacarpophalangeal", "metacarpo phalangeal", "MCP", "carpometacarpal", "carpo metacarpal", "CMC", "trapezioscaphoid", "Trapezio scaphoid", "TS", "erosive", "nodal" or "node". All full-text papers and articles in the English language were reviewed. The authors also searched the reference lists of identified articles for further relevant papers.

New insights into the genetics and epigenetics of systemic sclerosis

Chiara Angiolilli^[1,2,3], Wioleta Marut^{1,2,3}, Maarten van der Kroef^{1,2}, Eleni Chouri^{1,2}, Kris A. Reedquist^{1,2} and Timothy R. D. J. Radstake^{1,2*}

Abstract | Systemic sclerosis (SSc) is a severe autoimmune disease that is characterized by vascular abnormalities, immunological alterations and fibrosis of the skin and internal organs. The results of genetic studies in patients with SSc have revealed statistically significant genetic associations with disease manifestations and progression. Nevertheless, genetic susceptibility to SSc is moderate, and the functional consequences of genetic associations remain only partially characterized. A current hypothesis is that, in genetically susceptible individuals, epigenetic modifications constitute the driving force for disease initiation. As epigenetic alterations can occur years before fibrosis appears, these changes could represent a potential link between inflammation and tissue fibrosis. Epigenetics is a fast-growing discipline, and a considerable number of important epigenetic studies in SSc have been published in the past few years that span histone post-translational modifications, DNA methylation, microRNAs and long non-coding RNAs. This Review describes the latest insights into genetic and epigenetic contributions to the pathogenesis of SSc and aims to provide an improved understanding of the molecular pathways that link inflammation and fibrosis. This knowledge will be of paramount importance for the development of medicines that are effective in treating or even reversing tissue fibrosis.

DNA methylation

An epigenetic change to DNA that conventionally creates a close, inactive chromatin state that results in transcriptional repression.

¹Department of

Rheumatology and Clinical Immunology, University Medical Centre Utrecht, Utrecht University, Utrecht, Netherlands.

²Laboratory of Translational Immunology, Department of Immunology, University Medical Centre Utrecht, Utrecht University, Utrecht, Netherlands.

³These authors contributed equally: Chiara Angiolilli, Wioleta Marut.

**e-mail: t.r.d.j.radstake@ umcutrecht.nl* https://doi.org/10.1038/ s41584-018-0099-0 Systemic sclerosis (SSc) is a severe disease that is characterized by damage to small blood vessels and immune system alterations that leads to fibrosis of the skin and internal organs¹. Such fibrosis can cause severe damage to internal organs, leading to conditions such as pulmonary arterial hypertension and pulmonary fibrosis, both of which are major causes of disease-associated morbidity and mortality^{2,3}. On the basis of skin involvement, SSc is classified into two main subtypes: limited cutaneous SSc (lcSSc), in which skin fibrosis is restricted to the distal areas of the hands and fingers, and diffuse cutaneous SSc (dcSSc), in which skin fibrosis can affect the whole body¹. Patients with SSc who do not have fibrosis, but who do have Raynaud phenomenon and either a marker autoantibody (for instance, anti-centromere antibodies (ACAs), anti-telomere antibodies (ATAs) or antinuclear antibodies (ANAs)) or abnormalities in nail fold capillaroscopy results, are identified as having early SSc⁴. Given the heterogeneity in disease that occurs between patients with SSc, in 2013 (REF.5) the ACR and EULAR proposed new criteria6 for the classification of SSc that incorporate additional clinical manifestations and features of the disease to enable improved and earlier diagnosis than was possible using previous criteria².

SSc is a rare disease with a prevalence that ranges from 7 to 489 individuals per million⁷. This variability is likely to be the result of a high degree of variation across geographic regions as SSc is more prevalent in the USA, Australia and southern Europe than in northern Europe and Japan⁷⁻⁹. Moreover, in the USA, African Americans have a higher probability of developing SSc than white Americans and experience an earlier age of onset and increased morbidity⁷⁻⁹. SSc development is also sex-dependent, being more common in women than in men, with ratios varying from 3:1 to 14:1 depending on the geographical region⁸. Notably, although SSc is more prevalent in women, men with SSc seem to develop more severe disease outcomes than do women with SSc⁷.

Currently, the pathogenesis of SSc remains ambiguous; however, the consensus is that in genetically susceptible individuals, the disease is triggered by exposure to environmental factors. These factors, such as exposure to silica or viruses^{10–12}, can lead to modifications at the epigenetic level^{10–12} (such as DNA methylation and histone post-translational modifications (FIG. 1)) that ultimately cause a series of molecular events that lead to the development of SSc. In this Review, we present an overview of developments in our understanding of the genetic and epigenetic landscape of SSc pathogenesis.

Key points

- Systemic sclerosis (SSc) is a complex fibrotic, autoimmune disease, the manifestations
 of which are only partially explained by genetic predisposition.
- The concordance rate for SSc in monozygotic twins is low, indicating that genetic predisposition is insufficient to explain disease development and suggesting a role for environmental factors and epigenetic influences.
- Epigenetic factors associated with SSc include changes in DNA methylation, histone modifications and the expression of microRNAs and long non-coding RNAs, which together drive aberrant immune activation and fibrosis.
- Integration of the knowledge derived from genomic and epigenomic studies in SSc is needed to improve the characterization of the disease.
- Therapies that target epigenetic pathways are emerging as promising therapeutic tools in experimental models of fibrosis, raising hope for future applications in SSc.

As previous literature on the subject has been reviewed elsewhere¹³, we concentrate on research from the past 4 years. We also highlight new directions that could be taken in diagnostic and therapeutic approaches to SSc.

Genetic involvement in SSc

SSc is a complex autoimmune disease with regard to genetic susceptibility. The relative risk of developing SSc is 1.6% in families with a history of SSc and 0.026% in the general population^{14,15}. Interestingly, the concordance rate of SSc in monozygotic twins is only 4.2%¹⁶, which is a much lower rate than that of other autoimmune diseases, including rheumatoid arthritis (RA; 12.3%)¹⁷, multiple sclerosis (16.7%)¹⁸ and primary biliary cholangitis (77%)¹⁹. However, the gene expression profiles of dermal fibroblasts isolated from patients with SSc and their unaffected monozygotic, but not dizygotic, twins are similar²⁰, indicating that a substantial genetic component exists in the development of this disease. The presence of SSc is also associated with the risk of developing other autoimmune diseases. For instance, first-degree relatives of patients with SSc have a high prevalence of autoimmune thyroid disease²¹, RA²¹ and systemic lupus erythematosus (SLE)22.

Nevertheless, over the past few years, intense research has led to insights into the genetic basis of this disease. Similar to most autoimmune diseases, SSc is not the result of a single polymorphism but rather results from multiple genetic variants that predispose individuals to developing SSc. Many HLA and non-HLA genes are associated with susceptibility to SSc (TABLE 1). In the following section, we focus on genetic associations with SSc that have been identified over the past 4 years.

Histone post-translational modifications

Chemical modifications to histone tails (such as acetylation and methylation) that influence the accessibility of the DNA to the transcription machinery, thereby allowing or repressing gene expression.

Immunochip

Single nucleotide polymorphism microarrays designed to replicate and establish statistically significant genome-wide association study loci associated with autoimmune and inflammatory disorders. **HLA** genes

The HLA region is a highly polymorphic part of the genome that contains the first identified genetic associations with SSc. The results of multiple studies, some of which included genome-wide association studies (GWASs) and Immunochip data analysis, have shown associations between HLA polymorphisms and susceptibility to SSc (TABLE 1). According to the results of a 2017 systematic review²³, class II HLA genes have the highest statistically significant association with SSc; in particular, genetic polymorphisms in *HLA-DQA1*, *HLA-DQB1*, *HLA-DPB1* and *HLA-DRB1* have been associated with SSc in more than five different studies^{33,24}. In general, the

majority of studies have reported that the presence of HLA alleles is linked with general susceptibility to SSc, although some studies have shown a protective effect of HLA alleles in SSc (TABLE 1). These associations can be specific for certain populations or common between different ethnic populations^{25,26}. For instance, the results of a 2015 study in patients with SSc from a Mexican cohort showed that HLA-DRB1*11:04 was associated with susceptibility to SSc, whereas HLA-DQB1*03:01 was associated with protection from SSc27. A separate 2016 study confirmed the protective role of HLA-DQB1*03:01, but this time in Japanese patients with SSc²⁸. In the same study28, HLA-DQB1*05:01 and HLA-DQB1*06:01 were also found to positively associate with the presence of autoantibodies in patients with SSc. By contrast, the results of another study in the USA showed that HLA-DQB1*03:01 was associated with susceptibility to SSc, rather than protection, in white, African-American and Hispanic individuals²⁵.

Many studies have also reported that HLA genes and/or haplotypes associate with subsets of patients with SSc and with some clinical features of SSc. For example, in a Chinese cohort, lung fibrosis was most common in patients with SSc who carried the *HLA-DPB1*03:01* haplotype, whereas ACA-positive patients were more likely to carry the *HLA-DPB1*04* haplotype than ACA-negative patients²⁹. By contrast, these clinical features of SSc had a negative relationship of borderline significance with homozygous expression of *HLA-DPB1*05:01* (REF.²⁹). The results of another study provided evidence that class II HLA alleles within the *HLA-DQ5-HLA-DR1* haplotype are associated with low rates of progression from early SSc to established SSc³⁰.

The importance of class II HLA gene associations in SSc has also been confirmed in juvenile-onset SSc. In particular, *HLA-DQA1*05*, which had been previously identified as a risk factor in adult males with SSc³¹, was more prevalent in patients with juvenile-onset SSc than in healthy controls³². Moreover, a new association between SSc and *HLA-DRB1*10* was reported in children³², suggesting a distinction between the HLA gene associations for juvenile-onset and adult-onset SSc.

Finally, the results of Immunochip data analysis have provided a comprehensive overview of the HLA region, confirming a strong association between the HLA region and SSc²⁴. In this study²⁴, seven single-nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) and six polymorphic amino acid positions in the HLA region were associated with either SSc or with specific autoantibody profiles.

Non-HLA genes

Many of the different genes associated with SSc are found in non-HLA loci, with the strongest associations being with genes related to the immune system (FIG. 2a; TABLE 1). For example, in line with the type I interferon signature found in patients with SSc³³, polymorphisms in interferon regulatory factor (IRF) genes are associated with SSc³⁴. *IRF5* was the first IRF gene reported to be associated with SSc, an observation that was replicated in several studies³⁴. In 2016, another IRF family member, *IRF4*, was identified as a common susceptibility locus for SSc and RA in a cross-disease GWAS meta-analysis³⁵.



Fig. 1 | **Key epigenetic processes. a** | Histone acetyltransferases (HATs) mediate the transfer of acetyl groups to lysine residues on histone tails. Histone deacetylases (HDACs) counterbalance HAT activity by deacetylating histones (as well as non-histone proteins). Histone methyltransferases (HMTs) and histone demethylases (HDMs) catalyse the transfer and the removal, respectively, of methyl groups on lysine and arginine residues on histones. A specific example of how H3K27 methylation (H3K27me3) and acetylation (H3K27a) can influence transcriptional regulation is given in the figure. **b** | DNA methyltransferases (DNMTs) convert cytosine to 5-methylcytosine (5mC) and promote transcriptional repression; conversely, ten-eleven translocation methylcytosine dioxygenase (TET) proteins convert 5mC to 5-hydroxymethylcytosine (5mC) and, after intermediate reactions, promote DNA demethylation. **c** | Long non-coding RNAs (IncRNAs) have a wide range of functions, including establishing transcriptional initiation or repression and controlling mRNA decay and protein translation. **d** | MicroRNAs (miRNAs) with near-perfect complementarity preferentially block protein synthesis by inhibiting translation, whereas miRNAs with perfect complementarity accelerate mRNA degradation. **a**, acetyl group; m, methyl group; pre-miRNA, precursor-miRNA.

Unsurprisingly, given that T cells are involved in the pathogenesis of SSc, several genes expressed by T cells have also been identified as being associated with susceptibility to SSc. For example, *CD247* encodes the T cell receptor CD3³ subunit, which modulates antigendependent activation of T cells. The results of three

GWASs have revealed an association between the CD247 rs2056626 variant and susceptibility to SSc^{36–38}; however, this association was not confirmed in a Han Chinese cohort of patients with SSc³⁹, highlighting the difficulties that arise from the heterogeneity of disease in patients with SSc and the influence of ethnicity. The

Table 1 Genes associated with syst	emic sclerosis			
Function	Gene	Allele or variant (location)	Disease association	Refs
Susceptibility to SSc				
MHC class II	HLA-DR	DRB1*11:04	SSc	27
		DRB1*01:01	Presence of ACAs	28
		DRB1*10:01	Presence of ACAs	28
		DPB1*04:02	Presence of ACAs	28
		DRB1*15:02	Presence of ATAs	28
		DRB1*10	Juvenile SSc	32
	HLA-DQ	DQB1*05:01	Presence of ACAs	28
		DQB1*06:01	Presence of ATAs	28
		DQA1*05	Juvenile SSc	32
	HLA-DP	DPB1*03:01	Presence of ATAs	28
		DPB1*09:01	Presence of ATAs	28
		DPB1*03:01	Pulmonary fibrosis	29
		DPB1*04	Presence of ACAs	29
Transcription factors involved in	IRF4	rs9328192 (intergenic)	SSc	35
interferon signalling	IRF5	rs2004640 (intronic)	SSc and pulmonary fibrosis in SSc	34,150-152
	IRF5-TNPO3	• rs4728142 (intergenic) • rs10488631 (intergenic) • rs12531711 (intronic)	SSc	52
	STAT4	rs7574865 (intronic)	SSc and pulmonary fibrosis in SSc	34,152
Thelper 2 cell-associated cytokine	IL12A	rs77583790 (intronic)	SSc	24
IL-12 receptor subunit	IL12RB1	rs436857 (coding)	SSc	42
B cell-specific regulator of intracellular calcium storage	BANK1	rs10516487 (coding)	dcSSc and interstitial lung disease	58
Subunit of the telomerase enzyme	TERT	rs34094720 (coding)	dcSSc and interstitial lung disease	58
Ubiquitin-editing enzyme involved in TNF signalling	TNFAIP3	rs58905141 (intergenic)	Pro-fibrotic responses in fibroblasts	53
Protein involved in vesicular trafficking and autophagosome formation	ATG5	rs9373839 (intronic)	SSc	24
Protein that mediates DNA cleavage	DNASE1L3	rs35677470 (coding)	ACA-positive SSc	24,52
Cell adhesion and co-stimulatory molecule found on T cells and natural killer cells	CD2	rs624988 (intergenic)	ACA-positive SSc	50
ATPase with phospholipid- transporting functions	ATP8B4	rs55687265 (coding)	SSc	56
Extracellular matrix components	COL4A3	rs55816283 (coding)	dcSSc	58
	COL4A4	rs200450557 (intronic)	dcSSc and interstitial lung disease	58
	COL5A2	rs116298748 (coding)	dcSSc	58
	COL22A1	rs72727814 (coding)	dcSSc	58
	COL13A1	rs41277962 (coding)	dcSSc	58
	CTGF	G-945C (coding)	Pulmonary fibrosis in SSc	152
A kinase associated with IL-1 signalling	IRAK1	rs1059702 (coding)	Pulmonary fibrosis in SSc	152
Protection from SSc				
MHC class II	HLA-DR	DRB1*13:02	SSc	28
		DRB1*14:06	SSc	28
	HLA-DQ	DQB1*03:01	SSc	27,28
		DQB1*03:01	SSc	28
		DQ5-DR1	SSc progression	30
		DPB1*02:01	SSc	28

ACA, anti-centromere antibody; ATA, anti-telomere antibody; dcSSc, diffuse cutaneous SSc; SSc, systemic sclerosis.

concentration of IL-12, a cytokine involved in the regulation and differentiation of T cells towards a T helper 1 (T_H1) cell phenotype, is also increased in patients with SSc and might serve as a marker for disease activity⁴⁰. The results of genetic association studies have revealed several IL-12-related loci to be associated with susceptibility to SSc, including the rs3790567 SNP in *IL12RB2* (REF.⁴¹) and the rs436857 SNP in the promoter region of *IL12RB1* (REF.⁴²), emphasizing the suggested role of the IL-12 pathway in the pathogenesis of SSc. Moreover, *STAT4*, which encodes a transcription factor that is involved in IL-12 signalling, was identified and confirmed as an SSc risk factor in several studies^{34,43,44}.

Interestingly, most of the genetic variants identified in SSc overlap with those implicated in other autoimmune diseases, such as RA, SLE or Sjögren syndrome. For instance, associations with *STAT4* have been found in at least six other autoimmune diseases^{45–48}, and associations with *IRF5* have also been found in patients with SLE and patients with multiple sclerosis^{48,49}. In 2016, *CD2* was identified as a novel risk factor for SSc in a European cohort⁵⁰, adding yet another genetic risk factor to the list of those shared between SSc and RA. Overall, these gene variants seem likely to be involved in processes that are linked to autoimmune diseases in general rather than just one particular disease.

Other genes that are associated with SSc are involved in extracellular matrix (ECM) deposition, apoptosis or autophagy (TABLE 1). The results of two meta-analyses^{35,43} of GWASs revealed SNPs in ATG5, which encodes a protein involved in autophagosome elongation, to be associated with SSc. These findings were confirmed by analysis of Immunochip data²⁴, suggesting that the autophagy process is important in SSc. DNASE1L3 encodes a protein in the deoxyribonuclease 1 family that mediates the breakdown of DNA during apoptosis⁵¹. The rs35677470 SNP in DNASE1L3 was associated with ACA-positive patients with SSc in two Immunochip studies^{24,52} and represents one of the most statistically significant non-HLA genetic associations reported in SSc. Notably, two 2016 studies have highlighted interactions between genes and environmental factors in SSc^{53,54}. A strong association has been found between the previously identified rs58905141 SNP in TNFAIP3, a gene encoding a ubiquitin-editing enzyme involved in TNF-mediated immune responses, and silica-induced pro-fibrotic responses in fibroblasts⁵³, and exposure to certain solvents seems to be a risk factor for the development of SSc, particularly in men⁵⁴.

Although analysis of GWAS and Immunochip data has provided crucial information that has helped to shape our understanding of SSc pathogenesis, the authors of these studies focused only on common variants. By contrast, next-generation sequencing techniques have enabled whole-genome sequencing, as well as regional genomic sequencing, such as whole-exome sequencing (WES) of gene coding regions. WES offers a quick and cost-effective platform to identify rare coding variants⁵⁵. In the first WES study of SSc, the authors identified variants of *ATP8B4*, a gene encoding an ATPase enzyme involved in the translocation of phospholipids in the cell membrane, as a novel genetic risk factor for the disease⁵⁶, although

this association was not confirmed in a follow-up study57. In another WES study, the authors identified 68 new genes associated with SSc58. Consistent with the results of previous GWASs⁵⁹, the results of this study⁵⁸ confirmed a variant of BANK1, a gene encoding a B cell-specific scaffold protein involved in calcium storage, as a candidate risk factor for dcSSc, as well as variants in other genes previously implicated in SSc pathogenesis, such as IRF5. In addition, newly identified genetic variants associated with SSc were located in the ECM-related pathway, which is crucial for the fibrotic characteristics of dcSSc⁵⁸. Although WES is the most popular method to detect rare coding variants in autoimmune diseases, the decreasing costs of whole-genome sequencing will enable the sequencing of both the non-coding and coding regions of the genome in the future. Moreover, next-generation sequencing techniques could also be used to improve the diagnosis of rare autoimmune diseases by providing clinicians with more accurate genetic information.

Epigenetic modifications in SSc

As previously mentioned, rapid progress has been made in outlining the genomic landscape of SSc. Continued refinement of this developing map and integration with GWAS and transcriptomic data will be an essential component of a systems medicine approach to the personalized treatment of patients with SSc. However, genetic predisposition only partially explains disease onset in SSc, suggesting that epigenetic processes (BOX 1; FIG. 1) could be involved in the pathogenesis of SSc. The literature suggests that immune cells from patients with SSc retain a pro-inflammatory phenotype that persists for days after being taken out of their original environment^{60,61}. In particular CXC-chemokine ligand 4 (CXCL4), an important chemokine in SSc pathogenesis^{60,62}, could be essential for the aberrant imprinting of immune cells at an epigenetic level63, thereby potentially triggering the pro-inflammatory and pro-fibrotic responses required for disease manifestations. However, the cell-specific expression patterns of proteins that regulate epigenetic processes in patients with SSc at distinct stages of the disease are not fully understood. In this section, we discuss insights gained over the past 4 years into epigenetic modifications associated with the pathophysiology of SSc.

DNA methylation

Fibroblasts. Over the past few years, two studies have confirmed that an altered global hypomethylation state contributes to the pathological phenotype of fibroblasts from patients with SSc^{64,65}. The results of a large-scale DNA methylation analysis revealed 916 CpG sites in dermal fibroblasts from patients with lcSSc and 1,653 CpG sites in fibroblasts from patients with dcSSc that were hypomethylated compared with sites in fibroblasts from healthy individuals, as well as a marked increase in differentially methylated genes in fibroblasts from patients with dcSSc⁶⁴. Interestingly, although some of the genes associated with SSc pathology, such as *COL23A1*, *COL4A2*, *RUNX2*, *RUNX3*, *ITGA9* and *ADAM12*, were commonly hypomethylated in both lcSSc and dcSSc fibroblasts, only 6% of the differentially methylated



Fig. 2 | Genetic and epigenetic influences on the pathogenesis of systemic sclerosis. The figure highlights the genetic and epigenetic findings in systemic sclerosis (SSc) made over the past 4 years. Selected examples are described. **a** | In the blood, circulating immune cells and microRNA (miRNA)-containing extracellular vesicles contribute to the pro-inflammatory and autoimmune responses that are the hallmarks of SSc. In plasmacytoid dendritic cells (pDCs), a type I interferon (IFN) signature is potentially sustained by both genetic and epigenetic alterations that regulate interferon regulatory factor (IRF) proteins. Together, these alterations promote IFNa secretion, which in turn activates multiple immune cell subsets. High concentrations of CXC-chemokine ligand 4 (CXCL4) in the circulation, in part produced by pDCs, could possibly function as an imprinting factor during the differentiation of monocytes into monocyte-derived dendritic cells (moDCs) and further increase the inflammatory responses of the latter. In T cells, both the hypomethylation of DNA at IFN genes and the genetic risk associated with the signal transducer and activator of transcription 4 (STAT4)-IL-12 pathway could increase type I and type II IFN responses. T cells from patients with SSc are epigenetically imprinted to have increased amounts of CD11a at the cell surface. Interaction of CD11a with intercellular adhesion molecule 1 (ICAM1) on B cells could be involved in sustaining autoantibody production. Circulating miRNAs in extracellular vesicles, such as miR-483, can regulate pro-fibrotic and anti-fibrotic responses in endothelial cells. **b** | In fibroblasts from patients with SSc or fibroblasts exposed to transforming growth factor- β (TGF β), the diminished activity of sirtuins (SIRTs)1-3 and the epigenetic-mediated repression of PARP1 sustain the transcription factor SMAD3 signalling pathway and collagen and α-smooth muscle actin (aSMA) synthesis. Together with the decreased activity of the KLF5-FLI1 transcription factor complex at the CTGF promoter region, these alterations initiate myofibroblast differentiation processes. Additional epigenetic changes in the FOSL2 promoter region, genetic variants in collagen genes and aberrant miR-202-3p, miR-155 and miR-135b regulation further contribute to collagen release and altered extracellular matrix (ECM) deposition processes. Oxidative DNA damage leads to the recruitment of the transcription factors AP1, ATF3 and histone deacetylase 3 (HDAC3) to the WIF1 promoter region, favouring Wnt signalling and collagen production. Additionally, downregulation of miR-150 in fibroblasts from patients with SSc could lead to sustained integrin expression, which could, in turn, also amplify TGF \$\beta\$ signalling. CTGF, connective tissue growth factor; IL13R, IL-13 receptor; ITGB3, β3 integrin; JMJD3, jumonji domain-containing protein 3; MeCP2, methyl-CpG-binding protein 2; PARP1, poly(ADP-ribose) polymerase 1; PDGF, platelet-derived growth factor; TGFBR, TGFB receptor; TSIX, XIST antisense RNA.

> genes were shared between the two SSc subgroups. Various collagen and catenin family genes were remarkably hypomethylated in fibroblasts from patients with dcSSc compared with those from patients with lcSSc (Supplementary Table 1). Additionally, distinct integrin genes were hypomethylated in fibroblasts from patients with dcSSc⁶⁴, which could potentially contribute to the sustained activation of transforming growth factor- β (TGF β) that occurs in these patients^{66,67}. No differences in the methylation pattern of FLI1, DKK1 and SFRP1, genes previously described as being hypermethylated in patients with SSc and negatively regulating fibrotic processes68, were detected in fibroblasts from either of the two SSc subsets⁶⁴. However, genes encoding downstream targets of DKK1 and SFRP1 in the Wnt signalling pathway, such as CTNNB1 and AXIN2, were hypomethylated in fibroblasts from patients with dcSSc⁶⁴. In another study69, altered DNA methylation and histone acetylation at KLF5, which encodes a transcription factor that works synergistically with the transcription factor FLI1 to modulate fibrotic processes, contributed to impaired KLF5-FLI1 activity in fibroblasts from patients with SSc. Taken together, these results support the idea that heterogeneous, yet overlapping, epigenetic mechanisms could be behind the altered phenotype of fibroblasts in SSc (FIG. 2b).

The results of a 2018 study⁷⁰ showed that hypermethylation of *PARP1*, which encodes the negative regulator of fibroblast activation poly(ADP-ribose) polymerase 1 (PARP1), occurred in fibroblasts and keratinocytes from patients with SSc. In this study⁷⁰, the suppressed expression of PARP1 that occurs in fibroblasts from patients with SSc was mimicked in vitro by the long-term exposure of fibroblasts to TGF β , which acted as an imprinting factor, thereby causing increased DNA methylation in the *PARP1* promoter region. As reduced expression of PARP1 was slightly more pronounced in fibroblasts from patients with dcSSc than in those from patients with lcSSc, it is plausible that increased TGF β signalling (or increased exposure to TGF β), could be one of the driving forces behind the different methylation patterns observed in the two disease subgroups^{66,67}.

Although altered DNA methylation was previously associated with reduced DNA (cytosine-5)-methyltransferase 1 (DNMT1) expression in both fibroblasts and T cells^{71,72}, new evidence also suggests a role for ten-eleven translocation methylcytosine dioxygenase (TET) enzymes, which convert 5-methylcytosine (5mC) into 5-hydroxymethylcytosine (5hmC) and catalyse the initial step of DNA demethylation (FIG. 1b). In-depth evaluation of 5mC and 5hmC activity in SSc is still lacking, as a complete understanding of DNA demethvlation processes will be made possible only by novel technologies that enable the sensitive quantification of these marks⁷³. Nevertheless, total 5hmC was shown to be increased in skin from patients with SSc65. In line with this finding, TET1 mRNA was increased in fibroblasts from patients with SSc and was modestly regulated by hypoxic conditions65. Notably, TET1 was also consistently upregulated in the lungs of bleomycin-treated mice and has been proposed to be a primary target for therapy targeting epigenetic processes in idiopathic pulmonary fibrosis (IPF)74. By contrast, TET1 was not differentially expressed in dermal fibroblasts from patients with SSc compared with those from healthy individuals; however, a prominent upregulation of the DNA methylation binding protein methyl-CpG-binding protein 2 (MeCP2) was noted in fibroblasts from patients with SSc75. MeCP2 was also upregulated in the dermal fibroblasts of patients with dcSSc in a separate study⁷⁶ and is thought to be a key regulator of fibrotic events.

In lung fibroblasts from patients with SSc or IPF, defects in the prostaglandin G/H synthase 2 (PTGS2)– prostaglandin E_2 pathway, an important negative modulator of the fibrotic responses in vivo⁷⁷, were caused by alterations in DNA methylation processes⁷⁸. Reduced expression of transcriptional and immune response regulator (TC1), a positive regulator of PTGS2 expression⁷⁹, was specifically dependent upon methylation in these cells, as treatment with DNMT inhibitors but not with histone deacetylase (HDAC) inhibitors restored TC1 expression to physiological levels⁷⁸.

Immune cells. Similar to dermal fibroblasts, general hypomethylation has been found in the whole blood and in the T cells of patients with SSC^{80,81}. In a genome-wide DNA methylation study⁸¹, a total of 696 and 2,283 unique sites in CD4⁺ and CD8⁺ T cells, respectively, were differentially methylated in patients with SSc compared with healthy individuals. Three-hundred and thirty sites were differentially methylated in both

Box 1 | Epigenetic modifications

In eukaryotes, DNA is located within the nucleus and is highly compacted into chromatin, a complex of DNA and proteins that forms chromosomes. Unwinding the chromatin reveals sites at which a variety of epigenetic changes influence gene transcription without altering the DNA sequence. Chromatin condensation and relaxation, associated with transcriptional silencing and initiation, respectively, are regulated by the activity of histone-modifying enzymes. The most common histone modifications are methylation and acetylation (FIG. 1a). Access to the DNA by the transcriptional machinery is influenced by the addition of methyl groups at sites with high amounts of cytosine and quanine, known as CpG islands. Although predominantly occurring in gene promoter regions, DNA methylation exists in diverse genomic contexts, including in regulatory elements and gene bodies, and is catalysed by DNA methyltransferases (FIG. 1b). Additional layers of epigenetic control are mediated by RNA molecules. Long non-coding RNAs are transcribed RNA molecules with a length of ~200 nucleotides that have a wide range of functions (FIG. 1c), whereas microRNAs are short RNAs of 20-25 nucleotides that bind to complementary sequences in target mRNAs and control post-transcriptional events (FIG. 1d).

cell types, which remarkably showed the same patterns of either hypomethylation or hypermethylation. Independently of the subtype of T cell analysed, hypomethylation was predominantly found in type I interferon-related genes, such as *IFI44L*, *IFITM1*, *MX1*, *PARP9* and *EIF2AK2* (REF.⁸¹).

Hypomethylation of the promoter region of ITGAL (which encodes CD11a, a cell-surface molecule involved in T cell co-stimulation⁸²) was also detected in CD4⁺ T cells from patients with SSc and inversely correlated with patient disease activity scores83. Reduced methylation of ITGAL and the association between DNA methylation and a type I interferon signature have similarly been described as common hallmarks of CD4⁺ T cells from patients with SLE^{84,85}. The results of DNA methylation analysis of whole blood from patients with SSc or SLE reinforced results that had been previously gained from isolated CD4+ T cells. In this study⁸⁰, FOXP3 was hypermethylated and TNFSF7 (encoding CD70) was hypomethylated in both diseases compared with healthy individuals. Similarly, single-target screening of IRF7, a type I interferon transcription factor associated with the production of autoantibodies in SSc⁸⁶, revealed hypomethylation in peripheral blood mononuclear cells from patients with SSc, results that support the increased expression of IRF7 in both lcSSc and dcSSc87. Conflicting results have arisen with respect to FOXP3, which has been shown to be hypermethylated and downregulated in CD4⁺ T cells from patients with SSc⁸⁸ yet to be hypomethylated in total peripheral blood mononuclear cells in a different study⁸⁹. Although this second study⁸⁹ demonstrates global alterations in regulatory and inflammatory T cell subsets in patients with SSc, it also highlights the limitations of examining epigenetic changes using mixed cell populations rather than isolated cell subsets.

Taken together, the results of different studies aiming to map differential DNA methylation in SSc indicate that alterations in canonical pathways regulating fibrosis and immune cell activation can be imprinted at the DNA methylation level (FIG. 2; Supplementary Table 1). Furthermore, as the methylation signatures in dcSSc and lcSSc are only partly overlapping, it is possible that epigenetic divergences are at the root of these two disease subgroups.

Histone post-translational modifications

Aberrant gene expression as a result of histone post-translational modifications is known to be involved in the pathogenesis of SSc¹³ (Supplementary Table 2). Histone acetylation and methylation (FIG. 1a) are currently the most commonly described epigenetic modifications in the field of SSc research; therefore, elucidating the role of histone-modifying enzymes in this disease could provide insights into novel therapeutic strategies. For example, the expression of the histone deacetylase genes HDAC4 and HDAC5 are increased in endothelial cells from patients with SSc compared with those from healthy individuals, whereas HDAC6 expression is decreased⁹⁰. Many genes that are regulated by the action of HDAC5 are involved in angiogenesis90, suggesting that the overexpression of HDAC5 contributes to disrupted angiogenic processes in SSc.

Histone acetylation. Histone acetylation is associated with a more open chromatin structure, enabling the binding of the transcriptional machinery and thereby promoting gene transcription. The potential effect of chromatin deacetylation in SSc was highlighted by a study in which the expression of KLF5 was decreased in fibroblasts from patients with SSc compared with fibroblasts from healthy individuals69. The degree of histone 3 (H3) and H4 acetylation at the promoter of this gene was lower in the fibroblasts from patients with SSc than in the healthy control fibroblasts, and treatment with HDAC inhibitors or DNMT inhibitors recovered KLF5 expression⁶⁹. Similar epigenetic repression was observed for *FLI1* (REF.⁶⁹), validating the results of a previous study⁹¹. The combined downregulation of these two transcription factors is thought to be important in the pathogenesis of SSc, as mice with double heterozygous deficiency of KLF5 and FLI1 produced autoantibodies and developed spontaneous skin and lung fibrosis⁶⁹. KLF5 and FLI1 synergistically repressed the expression of connective tissue growth factor (CTGF), which is a known regulator of tissue remodelling and fibrosis. These findings suggest that the epigenetic repression of KLF5 and FLI1 in fibroblasts from patients with SSc is likely to underlie the increased CTGF expression observed in these cells69.

The sirtuins (class III HDACs involved in cell survival and inflammation) SIRT1, SIRT3 and SIRT7 are regulators of SMAD transcription factor-TGFB signalling in fibroblasts and have been implicated in the pathogenesis of SSc⁹²⁻⁹⁷. The expression of these sirtuins is generally decreased in dermal and pulmonary fibroblasts from patients with SSc. In two studies93,94, the decrease in SIRT1 correlated inversely with the modified Rodnan skin score (mRSS), a measure of disease activity. The results of another study⁹² suggested that the decrease in SIRT1 was greater in patients with dcSSc and patients with pulmonary fibrosis than in patients with lcSSc and patients who did not have pulmonary fibrosis, respectively. Activation of SIRT1 with either resveratrol or the more specific activators SA3 and SRT1720 led to a less fibrotic and inflammatory phenotype in both cultured fibroblasts and in the bleomycin-induced mouse model of SSc^{92,94,98}. Similarly, in vitro activation of SIRT3 with hexafluoro in fibroblasts inhibited the activation of SMAD2, SMAD3 and STAT3 upon TGF β stimulation, and mice treated with hexafluoro showed attenuation of bleomycin-induced fibrosis in the lung and skin⁹⁷.

Histone methylation. Histone methylation can result in either increased or suppressed transcription of nearby genes. Global levels of H3K27me3, a known repressive mark, were lower in CD4⁺ T cells from patients with SSc than in CD4⁺ T cells from healthy individuals⁹⁹. This decrease in expression inversely correlated with an increase in expression of *JMJD3* (also known as *KDM6B*), which encodes the histone demethylase jumonji domain-containing protein 3 (JMJD3), whereas the expression of genes encoding other histone demethvlases, such as UTX (also known as KDM6A) and EZH2, was unchanged⁹⁹. This same pattern of increased expression of IMID3 and unchanged expression of UTX was also found in fibroblasts from patients with SSc (compared with fibroblasts from healthy individuals), although the number of H3K27me3-positive fibroblasts in the skin of patients with SSc compared with in healthy skin was increased rather than decreased¹⁰⁰. Increased concentrations of JMJD3 caused reduced H3K27me3 at the promoter of FOSL2, which encodes the transcription factor FRA2 thought to be involved in regulating ECM production, the expression of which is increased in fibroblasts from patients with SSc100. Stimulation of fibroblasts from healthy individuals with TGFB caused the upregulation of JMJD3 expression in a SMAD3dependent manner and a general decrease of H3K27me3 (REF. $^{95}\!).$ Treating rat fibroblasts with TGF also led to an accumulation of the activating histone mark H3K4me3 at the promoters of COL1A1, COL1A2 and ACTA2, genes encoding the ECM components collagen I and II and α -smooth muscle actin (α SMA)¹⁰¹. Altogether, these results show that TGFβ-SMAD signalling pathways, which are implicated in the pathogenic ECM production that occurs in SSc (FIG. 2b), are closely linked to targetable epigenetic histone-modifying enzymes.

Non-coding RNAs

MicroRNAs in immune cells and fibroblasts. To date, a limited number of studies have investigated microRNA (miRNA) expression changes in immune cells from patients with $SSc^{102,103}$ (TABLE 2). For example, the role of miRNAs in plasmacytoid dendritic cells (pDCs) from patients with SSc was addressed for the first time in a 2017 study¹⁰². The results of this study suggested that increased levels of miR-618 in pDCs lead to decreased expression of IRF8 in patients with SSc. Overexpression of miR-618 inhibited pDC differentiation and activation and led to increased IFNa release upon Toll-like receptor 9 (TLR9) stimulation¹⁰². The function of miRNAs in the development of fibrosis, however, has been addressed in greater detail. The previously identified anti-fibrotic miRNA miR-29a13 has now also been shown to reduce the expression of TGFβ-activated kinase 1 binding protein 1 (TAB1), a protein involved in the downregulation of tissue inhibitor metalloproteinase 1 (TIMP1) expression and collagen degradation¹⁰⁴. In addition to its anti-fibrotic properties, miR-29a is thought to modulate apoptosis¹⁰⁵.

Fibroblasts from patients with SSc that overexpressed miR-29a had reduced amounts of the anti-apoptotic proteins BCL-2 and BCL- X_L and were susceptible to cell death¹⁰⁵. Inhibition of the pro-fibrotic miRNA miR-21, which is upregulated in SSc¹³, also increased apoptosis in fibroblasts from patients with SSc¹⁰⁶. These results¹⁰⁶ confirm miR-29a and miR-21 as candidate molecules for use or targeting to reduce fibrosis.

Upregulation of miR-202-3p in the skin of patients with SSc contributed to the suppression of matrix metalloproteinase 1 (MMP1), a protein known to be decreased in the skin of these patients¹⁰⁷. Specifically, miR-202-3p was shown to bind to the 3' untranslated region of MMP1 mRNA and to repress its expression. Expression of miR-202-3p could be induced in a time-dependent and dose-dependent manner by TGFβ stimulation¹⁰⁷, suggesting a role for this pro-fibrotic cytokine in the regulation of miR-202-3p expression. Yet another miRNA that is present at increased frequencies in the skin and lungs of patients with SSc108,109, as well as in mice with bleomycin-induced skin fibrosis¹⁰⁸, is miR-155. In a 2017 study110, miR-155 was shown to be a positive regulator of NOD-, LRR- and pyrin domain-containing 3 (NLRP3) inflammasome-mediated collagen synthesis in fibroblasts, a pathway that had been previously implicated in fibrosis in SSc¹¹¹. Collagen production in fibroblasts from patients with SSc was further shown to be induced by the activation of STAT6-dependent IL-13 signalling and the concomitant suppression of miR135b expression75. Concentrations of this miRNA were also reduced in the serum and monocytes of patients with SSc75. The authors of this study75 proposed that the expression of miR-135b could be regulated by methylation events in dermal fibroblasts. Furthermore, decreased concentrations of miR-193b were present in fibroblasts and skin from patients with SSc¹¹². This decrease in miR-193b promoted the expression of urokinase-type plasminogen activator (uPA), a protein that induced the proliferation of vascular smooth muscle cells and inhibited apoptosis¹¹², suggesting that miR-193b might contribute to proliferative vasculopathy in SSc.

Circulating microRNAs. Circulating miRNAs could potentially serve as clinical biomarkers in patients with SSc. In fact, the direct measurement of miRNA concentrations in body fluids such as serum or plasma is already proving to be a useful tool to monitor disease manifestations and progression¹¹³. Building on the work of previous publications¹³, researchers are now evaluating a broad range of circulating miRNAs in SSc. A 2015 study, in which the expression of 45 circulating miRNAs was examined in plasma from patients with SSc, identified a network of 21 miRNAs that could discriminate patients with SSc from healthy individuals and patients with SLE¹¹⁴. The miRNA profile that could discriminate between healthy individuals and patients with SSc was characterized by miRNAs from the miR-17~92 cluster and by miR-16, miR-223 and miR-638114. In a separate study, the plasma miRNA profile of patients with SSc was correlated with disease phenotypes; miR-223, miR-181b, miR-342-3p and miR-184 were differentially expressed between patients with lcSSc and those with dcSSc, and the expression of miR-409-3p, miR-184, miR-92a, miR-29a

MicroRNA

A short non-coding RNA of 18–24 nucleotides in length that regulates gene expression by binding to its complementary sequence within a target mRNA.

Table 2 Non-coding RNAs in systemic sclerosis						
Non-coding RNA	Expression level in SSc	Tissue or cell type	Target mRNA	Implication	Refs	
miRNA						
miR-618	1	pDCs	IRF8	Overexpressed miR-618 reduced pDC development and enhanced IFNα release upon TLR9 stimulation	102	
miR-193b	Ļ	Skin tissue and dermal fibroblasts	uPA	miR-193b induced proliferative vasculopathy in human pulmonary artery smooth muscle cells	112	
miR-202-3p	↑	Skin tissue and dermal fibroblasts	MMP1	miR-202-3p induced pro-fibrotic effects by targeting MMP1	107	
miR-155	1	Dermal and lung fibroblasts	ND	miR-155 is induced by inflammasome activation and regulated inflammasome-driven collagen production	110	
miR-155	1	Human skin tissue and skin tissue from bleomycin-treated mice	CK1α and SHIP1	miR-155 regulated Wnt–β-catenin and AKT signalling pathways by targeting CK1α and SHIP1 in a mouse model of SSc	108	
miR-155 and miR-182	Î	Lung tissue	ND	 miR-155 levels correlated with progressive SSc ILD miR-155-knockout mice with bleomycin-induced disease had reduced lung fibrosis and reduced arginase 1 and TIMP1 production compared with wild-type mice 	109	
miR-130b	1	Human skin tissue and dermal fibroblasts; skin tissue from bleomycin-treated mice	PPARγ	miR-130b induced pro-fibrotic effect via regulation of PPAR γ expression	153	
miR-483-5p	↑	Serum and serum exosomes	Fibrosis-related genes	miR-483-5p overexpression in fibroblasts and endothelial cells dysregulated the expression of fibrosis-related genes, such as those for type I and type IV collagen	116	
miR-4458 and miR-18a	↑,↓	Dermal fibroblasts	Type I collagen and CTGF	IL-23 and TGFβ signalling mediated the upregulation of miR-4458 and the downregulation of miR-18a expression. In turn, miR-4458 and miR-18a regulated type I collagen and CTGF expression, respectively	154	
miR-135b	↓	Human dermal fibroblasts, serum and monocytes; skin tissue from bleomycin-treated mice	STAT6	miR-135b regulated IL-13-mediated collagen production via STAT6 signalling	75	
miR-638, miR-181b, miR-29b-3p, miR-590-5p and miR-150	1	Plasma	ND	Circulating plasma miRNA profiles discriminated patients with SSc from healthy individuals	114	
miR-106a, miR-16, miR-223, miR-92a, miR-17, miR-20a, miR-146a, miR-146b, miR-192-5p, miR-24, miR-221, miR-142-3p and miR-342-3p	ţ	Plasma	ND	Circulating plasma miRNA profiles discriminated patients with SSc from healthy individuals	114	
miR-181b and miR-184	1	Plasma	ND	Circulating miRNA profile discriminated patients with lcSSc from those with dcSSc	115	
miR-223 and miR-342-3p	Ţ	Plasma	ND	Circulating miRNA profile discriminated patients with lcSSc from those with dcSSc	115	
let7g-5p, miR17-5p, miR-21-5p, miR-23b-5p, mir29a-3p, miR-150-5p, miR-155-5p, miR-215-5p and miR-503-5p	↑	Serum exosomes	ND	Distinct pro-fibrotic and anti-fibrotic miRNAs contained in exosomes from patients with SSc compared with exosomes from healthy individuals	118	
let7a-5p, miR-92a-3p, miR-125b-5p, miR-133a-3p, miR-140-5p, miR-145-5p, miR-146a-5p, miR-196a-5p, miR-200a-3p, miR-200b-3p and miR-223-3p	Ţ	Serum exosomes	ND	Distinct pro-fibrotic and anti-fibrotic miRNAs contained in exosomes from patients with SSc compared with exosomes from healthy individuals	118	

Table 2 (cont.) | Non-coding RNAs in systemic sclerosis

······································					
Non-coding RNA	Expression level in SSc	Tissue or cell type	Target mRNA	Implication	Refs
miRNA (cont.)					
miR-142-3p	1	Dermal fibroblast exosomes	ND	SSc fibroblasts released increased amounts of exosomes, compared with fibroblasts from healthy individuals, that stimulated type I collagen expression	117
miR-150 and miR-196a	Ţ	Dermal fibroblast exosomes	ND	SSc fibroblasts released increased amounts of exosomes, compared with fibroblasts from healthy individuals, that stimulated type I collagen expression	117
miR-5196	1	Monocytes and serum	FRA2	miR-5196 mimic caused inhibition of FRA2 and TIMP1 production in monocytes upon DZNep and TLR8 stimulation	103
lncRNA					
CTBP1-AS2 and AGAP2-AS1	1	Skin tissue	ND	Differentially expressed lncRNAs in SSc skin	119
OTUD6B-AS1	\downarrow	Skin tissue	ND	Differentially expressed lncRNAs in SSc skin	119
TSIX	1	Skin tissue, dermal fibroblasts and serum	Type I collagen	TSIX regulates type I collagen expression	120

 $CK1\alpha$, casein kinase 1 α ; CTGF, connective tissue growth factor; dcSSc, diffuse cutaneous SSc; ILD, interstitial lung disease; IRF8, interferon regulatory factor 8; lcSSc, limited cutaneous SSc; lncRNA, long non-coding RNA; miRNA, microRNA; MMP, matrix metalloproteinase; ND, not defined; pDC, plasmacytoid dendritic cells; SHIP1, SH2 domain-containing inositol phosphatase 1; SSc, systemic sclerosis; STAT6, signal transducer and activator of transcription 6; TGF β , transforming growth factor- β ; TIMP1, tissue inhibitor metalloproteinase 1; TLR, Toll-like receptor; uPA, urokinase-type plasminogen activator.

and miR-101 correlated with an SSc autoantibody signature¹¹⁵. Moreover, the results of a comprehensive screening of 758 circulating miRNAs revealed 30 miRNAs that are altered in the serum of patients with SSc compared with that of healthy individuals¹¹⁶. The results of this study¹¹⁶ also demonstrated the consistent upregulation of miR-483-5p from the earliest stages of SSc.

A growing body of evidence has revealed an important role for extracellular vesicles, including exosomes, and their miRNA content in SSc. The amount of exosomes is decreased in the serum of patients with SSc compared with healthy individuals¹¹⁷, and these exosomes contain distinct pro-fibrotic and anti-fibrotic miRNAs¹¹⁸. Interestingly, exosomes from patients with SSc induced a pro-fibrotic phenotype in healthy fibroblasts in vitro¹¹⁸, suggesting that exosomes might mediate the cellular crosstalk that is necessary to initiate pro-fibrotic events. In line with these findings¹¹⁸, circulating miR-483-5p, which is upregulated in patients with SSc, was also enclosed in serum exosomes, and overexpression of miR-483-5p in healthy fibroblasts and endothelial cells altered fibrosis-related gene expression¹¹⁶. Taken together, these studies¹¹⁸ indicate that miRNAs present in exosomes might contribute to the pathogenesis of SSc (FIG. 2).

Long non-coding RNA

A long non-coding RNA ~200 nucleotides in length that functions as a molecular scaffold to regulate gene expression at the transcriptional, post-transcriptional and epigenetic levels. (lncRNA) in SSc is still poorly understood. RNA sequencing of skin tissue from patients with SSc revealed 676 lncRNAs that were differentially expressed between patients and healthy individuals¹¹⁹. A substantial fraction of the lncRNAs identified were antisense lncRNAs, which might function as co-regulators of their coding sense genes. Three antisense lncRNAs, *CTBP1-AS2*, *OTUD6B-AS1* and *AGAP2-AS1*, were further validated

Long non-coding RNAs. The role of long non-coding RNA

and their expression correlated strongly with the expression of their paired sense genes¹¹⁹. Another study showed that the lncRNA *TSIX* was upregulated in dermal fibroblasts from patients with SSc and was involved in the regulation of type I collagen production via mRNA stabilization¹²⁰. Furthermore, concentrations of *TSIX* were increased in the serum of patients with SSc, leading the authors to propose *TSIX* as a potential disease biomarker¹²⁰. These initial studies highlight the need for the further investigation of lncRNAs in SSc (TABLE 2).

Targeting epigenetic processes

Although the results of many studies have indicated that a number of epigenetic regulatory proteins have altered expression in SSc, a more comprehensive approach is needed to fully take advantage of and guide the development of epigenomic pharmacological inhibitors and agonists. Of particular importance are studies aimed at understanding how the epigenetic code is either aberrantly written or read at the molecular level in SSc, which are currently lagging behind those in other rheumatic diseases such as RA¹²¹. An overview of epigenetic compounds that have been investigated in the context of SSc and in experimental models of fibrosis is included in TABLE 3. In the following section, the discussion is divided by therapeutic target.

DNA methylation

Two DNMT inhibitors that share similar mechanisms of action, 5-azacytidine and 5-aza-2'-deoxycytidine (collectively referred to as 5-aza) are, to date, the most commonly used compounds for investigations into the therapeutic targeting of DNA methylation in fibrosis.

Treatment with 5-aza is known to have a beneficial effect on dermal fibroblasts derived from patients with

SSC^{68,122}. In particular, treatment of these cells with 5-aza upregulated the expression of both KLF5, a transcription factor known to modulate fibrotic responses⁶⁹, and PARP1, an enzyme involved in the regulation of SMAD-mediated transcription⁷⁰, and suppressed the expression of collagen genes⁷⁵. In pulmonary fibroblasts from patients with SSc, 5-aza treatment restored PTGS2 and prostaglandin E_2 production, and in TGF β -stimulated pulmonary fibroblasts from mice, it attenuated *COL1A1* and *ACTA2* expression⁷⁸.

The outcomes of the studies addressing the effects of 5-aza treatment on T cells are less conclusive than those in studies on fibroblasts with regard to the potential therapeutic benefit of this compound. In fact, although previously shown to reduce *FOXP3* methylation and to increase the frequency of regulatory T cells among CD4⁺ T cells in patients with SSc⁸⁸, treatment with 5-aza was subsequently shown to cause the hypomethylation of *ITGAL* and thereby induce *ITGAL* expression in CD4⁺ T cells from healthy individuals, causing a pro-fibrotic phenotype in fibroblasts and immune responses in T cells and B cells in co-culture experiments⁸³. Similarly, exposure of CD4⁺ T cells from healthy individuals to 5-aza increased the percentage of CD3⁺CD4⁺CD28⁺CD11a^{hi}KIR⁺ T cells, a subset that is increased in patients with dcSSc, active SLE or active RA¹²³.

5-Aza-mediated triggering of autoreactive processes in the T cells of healthy individuals has been well documented¹²⁴; however, firm conclusions as to the potential disadvantages of the use of 5-aza in SSc are limited as only a few studies have utilized T cells from patients with SSc^{83,123}. Most studies have utilized single-cell subsets, but the use of 5-aza in systems that might more closely reflect the complexity of SSc, such as organoids, tissue explants from patients or animal models of fibrosis, would be preferable. For example, in vivo, intraperitoneal injections of 5-aza resulted in reduced skin fibrosis in bleomycin-treated mice⁶⁸.

Histone post-translational modification

Therapies aimed at epigenetic processes that attempt to confer balance to dysregulated histone modifications are currently under investigation. For example, the HDAC inhibitor trichostatin A (TSA) restored the expression of Wnt inhibitory factor 1 (WIF1), an inhibitory regulator of Wnt signalling that is suppressed in fibroblasts from patients with SSc125. In vivo, TSA reduced disease in a bleomycin-induced mouse model of skin fibrosis by suppressing β -catenin, type I collagen and α SMA expression¹²⁵, results that were in line with previous findings¹²⁶. However, in a bleomycin-induced pulmonary fibrosis model, the anti-fibrotic properties of TSA were limited¹²⁷. Although the expression of Sftpc, which is necessary for correct alveolar function, and the epithelial marker Cdh1 were clearly increased, no reduction in expression of the mesenchymal gene VIM was observed and epithelial-to-mesenchymal transition was not inhibited in vitro. Additionally, in both the inflammatory and fibrotic phases of bleomycin treatment in vivo, TSA did not reduce immune cell infiltrates in the airspaces, nor did it have a statistically significant anti-fibrotic effect¹²⁷. In line with these findings, the HDAC inhibitor valproic acid induced the production of IL-6, a pro-fibrotic

cytokine, in a paraquat-induced mouse model of pulmonary fibrosis, whereas the histone acetyltransferase (HAT) inhibitor anacardic acid had the opposite effect¹²⁸.

Aberrant regulation of HATs, as previously observed to occur in fibroblasts from patients with SSc129, might have a role in fibrosis. Resveratrol, a nonspecific compound that activates the class III HDAC SIRT1, had anti-fibrotic effects in vitro concomitant with a reduction in HAT p300 activity⁹⁴. Treatment of fibroblasts from patients with SSc with resveratrol resulted in reduced collagen and aSMA expression, and in bleomycin-challenged mice, resveratrol attenuated lung and skin fibrosis^{92,94,98}. However, fibroblast-specific knockout of SIRT1 led to a decrease in skin thickness and a reduced number of myofibroblasts in bleomycin-treated mice93. These contrasting findings might be caused by the well-known off-targets effects of resveratrol¹³⁰, but they might also result from the cell-specific and tissue-specific functions of SIRT1 in fibrosis. The use of selective activators of SIRT1 and/or knockdown technologies, pharmacological treatment strategies (such as therapeutic versus prophylactic models) and treatment timing should be given close attention.

Histone demethylase and histone methyltransferase inhibitors (GSKJ4 and DZNep, respectively) both reduced fibrosis in experimental models^{100,131}. However, although reducing collagen and aSMA expression in bleomycin-challenged lung tissue¹³¹ and displaying protective functions in experimental liver fibrosis¹³², in vitro, DZNep increased the TLR8-mediated production of two pro-fibrotic factors, TIMP1 and FRA2, in monocytes¹⁰³ and induced collagen and aSMA expression in skin fibroblasts co-cultured with TIMP1-producing monocytes¹³³. Furthermore, DZNep has also previously been shown to exacerbate bleomycin-induced skin fibrosis¹³⁴. Taken together, these results might indicate organ-specific functions for DZNep.

Bromodomain and extra-terminal domain (BET) proteins are also critical epigenetic regulators of gene transcription. In fact, BET proteins recognize acetylated lysine residues and therefore have a role in acetylation-mediated transcriptional activation or suppression¹³⁵. Despite not being fully characterized in SSc, BET proteins were shown to modulate fibrotic processes¹³⁶. Further evaluation of BET inhibitors will thus be useful to understand how abrogation of the reading of the epigenetic code can affect pathological processes in SSc.

MicroRNA expression. Candidate miRNAs known to be dysregulated in SSc and in experimental models of fibrosis constitute appealing targets for therapeutic approaches. Topical application of an inhibitor for miR-155, an miRNA upregulated in lesional skin from patients with SSc or morphea (a localized form of scleroderma), suppressed collagen deposition in a bleomycin-induced mouse model of skin fibrosis¹⁰⁸. In addition to possible implications for miR-155 inhibitors as anti-fibrotic compounds, these findings¹⁰⁸ also suggest that delivery of miRNA modulators directly onto the skin surface could be a promising therapeutic strategy that would overcome the undesirable effects of intradermal injection¹³⁷. In another study, an miR-30a mimic was nebulized into

Table 3 Therapies that target epigenetic processes — experimental evidence in systemic sclerosis						
Therapy	Tissue or cell type	Outcome	Refs			
DNMT inhibitor						
Zebularine; 5-aza-2'-deoxycytidine	Lung fibroblasts from patients with SSc and patients with IPF	↑ PTGS2 expression	78			
5-Aza-2'-deoxycytidine	Dermal fibroblasts from patients with SSc and healthy individuals	\uparrow PARP1 and transcription factor KLF5 expression	69,70			
5-Aza-2'-deoxycytidine	$TGF\beta\text{-stimulated}$ mouse lung fibroblasts	 ↓ αSMA and type I collagen expression ↓ Stress fibre formation 	155			
5-Azacytidine	Healthy CD4 ⁺ T cells co-cultured with either PBMCs, B cells or dermal fibroblasts	 ↑ Proliferative response to autologous PBMCs ↑ IgG production ↑ Collagen expression 	83			
5-Azacytidine	PHA-stimulated CD3 ⁺ CD4 ⁺ CD28 ⁺ KIR ⁺ T cells	↑ Percentage of CD11a ⁺ cells	123			
HDAC inhibitor						
TSA	 Dermal fibroblasts from patients with SSc and healthy individuals Mouse skin tissue 	↑ WIF1 expression	125			
TSA	Monocytic cell line	\downarrow Transcription factor FRA2 and TIMP1 expression	133			
TSA	Skin and lung tissue from bleomycin-challenged mice	 ↓ β-catenin, type I collagen and αSMA expression in the skin ↓ Pulmonary fibrosis 	125,127			
Valproic acid	Lung tissue from paraquat-challenged mice	•↑IL-6 expression •↑Pulmonary inflammation	128			
MC1568	TGF β -stimulated dermal fibroblasts	 ↑ Transcription factor NR4A1 expression ↓ Collagen release 	156			
Divalproex sodium ^a	Digital ulcer tissue from patients with SSc	•↓ Digital ulcers •↓ Swelling of fingers	157			
Mycophenolate mofetilª	Skin and lung tissue from patients with SSc	●↓mRSS ●↑Lung function	158-161			
HAT inhibitor						
Anacardic acid	Lung tissue from paraquat-challenged mice	 ↓ Fibrosis and lung inflammation ↓ Type I collagen, TGFβ, αSMA and fibronectin 1 expression 	128			
Sirtuin activator						
Resveratrol	Dermal fibroblasts from patients with SSc	 ↓ Collagen production ↓ αSMA and fibronectin extracellular domain A expression 	94,98			
Resveratrol	TGFβ-stimulated dermal fibroblasts	 ↓ Cell migration and contractility ↑ Stress fibre formation ↑ Collagen expression 	93,94			
Resveratrol	Lung fibroblast cell line stimulated with TGF β or bleomycin	\downarrow mTOR activation	92,98			
Resveratrol	TNF-stimulated lung fibroblast cell line	• \downarrow IL-6, IL-1 β and iNOS expression • \downarrow p65 acetylation	92			
Resveratrol	TGF β -stimulated dermal fibroblasts and lung fibroblast cell line	●↓ Collagen and αSMA expression ●↓ Transcription factor SMAD3 activation	92,94,98			
Resveratrol	Lung tissue from bleomycin-challenged mice	•↓ Alveolar epithelial injury •↓ Collagen expression	92			
Resveratrol	Skin tissue from bleomycin-challenged mice	•↓ Dermal thickness •↓ Collagen expression	94,98			
Hexafluoro	TGFβ-stimulated lung fibroblasts	 ↓ aSMA, fibronectin extracellular domain A and collagen expression ↓ Cell migration and contraction ↓ ROS production ↓ Transcription factor SMAD3 activation 	97			
Hexafluoro	Lung and skin tissue from bleomycin-challenged mice	 ↓ Lung fibrosis ↓ Dermal thickness ↓ Collagen production 	97			

Table 3 (cont.) Therapies that target epigenetic processes — experimental evidence in systemic sclerosis						
Therapy	Tissue or cell type	Outcome	Refs			
HMT inhibitor						
DZNep	$TGF\beta\text{-stimulated}$ healthy lung fibroblasts	 ↓ αSMA and fibronectin 1 expression ↓ Fibroblast contractility ↓ SMAD transcription factor nuclear translocation 	131			
DZNep	Monocytic cell line	• \uparrow Transcription factor FRA2 and TIMP1 expression	133			
DZNep	Lung tissue from bleomycin-challenged mice	•↓Lung fibrosis •↓αSMA and collagen expression	131			
HDM inhibitor						
GSKJ4	Dermal fibroblasts from patients with SSc stimulated with TGF β or PDGF	 ↓ TGFβ-induced transcription factor FRA2 expression ↓ Cell migration 	100			
GSKJ4	Skin and lung tissue from mice challenged with bleomycin or topoisomerase l	 ↓ Dermal thickness ↓ Myofibroblast counts ↑ Hydroxyproline levels ↓ Skin-infiltrating T cells 	100			
miRNA mimic						
miR-29a mimic	Dermal fibroblasts from patients with SSc	 ↓ Collagen and TIMP1 expression ↑ Apoptosis 	104,105			
miR-30 agomir	Lung tissue from bleomycin-challenged mice	● ↓ Lung fibrosis and collagen deposition ● ↓ DRP1 and TET1 expression ● ↓ Hydroxyproline, αSMA and vimentin expression	74			
miR-29b mimic	Lung tissue from bleomycin-challenged mice	●↓ Pulmonary fibrosis ●↓ Collagen expression	139			
miR-29b mimic	Skin tissue from healthy individuals	●↓ Fibroplasia ●↓ Collagen expression	140			
miRNA inhibitor						
miR-21 inhibitor	Dermal fibroblasts from patients with SSc	↑ Apoptosis	106			
miR-155 antagomir	Skin tissue from bleomycin-challenged mice	 ↓ Skin thickness ↓ Collagen type I expression ↓ aSMA-positive fibroblasts 	108			

 α SMA, α -smooth muscle actin; DNMT, DNA methyltransferase; DRP1, dynamin-related protein 1; HAT, histone acetyltransferase; HDAC, histone deacetylase; HDM, histone demethylase; HMT, histone methyltransferase; IgG, immunoglobulin G; iNOS, inducible nitric oxide synthase; IPF, idiopathic pulmonary fibrosis; miRNA, microRNA; mRSS, modified Rodnan skin score; mTOR, serine/threonine-protein kinase mTOR; PARP1, poly(ADP-ribose) polymerase 1; PBMCs, peripheral blood mononuclear cells; PDGF, platelet-derived growth factor; PHA, phytohaemagglutinin; PTGS2, prostaglandin G/H synthase 2; ROS, reactive oxygen species; SSc, systemic sclerosis; TET1, ten-eleven translocation methylcytosine dioxygenase 1; TGF β , transforming growth factor- β ; TIMP1, tissue inhibitor metalloproteinase 1; TSA, trichostatin A; WIF1, Wnt inhibitory factor 1. Partial HDAC inhibitory effects.

the lungs of bleomycin-challenged mice, resulting in reduced production of collagen, reduced expression of myofibroblast differentiation markers and the amelioration of lung fibrosis74. As circulating levels of different miR-30 family members are reduced in patients with IPF, as well as in patients with SSc138, these results74 provide evidence for the beneficial effects of therapies that aim to induce miR-30 expression. Lastly, an oligonucleotide mimic of miR-29b (MRG-201) has been developed as a possible anti-fibrotic treatment. Systemic treatment with MRG-201 reduced collagen production and disease in a bleomycin-induced mouse model of fibrosis139. MRG-201 has been further evaluated in a phase I clinical trial in skin incisions in healthy individuals, the preliminary results of which showed its administration lessened collagen expression and prevented fibroplasia¹⁴⁰.

Conclusions

Over the past few years, it has become clear that a complete characterization of the pathophysiological features of SSc can be accomplished only by the careful examination of both the genetic and epigenetic influences that affect this disease (FIG. 2). Despite the concordance of findings between a number of studies, divergences between findings in some studies constitute a major drawback. These different outcomes could be partially explained by the heterogeneity of SSc, further indicating the need for the data-driven molecular reclassification of the disease. Additionally, the diverse techniques used to evaluate genetic and epigenetic marks, as well as non-disease-related factors, such as ethnicity, sex, age, lifestyle and therapeutics, could explain data irreproducibility¹⁴¹. Hence, the inclusion of necessary controls, large sample sizes and the recruitment of therapy-naive patients are crucial in future preclinical studies.

The variability in miRNA expression between studies highlights the need for methodological standardization and data validation in independent cohorts of patients. The therapeutic targeting of miRNA has been facilitated by the development of delivery strategies that partially solve problems related to the biopharmaceutical properties of the molecules. Chemical nucleoside modifications and locked nucleic acid technology provide resistance against nucleases, and the introduction of lipid nanocarriers for miRNA mimics or anti-miRNAs confers miRNA stability and limits immune rejection¹⁴². Additionally, topical miRNA-directed therapies are showing promising results when applied to patient-derived skin samples, thereby encouraging further preclinical evaluation in SSc¹⁴³.

Inhibitors that affect DNA methylation necessarily require further characterization in vivo. In fact, as DNA methylation is pivotal in physiological processes, broadly specific targeting of these mechanisms would be expected to cause unwanted adverse effects¹⁴⁴. Similar considerations exist around the use of inhibitors to either sustain or repress HDAC activity as targeting different classes or members of histone-modifying enzymes could have distinct, or even opposite, effects on disease manifestations. Low therapeutic doses of pan-HDAC inhibitors have shown clinical efficacy and safety in systemic-onset juvenile idiopathic arthritis¹⁴⁵; however, the benefits of using HDAC inhibitors in SSc are still debatable.

In this Review, we have described highlights from the field of genetics and epigenetics in SSc made over the past 4 years. As epigenetic changes might occur

- 1. Gabrielli, A., Avvedimento, E. V. & Krieg, T. Scleroderma. *N. Engl. J. Med.* **360**, 1989–2003 (2009).
- [No authors listed]. Preliminary criteria for the classification of systemic sclerosis (scleroderma). Subcommittee for scleroderma criteria of the American Rheumatism Association Diagnostic and Therapeutic Criteria Committee. *Arthritis Rheum.* 23, 581–590 (1980).
- Barnes, J. & Mayes, M. D. Epidemiology of systemic sclerosis: incidence, prevalence, survival, risk factors, malignancy, and environmental triggers. *Curr. Opin. Rheumatol.* 24, 165–170 (2012).
- LeRoy, E. C. & Medsger, T. A. Jr. Criteria for the classification of early systemic sclerosis. J. Rheumatol. 28, 1573–1576 (2001).
- van den Hoogen, F. et al. 2013 classification criteria for systemic sclerosis: an American college of rheumatology/ European league against rheumatism collaborative initiative. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 72, 1747–1755 (2013).
- Pope, J. E. & Johnson, S. R. New classification criteria for systemic sclerosis (scleroderma). *Rheum. Dis. Clin. North Am.* 41, 383–398 (2015).
- Chifflot, H., Fautrel, B., Sordet, C., Chatelus, E. & Sibilia, J. Incidence and prevalence of systemic sclerosis: a systematic literature review. *Semin. Arthritis Rheum.* **37**, 223–235 (2008).
- Roberts-Thomson, P. J. et al. Scleroderma in South Australia: epidemiological observations of possible pathogenic significance. *Intern. Med. J.* **31**, 220–229 (2001).
- Mayes, M. D. et al. Prevalence, incidence, survival, and disease characteristics of systemic sclerosis in a large US population. *Arthritis Rheum.* 48, 2246–2255 (2003).
- De Martinis, M., Ciccarelli, F., Sirufo, M. M. & Ginaldi, L An overview of environmental risk factors in systemic sclerosis. *Expert Rev. Clin. Immunol.* **12**, 465–478 (2016).
- McCormic, Z. D., Khuder, S. S., Aryal, B. K., Ames, A. L. <u>&</u> Khuder, S. A. Occupational silica exposure as a risk factor for scleroderma: a meta-analysis. *Int. Arch. Occup. Environ. Health* 83, 763–769 (2010).
- Walczyk, M., Paradowska-Gorycka, A. & Olesinska, M. Epigenetics: the future direction in systemic sclerosis. Scand. J. Immunol. 86, 427–435 (2017).
- Broen, J. C., Radstake, T. R. & Rossato, M. The role of genetics and epigenetics in the pathogenesis of systemic sclerosis. *Nat. Rev. Rheumatol.* **10**, 671–681 (2014).
- 14. Englert, H. et al. Familial risk estimation in systemic sclerosis. *Aust. N. Z. J. Med.* **29**, 36–41 (1999).
- Arnett, F. C. et al. Familial occurrence frequencies and relative risks for systemic sclerosis (scleroderma) in three United States cohorts. *Arthritis Rheum.* 44, 1359–1362 (2001).

- Feghali-Bostwick, C., Medsger, T. A. Jr & Wright, T. M. Analysis of systemic sclerosis in twins reveals low concordance for disease and high concordance for the presence of antinuclear antibodies. *Arthritis Rheum.* 48, 1956–1963 (2003).
 Aho, K., Koskenvuo, M., Tuominen, J. & Kaprio, J.
- Aho, K., Koskenvuo, M., Tuominen, J. & Kaprio, J. Occurrence of rheumatoid arthritis in a nationwide series of twins. J. Rheumatol. 13, 899–902 (1986).
- Bammer, H., Schaltenbrand, G. & Solcher, H. [Examinations of twins in multiple sclerosis]. *Dtsch. Z. Nervenheilkd* 181, 261–279 (1960).
- Selmi, C. et al. Primary biliary cirrhosis in monozygotic and dizygotic twins: genetics, epigenetics, and environment. *Gastroenterology* **127**, 485–492 (2004)
- Zhou, X., Tan, F. K., Xiong, M., Arnett, F. C. & Feghali-Bostwick, C. A. Monozygotic twins clinically discordant for scleroderma show concordance for fibroblast gene expression profiles. *Arthritis Rheum.* 52, 3305–3314 (2005).
- Hudson, M. et al. Polyautoimmunity and familial autoimmunity in systemic sclerosis. J. Autoimmun. 31, 156–159 (2008).
- Arora-Singh, R. K. et al. Autoimmune diseases and autoantibodies in the first degree relatives of patients with systemic sclerosis. J. Autoimmun. 35, 52–57 (2010).
- Chairta, P., Nicolaou, P. & Christodoulou, K. Genomic and genetic studies of systemic sclerosis: a systematic review. *Hum. Immunol.* 78, 153–165 (2017).
- Mayes, M. D. et al. Immunochip analysis identifies multiple susceptibility loci for systemic sclerosis. *Am. J. Hum. Genet.* 94, 47–61 (2014).
 Arnett, F. C. et al. Major histocompatibility complex
- Arnett, F. C. et al. Major histocompatibility complex (MHC) class II alleles, haplotypes and epitopes which confer susceptibility or protection in systemic sclerosis: analyses in 1300 Caucasian, African-American and Hispanic cases and 1000 controls. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 69, 822–827 (2010).
- Beretta, L. et al. Analysis of class II human leucocyte antigens in Italian and Spanish systemic sclerosis. *Rheumatol.* 51, 52–59 (2012).
- Rodriguez-Reyna, T. S. et al. HLA class I and II blocks are associated to susceptibility, clinical subtypes and autoantibodies in Mexican systemic sclerosis (SSc) patients. *PLoS ONE* 10, e0126727 (2015).
- Furukawa, H. et al. Human leukocyte antigen and systemic sclerosis in Japanese: the sign of the four independent protective alleles, DRB1*13:02, DRB1*14:06, DQB1*03:01, and DPB1*02:01. PLoS ONE 11, e0154255 (2016).
- Wang, J. et al. Association of HLA-DPB1 with scleroderma and its clinical features in Chinese population. *PLoS ONE* 9, e87363 (2014).
- Vigone, B. et al. Role of class II human leucocyte antigens in the progression from early to definite systemic sclerosis. *Rheumatol.* 54, 707–711 (2015).

very early in the disease course, potentially years before fibrosis appears, they might constitute a link between inflammation and tissue fibrosis that has hitherto not been understood. Understanding this link is important as, although fibrosis was previously considered to be an end-stage condition, it is now thought to be potentially reversibile¹⁴⁶⁻¹⁴⁸. As fibrosis is shared between many acute and chronic diseases and still accounts for one-third of deaths worldwide¹⁴⁹, understanding the underlying molecular pathways that link inflammation with fibrosis will be paramount for the development of medicines that are effective in treating or even reversing tissue fibrosis¹⁴⁹. Despite advances in this field, an urgent need remains for more large-scale population studies and longitudinal measurements in patients with SSc. The integration of multi-omics data, including genomic, epigenomic, transcriptomic, proteomic and metabolomic data, is hoped to deliver a more holistic understanding of the pathogenesis of SSc and to pave the way for novel therapies to halt or even prevent fibrosis.

Published online 10 October 2018

- Lambert, N. C. et al. HLA-DQA1*0501 is associated with diffuse systemic sclerosis in Caucasian men. *Arthritis Rheum.* 43, 2005–2010 (2000).
- Stevens, A. M. et al. Brief report: HLA-DRB1, DQA1, and DQB1 in juvenile-onset systemic sclerosis. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* 68, 2772–2777 (2016).
- Higgs, B. W. et al. Patients with systemic lupus erythematosus, myositis, rheumatoid arthritis and scleroderma share activation of a common type I interferon pathway. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **70**, 2029–2036 (2011).
- Xu, Y., Wang, W., Tian, Y., Liu, J. & Yang, R. Polymorphisms in STAT4 and *IRF5* increase the risk of systemic sclerosis: a meta-analysis. *Int. J. Dermatol.* 55, 408–416 (2016).
- 35. Lopez-Isac, E. et al. Brief report: *IRF4* newly identified as a common susceptibility locus for systemic sclerosis and rheumatoid arthritis in a cross-disease meta-analysis of genome-wide association studies. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* 68, 2338–2344 (2016).
- Allanore, Y. et al. Genome-wide scan identifies *TNIP1*, *PSORS1C1*, and *RHOB* as novel risk loci for systemic sclerosis. *PLoS Genet.* 7, e1002091 (2011).
- Martin, J. E. et al. Identification of *CSK* as a systemic sclerosis genetic risk factor through genome wide association study follow-up. *Hum. Mol. Genet.* 21, 2825–2835 (2012).
- Radstake, T. R. et al. Genome-wide association study of systemic sclerosis identifies *CD247* as a new susceptibility locus. *Nat. Genet.* 42, 426–429 (2010).
- Wang, J. et al. Lack of association of the CD247 SNP rs2056626 with systemic sclerosis in Han Chinese. Open Rheumatol. J. 8, 43–45 (2014).
- Sato, S. et al. Levels of interleukin 12, a cytokine of type 1 helper T cells, are elevated in sera from patients with systemic sclerosis. J. Rheumatol. 27, 2838–2842 (2000).
- Bossini-Castillo, L. et al. A GWAS follow-up study reveals the association of the *IL12RB2* gene with systemic sclerosis in Caucasian populations. *Hum. Mol. Genet.* 21, 926–933 (2012).
 Lopez-Isac, E. et al. Identification of *IL12RB1*
- 42. Lopez-Isac, E. et al. Identification of *IL12RB1* as a novel systemic sclerosis susceptibility locus. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* **66**, 3521–3523 (2014).
- Martin, J. E. et al. A systemic sclerosis and systemic lupus erythematosus pan-meta-GWAS reveals new shared susceptibility loci. *Hum. Mol. Genet.* 22, 4021–4029 (2013).
- Tsuchiya, N. et al. Association of STAT4 polymorphism with systemic sclerosis in a Japanese population. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 68, 1375–1376 (2009).
- Elshazli, R. & Settin, A. Association of *PTPN22* rs2476601 and *STAT4* rs75774865 polymorphisms with rheumatoid arthritis: a meta-analysis update. *Immunobiology* **220**, 1012–1024 (2015).

- Gestermann, N. et al. STAT4 is a confirmed genetic risk factor for Sjögren's syndrome and could be involved in type 1 interferon pathway signaling. *Genes Immun.* 11, 452–458 (2010).
- Namjou, B. et al. High-density genotyping of STAT4 reveals multiple haplotypic associations with systemic lupus erythematosus in different racial groups. *Arthritis Rheum.* **60**, 1085–1095 (2009).
- Tsuchiya, N., Ito, I. & Kawasaki, A. Association of *IRF5*, STAT4 and BLK with systemic lupus erythematosus and other rheumatic diseases. *Nihon Rinsho Meneki Gakkai Kaishi* 33, 57–65 (2010).
- Ito, I. et al. Association of a functional polymorphism in the *IRF5* region with systemic sclerosis in a Japanese population. *Arthritis Rheum.* **60**, 1845–1850 (2009).
- Koumakis, E. et al. A candidate gene study identifies a haplotype of *CD2* as novel susceptibility factor for systemic sclerosis. *Clin. Exp. Rheumatol.* **34** (Suppl. 100), 43–48 (2016).
- Sisirak, V. et al. Digestion of chromatin in apoptotic cell microparticles prevents autoimmunity. *Cell* 166, 88–101 (2016).
- Zochling, J. et al. An Immunochip-based interrogation of scleroderma susceptibility variants identifies a novel association at DNASE 1L3. Arthritis Res. Ther. 16, 438 (2014).
- Wei, P. et al. Identification of an association of *TNFAIP3* polymorphisms with matrix metalloproteinase expression in fibroblasts in an integrative study of systemic sclerosis-associated genetic and environmental factors. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* 68, 749–760 (2016).
- Żhao, J. H. et al. The influence of different solvents on systemic sclerosis: an updated meta-analysis of 14 case-control studies. *J. Clin. Rheumatol.* 22, 253–259 (2016).
- Johar, A. S. et al. Candidate gene discovery in autoimmunity by using extreme phenotypes, next generation sequencing and whole exome capture. *Autoimmun Rev.* 14, 204–209 (2015).
- Gao, L. et al. Identification of rare variants in *ATP8B4* as a risk factor for systemic sclerosis by whole-exome sequencing. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* 68, 191–200 (2016).
- Lopez-Isac, E. et al. Analysis of ATP8B4 F436L missense variant in a large systemic sclerosis cohort. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* 69, 1337–1338 (2017).
- Mak, A. C. et al. Brief report: whole-exome sequencing for identification of potential causal variants for diffuse cutaneous systemic sclerosis. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* 68, 2257–2262 (2016).
- Dieude, P. et al. *BANK1* is a genetic risk factor for diffuse cutaneous systemic sclerosis and has additive effects with IRF5 and STAT4. *Arthritis Rheum.* 60, 3447–3454 (2009).
- van Bon, L. et al. Proteome-wide analysis and CXCL4 as a biomarker in systemic sclerosis. *N. Engl. J. Med.* 370, 433–443 (2014).
- van Bon, L. et al. Distinct evolution of TLR-mediated dendritic cell cytokine secretion in patients with limited and diffuse cutaneous systemic sclerosis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 69, 1539–1547 (2010).
 Ah Kioon, M. D. et al. Plasmacytoid dendritic cells
- Ah Kioon, M. D. et al. Plasmacytoid dendritic cells promote systemic sclerosis with a key role for TLR8. *Sci. Transl Med.* **10**, eaam8458 (2018).
- Silva-Cardoso, S. C. et al. CXCL4 exposure potentiates TLR-driven polarization of human monocyte-derived dendritic cells and increases stimulation of T cells. *J. Immunol.* **199**, 253–262 (2017).
- Hattori, M. et al. Global DNA hypomethylation and hypoxia-induced expression of the ten eleven translocation (TET) family, TET1, in scleroderma fibroblasts. *Exp. Dermatol.* 24, 841–846 (2015).
- Sargent, J. L. et al. A TGFβ-responsive gene signature is associated with a subset of diffuse scleroderma with increased disease severity. *J. Invest. Dermatol.* **130**, 694–705 (2010).
- Dantas, A. T. et al. Reassessing the role of the active TGF-β1 as a biomarker in systemic sclerosis: association of serum levels with clinical manifestations. *Dis. Markers* 2016, 6064830 (2016).
- Dees, C. et al. The Wht antagonists DKK1 and SFRP1 are downregulated by promoter hypermethylation in systemic sclerosis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **73**, 1232–1239 (2014).

- Noda, S. et al. Simultaneous downregulation of KLF5 and FLI1 is a key feature underlying systemic sclerosis. *Nat. Commun.* 5, 5797 (2014).
- Zhang, Y. et al. Poly(ADP-ribose) polymerase-1 regulates fibroblast activation in systemic sclerosis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 77, 744–751 (2018).
- Bujor, A. M. et al. Ciprofloxacin has antifibrotic effects in scleroderma fibroblasts via downregulation of DNMT1 and upregulation of FL11. *Int. J. Mol. Med.* **30**, 1473–1480 (2012).
- Lei, W. et al. Abnormal DNA methylation in CD4+ T cells from patients with systemic lupus erythematosus, systemic sclerosis, and dermatomyositis. Scand. J. Rheumatol. 38, 369–374 (2009).
- Qing, Y. et al. Quantitation and mapping of the epigenetic marker 5-hydroxymethylcytosine. *Bioessays* https://doi.org/10.1002/bies.201700010 (2017).
- Zhang, S. et al. miR-30a as potential therapeutics by targeting TET1 through regulation of Drp-1 promoter hydroxymethylation in idiopathic pulmonary fibrosis. *Int. J. Mol. Sci.* 18, E633 (2017).
- O'Reilly, S., Ciechomska, M., Fullard, N., Przyborski, S. & van Laar, J. M. IL-13 mediates collagen deposition via STAT6 and microRNA-135b: a role for epigenetics. *Sci. Rep.* 6, 25066 (2016).
- He, Y., Tsou, P. S., Khanna, D. & Sawalha, A. H. Methyl-CpC-binding protein 2 mediates antifibrotic effects in scleroderma fibroblasts. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 77, 1208–1218 (2018).
- 77. Keerthisingam, C. B. et al. Cyclooxygenase-2 deficiency results in a loss of the anti-proliferative response to transforming growth factor β in human fibrotic lung fibroblasts and promotes bleomycin-induced pulmonary fibrosis in mice. *Am. J. Pathol.* **158**, 1411–1422 (2001).
- Evans, I. C. et al. Epigenetic regulation of cyclooxygenase-2 by methylation of C8orf4 in pulmonary fibrosis. *Clin. Sci. (Lond.)* **130**, 575–586 (2016).
- Kim, J. et al. TC1(C8orf4) is a novel endothelial inflammatory regulator enhancing NF-κB activity. *J. Immunol.* 183, 3996–4002 (2009).
- Matatiele, P., Tikly, M., Tarr, G. & Gulumian, M. DNA methylation similarities in genes of black South Africans with systemic lupus erythematosus and systemic sclerosis. J. Biomed. Sci. 22, 34 (2015).
- Ding, W. et al. Genome-wide DNA methylation analysis in systemic sclerosis reveals hypomethylation of IFN-associated genes in CD4(+) and CD8(+) T cells. J. Invest. Dermatol. 138, 1069–1077 (2018).
- Yoshizaki, A. et al. Cell adhesion molecules regulate fibrotic process via Th1/Th2/Th17 cell balance in a bleomycin-induced scleroderma model. *J. Immunol.* 185, 2502–2515 (2010).
- Wang, Y. et al. Hypomethylation and overexpression of ITGAL (CD11a) in CD4(+) T cells in systemic sclerosis. *Clin. Epigenet.* 6, 25 (2014).
 Yin, H. et al. Histone demethylase JMJD3 regulates
- Yin, H. et al. Histone demethylase JMJD3 regulates CD11a expression through changes in histone H3K27 tri-methylation levels in CD4+ T cells of patients with systemic lupus erythematosus. *Oncotarget* 8, 48938–48947 (2017).
- Absher, D. M. et al. Genome-wide DNA methylation analysis of systemic lupus erythematosus reveals persistent hypomethylation of interferon genes and compositional changes to CD4+ T cell populations. *PLoS Genet.* 9, e1003678 (2013).
- Carmona, F. D. et al. Novel identification of the IRF7 region as an anticentromere autoantibody propensity locus in systemic sclerosis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **71**, 114–119 (2012).
- Rezaei, R. et al. IRF7 gene expression profile and methylation of its promoter region in patients with systemic sclerosis. *Int. J. Rheum. Dis.* 20, 1551–1561 (2017).
- Wang, Y. Y. et al. DNA hypermethylation of the forkhead box protein 3 (FOXP3) promoter in CD4+ T cells of patients with systemic sclerosis. *Br. J. Dermatol.* **171**, 39–47 (2014).
- Almanzar, G. et al. Disease manifestation and inflammatory activity as modulators of Th17/Treg balance and RORC/FoxP3 methylation in systemic sclerosis. *Int. Arch. Allergy Immunol.* **171**, 141–154 (2016).
- Tsou, P. S. et al. Histone deacetylase 5 is overexpressed in scleroderma endothelial cells and impairs angiogenesis via repression of proangiogenic factors. Arthritis Rheumatol. 68, 2975–2985 (2016).
- Wang, Y., Fan, P. S. & Kahaleh, B. Association between enhanced type I collagen expression and epigenetic repression of the *FLI1* gene in scleroderma fibroblasts. *Arthritis Rheum.* 54, 2271–2279 (2006).

- Chu, H. et al. Sirtuin1 protects against systemic sclerosis-related pulmonary fibrosis by decreasing proinflammatory and profibrotic processes. *Am. J. Respir. Cell. Mol. Biol.* **58**, 28–39 (2018).
- Zerr, P. et al. Sirt1 regulates canonical TGF-β signalling to control fibroblast activation and tissue fibrosis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **75**, 226–233 (2016).
- Wei, J. et al. The histone deacetylase sirtuin 1 is reduced in systemic sclerosis and abrogates fibrotic responses by targeting transforming growth factor β signaling. Arthritis Rheumatol. 67, 1323–1334 (2015).
- Wyman, A. E. et al. Sirtuin 7 is decreased in pulmonary fibrosis and regulates the fibrotic phenotype of lung fibroblasts. *Am. J. Physiol. Lung Cell. Mol. Physiol.* **312**, L945–L958 (2017).
- Sosulski, M. L., Gongora, R., Feghali-Bostwick, C., Lasky, J. A. & Sanchez, C. G. Sirtuin 3 deregulation promotes pulmonary fibrosis. J. Gerontol. A Biol. Sci. Med. Sci. 72, 595–602 (2017).
- Akamata, K. et al. SIRT3 is attenuated in systemic sclerosis skin and lungs, and its pharmacologic activation mitigates organ fibrosis. *Oncotarget* 7, 69321–69336 (2016).
- Zhu, X. et al. SIRT1 ameliorates systemic sclerosis by targeting the mTOR pathway. J. Dermatol. Sci. 87, 149–158 (2017).
- Wang, O. et al. Overexpression of JMJD3 may contribute to demethylation of H3K27me3 in CD4+ T cells from patients with systemic sclerosis. *Clin. Immunol.* 161, 396–359 (2015).
- Bergmann, C. et al. The histone demethylase Jumonji domain-containing protein 3 (JMJD3) regulates fibroblast activation in systemic sclerosis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **77**, 150–158 (2018).
- 101. Fan, Z. et al. MKL1 is an epigenetic modulator of TGF-β induced fibrogenesis. *Biochim. Biophys. Acta* 1849, 1219–1228 (2015).
- 102. Rossato, M. et al. Association of microRNA-618 expression with altered frequency and activation of plasmacytoid dendritic cells in patients with systemic sclerosis. Arthritis Rheumatol. 69, 1891–1902 (2017).
- Ciechomska, M. et al. The role of microRNA-5196 in the pathogenesis of systemic sclerosis. *Eur. J. Clin. Invest.* 47, 555–564 (2017).
- 104. Ciechomska, M., O'Reilly, S., Suwara, M., Bogunia-Kubik, K. & van Laar, J. M. MiR-29a reduces TIMP-1 production by dermal fibroblasts via targeting TGF-β activated kinase 1 binding protein 1, implications for systemic sclerosis. *PLoS ONE* 9, e115596 (2014).
- Jafarinejad-Farsangi, S. et al. MicroRNA-29a induces apoptosis via increasing the Bax:Bcl-2 ratio in dermal fibroblasts of patients with systemic sclerosis. *Autoimmunity* 48, 369–378 (2015).
- Jafarinejad-Farsangi, S. et al. Inhibition of microRNA-21 induces apoptosis in dermal fibroblasts of patients with systemic sclerosis. *Int. J. Dermatol.* 55, 1259–1267 (2016).
- Zhou, B. et al. MicroRNA-202-3p regulates scleroderma fibrosis by targeting matrix metalloproteinase 1. *Biomed. Pharmacother.* 87, 412–418 (2017).
- Yan, Q., Chen, J., Li, W., Bao, C. & Fu, Q. Targeting miR-155 to treat experimental scleroderma. *Sci. Rep.* 6, 20314 (2016).
- Christmann, R. B. et al. MiR-155 in the progression of lung fibrosis in systemic sclerosis. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* 18, 155 (2016).
- 110. Artlett, C. M., Sassi-Gaha, S., Hope, J. L., Feghali-Bostwick, C. A. & Katsikis, P. D. Mir-155 is overexpressed in systemic sclerosis fibroblasts and is required for NLRP3 inflammasome-mediated collagen synthesis during fibrosis. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* **19**, 144 (2017).
- 111. Artlett, C. M. et al. The inflammasome activating caspase 1 mediates fibrosis and myofibroblast differentiation in systemic sclerosis. *Arthritis Rheum.* 63, 3563–3574 (2011).
- 112. Iwamoto, N. et al. Downregulation of miR-193b in systemic sclerosis regulates the proliferative vasculopathy by urokinase-type plasminogen activator expression. Ann. Rheum. Dis. **75**, 303–310 (2016).
- 113. Weiland, M., Gao, X. H., Zhou, L. & Mi, O. S. Small RNAs have a large impact: circulating microRNAs as biomarkers for human diseases. *RNA Biol.* 9, 850–859 (2012).
- 114. Steen, S. O. et al. The circulating cell-free microRNA profile in systemic sclerosis is distinct from both healthy controls and systemic lupus erythematosus. *J. Rheumatol.* 42, 214–221 (2015).
- 115. Wuttge, D. M. et al. Specific autoantibody profiles and disease subgroups correlate with circulating micro-RNA in systemic sclerosis. *Rheumatol.* 54, 2100–2107 (2015).

- 116. Chouri, E. et al. Serum microRNA screening and functional studies reveal miR-483-5p as a potential driver of fibrosis in systemic sclerosis. *J. Autoimmun.* 89, 162–170 (2018).
- Nakamura, K. et al. Altered expression of CD63 and exosomes in scleroderma dermal fibroblasts. *J. Dermatol. Sci.* 84, 30–39 (2016).
- 118. Wermuth, P. J., Piera-Velazquez, S. & Jimenez, S. A. Exosomes isolated from serum of systemic sclerosis patients display alterations in their content of profibrotic and antifibrotic microRNA and induce a profibrotic phenotype in cultured normal dermal fibroblasts. *Clin. Exp. Rheumatol.* **35** (Suppl. 106), 21–30 (2017).
- 119. Messemaker, T. C. et al. Antisense long non-coding RNAs are deregulated in skin tissue of patients with systemic sclerosis. *J. Invest. Dermatol.* **138**, 826–835 (2018).
- Wang, Z. et al. Long non-coding RNA TSIX is upregulated in scleroderma dermal fibroblasts and controls collagen mRNA stabilization. *Exp. Dermatol.* 25, 131–136 (2016).
 Angiolilli, C., Baeten, D. L., Radstake, T. R. &
- 121. Angiolilli, C., Baeten, D. L., Radstake, T. R. & Reedquist, K. A. The acetyl code in rheumatoid arthritis and other rheumatic diseases. *Epigenomics* 9, 447–461 (2017).
- O'Reilly, S. Epigenetic modulation as a therapy in systemic sclerosis. *Rheumatol*. https://doi. org/10.1093/rheumatology/key071 (2018).
- 123. Strickland, F. M. et al. Characterisation of an epigenetically altered CD4(+) CD28(+) KIR(+) T cell subset in autoimmune rheumatic diseases by multiparameter flow cytometry. *Lupus Sci. Med.* 3, e000147 (2016).
- Richardson, B. Effect of an inhibitor of DNA methylation on T cells. II. 5-Azacytidine induces self-reactivity in antigen-specific T⁴⁺ cells. *Hum. Immunol.* **17**, 456–470 (1986).
- 125. Svegliati, S. et al. Oxidative DNA damage induces the ATM-mediated transcriptional suppression of the Wnt inhibitor WIF-1 in systemic sclerosis and fibrosis. *Sci. Signal* 7, ra84 (2014).
- Sci. Signal 7, ra84 (2014).
 126. Huber, L. C. et al. Trichostatin A prevents the accumulation of extracellular matrix in a mouse model of bleomycin-induced skin fibrosis. Arthritis Rheum. 56, 2755–2764 (2007).
- 127. Ota, C. et al. Histone deacetylase inhibitor restores surfactant protein-C expression in alveolar-epithelial type II cells and attenuates bleomycin-induced pulmonary fibrosis in vivo. *Exp. Lung Res.* **41**, 422–434 (2015).
- Hu, L. et al. Epigenetic regulation of interleukin 6 by histone acetylation in macrophages and its role in paraquat-induced pulmonary fibrosis. *Front. Immunol.* 7, 696 (2016).
- 129. Ghosh, A. K. et al. p300 is elevated in systemic sclerosis and its expression is positively regulated by TGF-β: epigenetic feed-forward amplification of fibrosis. J. Invest. Dermatol. **133**, 1302–1310 (2013).
- Smoliga, J. M., Vang, O. & Baur, J. A. Challenges of translating basic research into therapeutics: resveratrol as an example. *J. Gerontol. A Biol. Sci. Med. Sci.* 67, 158–167 (2012).
 Xiao, X. et al. EZH2 enhances the differentiation of
- Xiao, X. et al. EZH2 enhances the differentiation of fibroblasts into myofibroblasts in idiopathic pulmonary fibrosis. *Physiol. Rep.* 4, e12915 (2016).
- 132. Zeybel, M. et al. A proof-of-concept for epigenetic therapy of tissue fibrosis: inhibition of liver fibrosis

progression by 3-deazaneplanocin A. *Mol. Ther.* **25**, 218–231 (2017).

- 133. Ciechomska, M. et al. Histone demethylation and toll-like receptor 8-dependent cross-talk in monocytes promotes transdifferentiation of fibroblasts in systemic sclerosis via Fra-2. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* 68, 1493–1504 (2016).
- 134. Kramer, M. et al. Inhibition of H3K27 histone trimethylation activates fibroblasts and induces fibrosis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **72**, 614–620 (2013).
- 135. Shi, J. & Vakoc, C. R. The mechanisms behind the therapeutic activity of BET bromodomain inhibition. *Mol. Cell* 54, 728–736 (2014).
- 136. Tang, X. et al. Assessment of Brd4 inhibition in idiopathic pulmonary fibrosis lung fibroblasts and in vivo models of lung fibrosis. *Am. J. Pathol.* 183, 470–479 (2013).
- 137. O'Reilly, S. MicroRNAs in fibrosis: opportunities and challenges. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* **18**, 11 (2016).
- 138. Tanaka, S. et al. Alteration of circulating miRNAs in SSc: miR-30b regulates the expression of PDGF receptor beta. *Rheumatol.* **52**, 1963–1972 (2013).
- Gallant-Behm, C. L. et al. Regulation of ECM production and fibrosis by MRC-201, a mimic of microRNA miR-29. *Wound Repair Regener.* 24, A9 (2016).
- Gallant-Behm, C. L. et al. Pharmacodynamic activity of a microRNA-29b mimic (MRG-201) in human skin incisions. J. Investigative Dermatol. 137, B4 (2017).
- Kader, F. & Ghai, M. DNA methylation-based variation between human populations. *Mol. Genet. Genom.* 292, 5–35 (2017).
- 142. Christopher, A. F. et al. MicroRNA therapeutics: discovering novel targets and developing specific therapy. *Perspect. Clin. Res.* **7**, 68–74 (2016).
- 143. Guinea-Viniegra, J. et al. Targeting miR-21 to treat psoriasis. *Sci. Transl Med.* 6, 225re1 (2014).
 144. Xu, P., Hu, G., Luo, C. & Liang, Z. DNA
- 144. Xu, P., Hu, G., Luo, C. & Liang, Z. DNA methyltransferase inhibitors: an updated patent review (2012–2015). *Expert Opin. Ther. Pat.* 26, 1017–1030 (2016).
- 145. Vojinovic, J. et al. Safety and efficacy of an oral histone deacetylase inhibitor in systemic-onset juvenile idiopathic arthritis. *Arthritis Rheum.* 63, 1452–1458 (2011).
- King, T. E. Jr., Noble, P. W. & Bradford, W. Z. Treatments for idiopathic pulmonary fibrosis. *N. Engl. J. Med.* **371**, 783–784 (2014).
 Marcellin, P. et al. Regression of cirrhosis during
- 147. Marcellin, P. et al. Regression of cirrhosis during treatment with tenofovir disoproxil fumarate for chronic hepatitis B: a 5-year open-label follow-up study. *Lancet* **381**, 468–475 (2013).
- 148. Liaw, Y. F. Reversal of cirrhosis: an achievable goal of hepatitis B antiviral therapy. J. Hepatol. 59, 880–881 (2013).
- 149. Zeisberg, M. & Kalluri, R. Cellular mechanisms of tissue fibrosis. 1. Common and organ-specific mechanisms associated with tissue fibrosis. *Am. J. Physiol. Cell Physiol.* **304**, C216–C225 (2013).
- 150. Tang, L., Chen, B., Ma, B. & Nie, S. Association between *IRF5* polymorphisms and autoimmune diseases: a meta-analysis. *Genet. Mol. Res.* 13, 4473–4485 (2014).
- 151. Wang, J. et al. Association of the *IRF5* SNP rs2004640 with systemic sclerosis in Han Chinese. *Int. J. Immunopathol. Pharmacol.* 27, 635–638 (2014).

- 152. Zhao, W. et al. The status of pulmonary fibrosis in systemic sclerosis is associated with *IRF5*, *STAT4*, *IRAK1*, and *CTGF* polymorphisms. *Rheumatol. Int.* **37**, 1303–1310 (2017).
- 153. Luo, H., Zhu, H., Zhou, B., Xiao, X. & Zuo, X. MicroRNA-130b regulates scleroderma fibrosis by targeting peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor gamma. *Mod. Rheumatol.* 25, 595–602 (2015).
- 154. Nakayama, W. et al. Dysregulated interleukin-23 signalling contributes to the increased collagen production in scleroderma fibroblasts via balancing microRNA expression. *Rheumatol.* 56, 145–155 (2017).
- 155. Neveu, W. A., Mills, S. T., Staitieh, B. S. & Sueblinvong, V. TGF-β1 epigenetically modifies Thy-1 expression in primary lung fibroblasts. *Am. J. Physiol. Cell Physiol.* **309**, C616–C626 (2015).
- 156. Palumbo-Zerr, K. et al. Orphan nuclear receptor NR4A1 regulates transforming growth factor-β signaling and fibrosis. *Nat. Med.* **21**, 150–158 (2015).
- Urban, J. R. & King, B. Divalproex sodium: a potential therapy for scleroderma digital ulcers. *JAAD Case Rep.* 1, 44–45 (2015).
- 158. Hinchcliff, M. et al. Mycophenolate mofetil treatment of systemic sclerosis reduces myeloid cell numbers and attenuates the inflammatory gene signature in skin. J. Invest. Dermatol. 138, 1301–1310 (2018).
- 159. Namas, R. et al. Efficacy of mycophenolate mofetil and oral cyclophosphamide on skin thickness: post hoc analyses from two randomized placebo-controlled trials. *Arthritis Care Res. (Hoboken)* **70**, 439–444 (2018).
- 160. Volkmann, E. R. et al. Mycophenolate mofetil versus placebo for systemic sclerosis-related interstitial lung disease: an analysis of scleroderma lung studies I and II. Arthritis Rheumatol. 69, 1451–1460 (2017).
- 161. Tashkin, D. P. et al. Mycophenolate mofetil versus oral cyclophosphamide in scleroderma-related interstitial lung disease (SLS II): a randomised controlled, double-blind, parallel group trial. *Lancet Respir. Med.* **4**, 708–719 (2016).

Author contributions

C.A., W.M., M.v.d.K. and E.C. researched data for the article. C.A., W.M., M.v.d.K., E.C. and T.R.D.J.R. wrote the article. C.A., W.M., K.A.R. and T.R.D.J.R. made substantial contributions to discussion of content. All authors reviewed and/or edited the manuscript before submission. M.v.d.K. and E.C. contributed equally to the preparation of this manuscript.

Competing interests

The authors declare no competing interests.

Publisher's note

Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Reviewer information

Nature Reviews Rheumatology thanks Y. Asano, M. Whitfield and the other anonymous reviewer(s) for their contribution to the peer review of this work.

Supplementary information

Supplementary information is available for this paper at https://doi.org/10.1038/s41584-018-0099-0.

OPINION

Modern-day environmental factors in the pathogenesis of osteoarthritis

Francis Berenbaum, Ian J. Wallace, Daniel E. Lieberman and David T. Felson

Abstract | The prevalence of osteoarthritis (OA) is rising for reasons that are not fully understood. In this Opinion article, we review the possibility that OA is an evolutionary mismatch disease, which is a disease more common today than in the past because genes inherited from previous generations are inadequately or imperfectly adapted to modern environmental conditions. We focus on four major environmental factors in OA pathogenesis that have become ubiquitous within the past half-century: obesity, metabolic syndrome, dietary changes and physical inactivity. Because a cure for OA does not yet exist, prevention strategies that target these modifiable environmental factors are needed to curb further increases in OA prevalence.

To a large extent, osteoarthritis (OA) is a disease of old age, so its prevalence might be expected to be higher today than in the past simply because more people are living longer, especially in Europe, the United States and other developed nations^{1,2}. However, evidence exists that increased longevity is probably not the sole reason for the high prevalence of OA. Wallace et al.³ traced long-term trends in the prevalence of knee OA in the United States using skeletal remains from 2,576 adults over the age of 50, spanning from prehistoric hunter-gatherers to 21st century city-dwellers. The results show that people who died since the mid-20th century were approximately twice as likely to have OA as those who died during earlier times, confirming expectations that the disease has become more common^{4–6}. However, this spike in prevalence is apparent even after controlling for age in a generalized linear model, indicating the presence of additional major risk factors that have become ubiquitous only within the past half-century.

OA pathogenesis, like all disease aetiologies, involves interactions between genes and the environment⁷, but the increase in OA prevalence in just the past few generations indicates that environmental changes are a major contributor to the current high prevalence of OA. On this basis, OA seems to fit the definition of what evolutionary biologists refer to as a 'mismatch disease', that is, a condition that is more common today than in the past because the human body is not well adapted to certain features common to modern environments^{8,9}. As there is no cure for OA, classification of it (at least partly) as a mismatch disease is of clinical consequence, as environmental factors are potentially modifiable targets for prevention.

Here, we discuss the effect of the environment on OA pathogenesis, focusing on factors that have become ubiquitous since the mid-20th century. To contextualize this evidence, we begin with an overview of the concept of mismatch diseases and conclude with a discussion of how understanding modern-day environmental factors is relevant to disease prevention.

Mismatch diseases

The concept of mismatch diseases derives from two basic principles of evolutionary biology: the theory of adaptation and the fact that interactions between genes and the environment are in constant flux^{8,9}. Each individual inherits genes that interact with the environment, and most of these genes were favoured by natural selection because they improved the ability to survive and reproduce under particular environmental conditions. As a result, all organisms are adapted in varying degrees to aspects of the environment in which their ancestors existed, including associated diets and patterns of physical activity. When environments change, as they inevitably do, ancestral alleles once favoured by natural selection can become mismatched to features of the new environment. Ultimately, as a result of such mismatches, individuals have an increased susceptibility to illnesses that were once rare or nonexistent among earlier generations.

Mismatches between inherited genetic variants and changing environments are a fundamental engine of evolution¹⁰, but an abundance of evidence indicates that such mismatches are becoming more common and severe in humans owing to rapid environmental changes related to the cultural evolution of our species (reviewed elsewhere⁹).

Although humans have been huntergatherers for almost all of our >200,000-year evolutionary history, in just the past ~12,000 years, a large proportion of the global population has transitioned from being physically active hunter-gatherers, mainly consuming wild plants and animals, to being farmers settled in agricultural communities reliant on cereals and other domesticated foods to being post-industrial workers engaged in low levels of physical activity and eating highly processed foods. Although these changes in the environment, which have occurred in a blink of the eye in evolutionary time, have brought many benefits and comforts, they are also thought to be responsible for the emergence of a variety of mismatch diseases. For example, owing to the long evolutionary history of humans as physically active huntergatherers and consuming a diet rich in fibre but low in sugar9, the rising prevalence of type 2 diabetes is widely considered to be related to recent shifts towards physical inactivity and overconsumption of foods high in sugar but low in fibre, resulting in persistent positive energy balance, increased adiposity and chronic low-grade inflammation, which can lead to insulin insensitivity¹¹.

When considering whether conditions such as OA are examples of mismatch

Box 1 | Effect of the obesity epidemic on osteoarthritis prevalence

Although it is difficult to quantify precisely how much of the current prevalence of osteoarthritis (OA) is attributable to any given environmental change, data from Wallace et al.³ provide a rough indication of the influence of the obesity epidemic on knee OA levels in the United States. Among individuals in their skeletal sample for which BMI at the time of death was documented, 25% of people who died in the past few decades were obese, compared with only 1% from earlier times, and individuals with obesity had a 2.2 times higher (95% Cl 1.6–3.0) prevalence of knee OA than non-obese individuals. These data suggest that today obesity doubles the risk of knee OA in roughly 1 in 4 people over the age of 50, whereas only 1 in 100 people were at a similarly heightened risk of knee OA roughly a half-century ago. Although Wallace et al.³ were limited in their ability to assess the full effect of obesity on knee OA prevalence because BMI is a fairly inaccurate measure of excess adiposity and BMI was known only from individuals' time of death and not at the time they developed OA, these data provide strong evidence that the recent steep rise in obesity levels has led to substantially more people being at greater risk of developing knee OA.

diseases, however, caution is required, as the mismatch concept is often applied to a wide range of health disorders, in both the scientific literature and popular press, as more a matter of assumption than a hypothesis to be carefully tested. As with the so-called 'Paleo diet', overly simplistic claims are sometimes made about the potential health benefits associated with living more like our ancient ancestors and are based on misleading caricatures of past environments¹² and the false assumption that humans evolved to be healthy9. Clearly, not all features specific to modern environments interact negatively with the genes we inherit, and many environmental alterations can be beneficial, such as antibiotics, refrigeration or the use of casts for bone fractures. With this caveat in mind, we suggest two principal criteria for rigorously testing the mismatch hypothesis for diseases such as OA: first, that the disease is more prevalent today than among past populations after accounting for variation in lifespan and, second, that preventable contributors to the disease are more common in modern environments. Although OA is not a new disease and has been documented among Palaeolithic hunter-gatherers13 and Neolithic farmers14, the study by Wallace et al.³ and prior studies of smaller archaeological samples15,16 provide compelling evidence that OA meets the first criterion of a mismatch disease as being more prevalent today than in the past. Such studies, however, are retrospective and cannot identify all the causes of recent increases in OA. Nevertheless, evidence that the prevalence of OA in developed nations has spiked in the past half-century provides important clues about which preventable contributors to OA might be responsible, the most conspicuous candidates being obesity, metabolic syndrome, dietary changes and physical inactivity (FIG. 1).

Mismatch factors

Obesity. Obesity is commonly attributed as a source of mismatch diseases, as until modern times, most human bodies were rarely, if ever, exposed to long-term high levels of positive energy balance and hence rarely evolved adaptations to cope with the consequences of excess adipose tissue. especially visceral stores¹⁷. Unsurprisingly, obesity is a strong and well-established risk factor for OA¹⁸, especially knee OA¹⁹. Incidence of knee OA among adults aged \geq 40 years is reported to be approximately three times as frequent among obese individuals (BMI \ge 30) and five times as frequent among morbidly obese individuals $(BMI \ge 35)$ compared with individuals of a healthy weight (BMI < 25)18. Given such a

strong association, the rising prevalence of OA in developed nations is in some measure clearly attributable to the recent burgeoning obesity epidemic²⁰ (BOX 1).

The link between obesity and knee OA is especially pernicious because it creates a vicious cycle in which pain from OA can greatly limit a person's physical activity, thus promoting further weight gain and weakening of muscles that stabilize and protect joints, which in turn can exacerbate pain and OA progression²¹. A negative feedback loop of this kind could just as easily be triggered by joint pain as by obesity, but evidence indicates that in the majority of cases, obesity precedes the onset of OA^{22,23}. The driving, causal role of obesity in OA pathogenesis is further highlighted by evidence that most individuals with OA who have undergone bariatric surgery to induce weight loss experience a substantial reduction in joint pain and other symptoms^{24,25}. Evidence suggests that cartilage loss can be slowed if an obese person loses 10% or more of their original weight²⁶. Weight loss may also reduce pain sensitivity and thereby contribute to pain relief²⁷.

Although the precise mechanisms by which obesity affects OA incidence are not completely understood, the longest-standing and perhaps most intuitive explanation is that obesity creates an abnormal loading environment for weight-bearing joints²⁸.



Fig. 1 | **Model of osteoarthritis as a mismatch disease.** In all populations, the prevalence of osteoarthritis (OA) rises with age, but the hypothesis of mismatch predicts that prevalence at any given age is higher in modern environments because of high levels of obesity, chronic metaflammation and physical inactivity, and diets of processed foods that are rich in sugar and saturated fats and low in fibre.



Fig. 2 | **Mechaflammation versus metaflammation.** Both osteoarthritis (OA) and obesity begin with activation of the innate immune system, which occurs by a local stimulus from joint tissues experiencing abnormal loading or a systemic stimulus from the adipose tissue. Triggering of innate immune responses can result in two types of low-grade inflammation, mechaflammation and metaflammation. Low-grade inflammation, in turn, weakens joint tissues, increasing their vulnerability to damage by subsequent loading and the initiation of OA.

Loading per se is not bad for joints, as it is necessary for normal joint development and maintenance^{29,30}, but some loads clearly have the potential to damage cartilage and other joint tissues and thus increase OA susceptibility, a fact highlighted by the strong link between traumatic injuries and OA³¹. The added body weight associated with obesity increases the magnitude of axial loads sustained by weight-bearing joints, which may impart some of the risk of OA caused by obesity. Among people with varus malalignment of the knee, such high-magnitude loads could be especially harmful, as they can magnify knee adduction moments³². Furthermore, low muscle strength relative to body weight may reduce the capacity of transarticular muscles to absorb shock and increase the rate and variability of joint loading³³. A compromised ability to stabilize joints could cause forces to become concentrated in joint regions that are inadequately adapted for such loads and thus vulnerable to damage.

The primary result of aberrant loading of cartilage is damage to the structure of the cartilage matrix of collagen fibrils and proteoglycans^{34,35}. Cartilage degradation caused by abnormal loads may occur to some extent through wear and tear, but evidence suggests that the primary effect of such loads is to stimulate the production of metalloproteinases by chondrocytes and to activate these proteins in the matrix³⁶. Abnormal loads trigger mechanoreceptors on the chondrocyte surface, which, in turn, trigger intracellular signalling pathways (for example, mitogen-activated protein kinase (MAPK) or nuclear factor- κ B (NF- κ B)) and the production of proinflammatory and catabolic mediators^{37,38}. Matrix fragments released into the joint cavity can then provoke synoviocyte and macrophage responses and further release these pro-inflammatory and catabolic mediators, a process we refer to as mechaflammation³⁹ (FIG. 2).

Mechanical factors are probably not the only contributors to obesity-induced OA, as obesity increases OA risk in not only weightbearing joints but also non-weight-bearing regions, such as hands⁴⁰. The association between obesity and OA is generally stronger for weight-bearing than non-weight-bearing joints, but this difference in susceptibility across joints is evidence that the effect of obesity on OA involves complex interactions between mechanical and systemic factors⁴¹. Although much remains to be learned about these systemic factors, evidence indicates that a predominant source is adipose tissue, which produces and releases cytokines (including adipokines) into the bloodstream, many of which (such as IL-1, IL-6, IL-8, IFNy, TNF, leptin and resistin) promote chronic low-grade

inflammation, also termed metaflammation, for which the body is not well adapted⁴² (FIG. 2). Several of these cytokines have been shown experimentally to have an important function in initiating OA⁴³. The adipokine leptin seems to be especially important in initiating OA, as age-related knee OA does not occur in leptin-deficient obese mice44. The most direct pathway by which high levels of leptin and other cytokines in the bloodstream affect OA is by diffusing into the synovial fluid and locally activating proteolytic enzymes, such as matrix metalloproteinase 1 (MMP1), MMP3 and MMP13 (REF.45), which can trigger matrix degradation in cartilage and other joint tissues⁴⁶. However, obesityinduced metaflammation may also affect OA more indirectly by modulating other critical metabolic factors, as discussed in the next section

Metabolic syndrome. Another common source of mismatch diseases that also stems from excessive and long-term positive energy balance is metabolic syndrome, which is defined by a cluster of cardiometabolic factors that commonly accompany obesity, including central adiposity, dyslipidaemia, impaired fasting glucose levels and hypertension. Individuals with metabolic syndrome are at increased risk of a variety of health disorders, especially cardiovascular disease, type 2 diabetes and some cancers47. An abundance of evidence indicates that metabolic syndrome was once a rare (almost nonexistent) disease in nonindustrial populations⁴⁸⁻⁵⁰. Given the increase in prevalence of metabolic syndrome in developed nations, and an association with obesity, it is unsurprising that metabolic syndrome has been hypothesized to be a major risk factor for OA^{40,51}.

Adipose-induced metaflammation is almost always associated with metabolic syndrome⁴² and strongly affects the metabolic dysregulation underlying multiple metabolic components⁵². In turn, these individual components of metabolic syndrome might affect the initiation or progression of OA^{53,54}. For example, experimental evidence suggests that hyperglycaemia can have adverse effects on chondrocyte metabolism⁵⁵⁻⁵⁸, and type 2 diabetes can alter the structure of extracellular matrices, causing enrichment of advanced glycation endproducts (AGEs). In cartilage, AGEs stiffen the matrix, preventing optimal cushioning of the joints under a mechanical load⁵⁹. Moreover, AGEs can signal chondrocytes through specific AGE receptors to increase





Fig. 3 | **Diet as a mismatch factor.** The deleterious effects of modern diets on osteoarthritis (OA) arise from increased adiposity and body mass, which leads to joint overload, a well-established risk factor for OA. Moreover, high caloric intake, a low proportion of fresh fruit and vegetables and a high ratio of omega-6 to omega-3 fatty acids, which are all hallmarks of a modern diet, participate in an increase in intestinal dysbiosis and permeability. These intestinal alterations increase systemic low-grade inflammation, a biological response suggested to trigger joint cell activation in OA. Modern diets are also considered the main cause of metabolic syndrome, which includes hypertension, insulin resistance and lipid abnormalities. Each of these pathologies could indirectly have an important function in OA pathogenesis through deleterious effects on joint tissues.

synthesis of metalloproteinases⁶⁰ and thus should eventually lead to increased cartilage matrix degradation. Oxidized LDL, a pro-inflammatory peroxidized lipid detected at high concentration in plasma from patients with metabolic syndrome, can stimulate the production of reactive oxygen species by chondrocytes, propelling matrix degradation⁶¹. Hypertension might also be implicated in OA pathogenesis owing to induction of downstream tissue ischaemia. If ischaemia affects the blood vessels of the subchondral bone, the nutritional exchange between the subchondral bone and the cartilage might be compromised, resulting in altered metabolism of cells in the joints⁶².

Nevertheless, despite experimental evidence of multiple potential pathways linking metabolic syndrome and OA, data from human studies are conflicting, with most studies showing no association of metabolic syndrome with knee OA after taking into account BMI. For example, in a study of 991 individuals, metabolic syndrome was strongly associated with incident knee OA, but after controlling for body weight, the associations disappeared⁶³. Other studies, however, have found that hand OA (but not knee OA) is strongly associated with metabolic syndrome even after adjusting for body weight⁴¹. Interestingly, people with hypertension have been shown to have an elevated risk of knee OA independent of obesity63, and OA prevalence was higher among people with type 2 diabetes than among people without diabetes, independent of weight differences⁶⁴. Moreover, an MRI study indicates that patients with type 2 diabetes have accelerated knee cartilage matrix degeneration compared with individuals without diabetes, even after correcting for ethnicity, age, sex, baseline BMI and severity of OA as measured by baseline Kellgren – Lawrence score⁶⁵. Although experimental research and some human studies provide evidence that individual components of metabolic syndrome (aside from adiposity) contribute to OA pathogenesis, more data are necessary to resolve the degree to which the current prevalence of OA is attributable to modern increases in metabolic syndrome prevalence.

Dietary changes. The increase in OA prevalence in developed nations raises the question of whether changes in diet cause mismatches that contribute to OA. Modern diets in many developed countries differ from those of earlier generations in being substantially more energy dense and processed, with added sugar, salt and saturated fats but less fibre, fresh fruits and vegetables⁹. These dietary shifts almost certainly affect OA risk by promoting prolonged positive energy balance and excess adiposity but also perhaps by increasing the probability of hyperglycaemia, dyslipidaemia and hypertension.

Aside from promoting metabolic dysregulation, however, modern dietary changes potentially affect OA risk in other ways. An additional dietary factor of particular relevance is a reduced intake of antioxidants⁶⁶. Reactive oxygen species are involved in chondrocyte senescence, extracellular matrix degradation, synovial inflammation and subchondral bone alteration⁶⁷. Diets in many developed nations are characterized by an increase in the ratio of pro-inflammatory omega-6 fatty acids to anti-inflammatory omega-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids⁶⁸. However, evidence that this imbalance contributes to disease remains a contested point of debate. In one study, supplementing the diet with omega-3 fatty acids reduced the severity of posttraumatic OA in mice and limited attendant synovitis⁶⁹, whereas in another study, dietary enrichment of omega-3 fatty acids did not reduce the onset of knee OA in mice70. In humans, the effect of omega-3 fatty acid supplements in OA trials has not been reported to affect joint pain^{71,72}. Moreover, sulforaphane, an isothiocyanate abundant in broccoli, decreased the severity of OA in mice, possibly by protecting against damage from reactive oxygen species^{73,74}; plans now exist to test the consumption of broccoli in an OA clinical trial⁷⁵. Conflicting evidence exists regarding the effect of the antioxidant vitamin C on OA in humans^{76–79}, with experiments in mice, rats and guinea pigs showing that vitamin C may increase OA risk⁸⁰. On the other hand, vitamin K, present in green leafy vegetables like spinach, kale and broccoli, is a necessary cofactor for the y-carboxylation of some calcium-binding proteins, including matrix gla protein, a vitamin K-dependent mineralization inhibitor expressed in human articular cartilage. Many human observational studies have reported that vitamin K deficiency increases the risk of OA⁸¹⁻⁸³, but clinical trials testing vitamin K treatment have not yet been performed. Experimental



Fig. 4 | **Physical inactivity as a mismatch factor.** A sedentary lifestyle and physical inactivity might initiate and aggravate osteoarthritis (OA) and its symptoms via a variety of pathways.

studies point to other dietary factors that are potentially implicated in OA but have not yet been carefully examined in human studies (FIG. 3). Some groups have shown that dietary high-fat overload can increase the severity of post-traumatic OA in mice and rats^{69,84,85}. Interestingly, for the same quantity of calories, severity of OA was exacerbated by a diet rich in saturated as opposed to unsaturated fatty acids⁶⁹.

Obesity and ageing are associated with intestinal dysbiosis that may cause metabolic age-related chronic diseases^{86,87}. The function of the diet in modulating the composition and metabolic activity of the intestinal microbiome is now recognized⁸⁸. Diffusion of biologically active metabolites (such as acetate, propionate and butyrate) and lipopolysaccharide, a microbial cell wall constituent, from the gut to bloodstream related to increased intestinal permeability and dysbiosis in patients with obesity is associated with low-grade systemic inflammation⁸⁹⁻⁹¹. Although evidence that these dysbiosis-derived metabolites have a direct pathophysiological function in OA is lacking, the results of some experimental studies are consistent with this hypothesis^{92,93}. One important dietary factor that modifies the gut microbiota is fibre; changes in the intestinal microbiome might be related to a paucity of fibre in the modern diet. In two cohorts, volunteers in the highest quartile of total fibre intake had lower rates of new-onset symptomatic OA than those in the lowest quartile of total fibre intake^{94,95}. In fact, the higher the fibre intake, the less knee pain experienced by patients with OA⁹⁴. Fibre intake has not yet been tested as a treatment in human OA trials. Animal studies also suggest that the gut microbiota affects OA; for example, a reduction in *Bifidobacterium* spp. in obese mice has been associated with increased migration of macrophages into the synovial tissue, which accelerates OA, whereas dietary supplementation with oligofructose, a non-digestible fibre, was associated with protection of joints in obese mice⁹⁶.

Physical inactivity. Mechanical loading has a major function in nearly all cases of OA, and as physical activity is the most common source of joint loading and is an environmental factor that has changed in the modern world, any consideration of OA as a mismatch disease requires examining shifts in activity patterns³¹. As already noted, one important and well-established risk factor for knee OA is joint trauma, especially meniscal and anterior cruciate ligament tears, which can lead to abnormal stress gradients and excess focal stress within cartilage. Thus, increased participation in sports and other athletic activities that frequently cause such injuries has been hypothesized to underlie current high levels of OA97. However, this hypothesis is conjectural, given that earlier generations, particularly prehistoric populations, almost certainly engaged in high levels of moderate and

vigorous physical activity and yet had lower prevalence of OA^{98,99}. Whether people today are, on average, more susceptible to injury and post-traumatic OA than in the past is highly speculative.

Although trauma unquestionably increases OA risk, a more likely contributor to the increased prevalence of OA is physical inactivity, which has become epidemic in the past few decades, especially in many developed nations¹⁰⁰. Pathways by which physical inactivity can increase OA risk include indirect promotion of obesity and metaflammation, depression¹⁰¹ or telomere shortening¹⁰² (FIG. 4). However, physical inactivity might also contribute to OA pathogenesis directly. Because the musculoskeletal system, like many physiological systems, evolved to require biophysical stimuli from the environment to adjust capacity to demand¹⁰³, mechanical loads engendered by activity are critical to the development and maintenance of optimal structure and strength of joint tissues and their surrounding muscles^{29,104}. Moreover, a reduction in loading as a result of a physically inactive lifestyle might cause formation of weaker and less stable joints that are more susceptible to damage and deterioration^{105,106}. In other words, physical inactivity leads to an absence of normal demand, whereby individuals are unlikely to attain or maintain normal joint capacity.

To illustrate this 'use it or lose it' principle in cartilage, patients with paralysed limbs exhibit marked knee cartilage thinning^{106,107}, whereas MRI studies have shown that people who regularly engage in weight-bearing exercise maintain thicker cartilage, and in one study, these individuals were even noted to have fewer cartilage defects, than people who are physically inactive¹⁰⁸⁻¹¹⁰. Animal experiments have yielded similar findings: disuse experiments (for example, rodent limb immobilization or unloading) consistently demonstrate multiple catabolic effects on joint tissues, including thinning of all cartilage layers, decreased cartilage proteoglycan content by increased expression of metalloproteinases and demineralization of subchondral bone by osteoclast activation¹¹¹⁻¹¹⁴. By contrast, a meta-analysis of exercise in various animal species showed that, compared with animals on a moderate daily exercise regimen, nonexercising control animals had thinner knee cartilage with lower aggrecan content¹¹⁵. Thinner cartilage with lower aggrecan content is not necessarily osteoarthritic cartilage (for example, paralysed limbs

rarely get OA), but it is biomechanically vulnerable cartilage¹¹⁶.

Even if physical inactivity is detrimental to joint health, this does not mean that all forms of physical activity are beneficial for joints. As already discussed, some types of loading can threaten the integrity of joint tissues, and loads that are extreme or otherwise abnormal, either in terms of magnitude, frequency or some other parameter, which are produced by active lifestyles through occupation (for example, jobs requiring frequent knee bending) or recreation (for example, sports injuries) can culminate in damaged joints that are more prone to OA. Thus, risk of OA is probably increased by both extreme physical inactivity and activity^{35,117}. However, although considerable research and clinical attention has been paid to the potential negative consequences of some types of physical activity for joint health, greater attention ought to be devoted to understanding the degree to which decreases in physical activity underlie high levels of OA today.

Conclusions

Although the causes of the high and rising prevalence of OA are still not entirely understood, one important conclusion of this article is that OA fits the criteria of a mismatch disease in that the current OA prevalence seems to be partly attributable to environmental risk factors that have

Glossary

Adaptation

A phenotypic trait favoured by natural selection because it improves an organism's ability to survive and reproduce.

Developed nations

Wealthy countries with post-industrial economies and advanced technological infrastructure.

Hunter-gatherers

People who subsist on foraged wild plants and hunted wild animals, in contrast to agriculturalists who subsist mainly on domesticated plants and animals.

Knee adduction moments

Dynamic rotational forces (torques) that act on the knee in the coronal plane, applying a compressive force to the medial side of the knee.

Kellgren-Lawrence score

A common method of classifying the severity of knee osteoarthritis using radiography.

Mechaflammation

Focal inflammation owing to a local mechanical insult.

Metaflammation

Chronic, low-grade, metabolic and systemic inflammation.

Varus malalignment

A deformity of the knee in which the distal leg is angled medially in relation to the axis of the thigh, resulting in a bowlegged appearance.

become amplified in the modern world. These factors probably include obesity, metabolic syndrome, dietary changes and physical inactivity. A second and even more important conclusion is that, although OA risk is influenced by intrinsic factors such as age and genetics, OA is partly a mismatch disease affected by modifiable factors, indicating substantial potential for prevention. This is a critical insight given that available nonsurgical treatments for OA provide relief from symptoms only. and no disease-modifying drugs exist. In short, although OA may seem to be mainly a disease of old age, from an evolutionary perspective, it is not age per se that causes the disease but an accumulation of joint tissue deterioration arising from interactions between the genes we inherited from our ancestors and the environments - many of them novel yet modifiable — that we encounter as we grow older.

Because of human evolutionary origins as physically active hunter-gatherers on the margin of energy balance, human joints probably evolved to require routine mechanical loading in the absence of adiposity-induced metaflammation to grow and function optimally with age. However, even if OA is partly a mismatch disease, the disease would not cease to occur even if everyone on the planet adjusted their lifestyles to more closely match the conditions for which the human musculoskeletal system is adapted. As the incidence of OA in prehistoric populations testifies, trauma and other risk factors have always predisposed some people to OA. Nevertheless, on the basis of the available evidence reviewed here, it seems unlikely that the OA epidemic will be curbed without at least beginning to reverse declines in physical activity levels and the quality of our diets, along with attendant effects on obesity and metabolic dysregulation. How to promote such lifestyle changes is a major challenge.

Francis Berenbaum¹¹*, Ian J. Wallace², Daniel E. Lieberman² and David T. Felson^{3,4}

¹Sorbonne Université, INSERM, DHU i2B, AP-HP, Hôpital Saint-Antoine, Paris, France.

²Department of Human Evolutionary Biology, Peabody Museum, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA, USA.

³Clinical Epidemiology Unit, Boston University School of Medicine, Boston, MA, USA.

⁴NIHR Manchester Musculoskeletal Biomedical Research Centre, University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust, Manchester Academic Health Science Centre, Manchester, UK.

*e-mail: francis.berenbaum@aphp.fr

https://doi.org/10.1038/s41584-018-0073-x Published online 12 September 2018

- Felson, D. T. et al. Osteoarthritis: new insights. Part 1: the disease and its risk factors. *Ann. Intern. Med.* 133, 635–646 (2000).
- Bijlsma, J. W., Berenbaum, F. & Lafeber, F. P. Osteoarthritis: an update with relevance for clinical practice. *Lancet* 377, 2115–2126 (2011).
- Wallace, I. J. et al. Knee osteoarthritis has doubled in prevalence since the mid-20th century. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* 114, 9332–9336 (2017).
- Nguyen, U. S. et al. Increasing prevalence of knee pain and symptomatic knee osteoarthritis: survey and cohort
- data. Ann. Intern. Med. 155, 725–732 (2011).
 GBD 2013 DALYs and HALE Collaborators. Global, regional, and national disability-adjusted life years (DALYs) for 306 diseases and injuries and healthy life expectancy (HALE) for 188 countries, 1990-2013: quantifying the epidemiological transition. Lancet 386, 2145–2191 (2015).
- Kiadaliri, A. A., Lohmander, L. S., Moradi-Lakeh, M., Petersson, I. F. & Englund, M. High and rising burden of hip and knee osteoarthritis in the Nordic region, 1990–2015. Acta Orthop. 89, 177–183 (2017).
- Sandell, L. J. Etiology of osteoarthritis: genetics and synovial joint development. *Nat. Rev. Rheumatol.* 8, 77–89 (2012).
- Gluckman, P. D. & Hanson, M. A. Mismatch: The Lifestyle Diseases Timebomb (Oxford Univ. Press, 2013).
- 9. Lieberman, D. E. *The Story of the Human Body: Evolution, Health and Disease* (Pantheon Books, 2013).
- Rose, M. R. & Lauder, G. V. Adaptation (Academic Press, 1996).
- Menke, A., Casagrande, S., Geiss, L. & Cowie, C. C. Prevalence of and trends in diabetes among adults in the United States, 1988–2012. *JAMA* 314, 1021–1029 (2015).
- 12. Zuk, M. Paleofantasy: What Evolution Really Tells Us
- About Sex, Diet, and How We Live (W. H. Norton, 2014).
 Pontzer, H. et al. Locomotor anatomy and biomechanics of the Dmanisi hominins. J. Hum. Evol. 58, 492–504 (2010).
- Larsen, C. S. et al. Bioarchaeology of Neolithic Çatalhöyük. lives and lifestyles of an early farming society in transition. J. World Prehistory 28, 27–68 (2015).
- Rogers, J. & Dieppe, P. Is tibiofemoral osteoarthritis in the knee joint a new disease? *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 53, 612–613 (1994).
- Inoue, K. et al. Prevalence of large-joint osteoarthritis in Asian and Caucasian skeletal populations. *Rheumatology* 40, 70–73 (2001).
- Lieberman, D. E. Is exercise really medicine? An evolutionary perspective. *Curr. Sports Med. Rep.* 14, 313–319 (2015).
- Reyes, C. et al. Association between overweight and obesity and risk of clinically diagnosed knee, hip, and hand osteoarthritis: a population-based cohort study. *Arthritis Rheum.* 68, 1869–1875 (2016).
- Felson, D. T. Epidemiology of hip and knee osteoarthritis. Epidemiol. Rev. 10, 1–28 (1988).
- Ng, M. et al. Global, regional, and national prevalence of overweight and obesity in children and adults during 1980-2013: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2013. Lancet 384, 766–781 (2014).
- Wluka, A. E., Lombard, C. B. & Cicuttini, F. M. Tackling obesity in knee osteoarthritis. *Nat. Rev. Rheumatol.* 9, 225–235 (2013).
- Felson, D. T., Anderson, J. J., Naimark, A., Walker, A. M. & Meenan, R. F. Obesity and knee osteoarthritis. The Framingham Study. *Ann. Intern. Med.* **109**, 18–24 (1988).
- Celber, A. C. et al. Body mass index in young men and the risk of subsequent knee and hip osteoarthritis. *Am. J. Med.* **107**, 542–548 (1999).
- Richette, P. et al. Benefits of massive weight loss on symptoms, systemic inflammation and cartilage turnover in obese patients with knee osteoarthritis. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **70**, 139–144 (2011).
- King, W. C. et al. Change in pain and physical function following bariatric surgery for severe obesity. *JAMA* **315**, 1362–1371 (2016).
- 26. Gersing, A. S. et al. Is weight loss associated with less progression of changes in knee articular cartilage among obese and overweight patients as assessed with MR imaging over 48 months? Data from the Osteoarthritis Initiative. *Radiology* **284**, 508–520 (2017).
- Stefanik, J. J. et al. Changes in pain sensitization after bariatric surgery. Arthritis Care Res. https://doi. org/10.1002/acr.23513 (2018).

- Griffin, T. M. & Guilak, F. The role of mechanical loading in the onset and progression of osteoarthritis. *Exerc. Sport Sci. Rev.* 33, 195–200 (2005).
- Giorgi, M., Carriero, A., Shefelbine, S. J. & Nowlan, N. C. Effects of normal and abnormal loading conditions on morphogenesis of the prenatal hip joint: application to hip dysplasia. *J. Biomechan.* 48, 3390–3397 (2015).
- Felson, D. T. Osteoarthritis as a disease of mechanics. Osteoarthritis Cartilage 21, 10–15 (2013).
- Felson, D. T., Goggins, J., Niu, J., Zhang, Y. & Hunter, D. J. The effect of body weight on progression of knee osteoarthritis is dependent on alignment. *Arthritis Rheum.* **50**, 3904–3909 (2004).
- Slemenda, C. et al. Reduced quadriceps strength relative to body weight: a risk factor for knee osteoarthritis in women? *Arthritis Rheum.* 41, 1951–1959 (1998).
- Buckwalter, J. A. & Mankin, H. J. Articular cartilage: tissue design and chondrocyte-matrix interactions. *Instr. Course Lect.* 47, 477–486 (1998).
- Sanchez-Adams, J., Leddy, H. A., McNulty, A. L., O'Conor, C. J. & Guilak, F. The mechanobiology of articular cartilage: bearing the burden of osteoarthritis. *Curr. Rheumatol. Rep.* 16, 451–451 (2014).
- Pottie, P. et al. Obesity and osteoarthritis: more complex than predicted! *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 65, 1403–1405 (2006).
- Houard, X., Goldring, M. B. & Berenbaum, F. Homeostatic mechanisms in articular cartilage and role of inflammation in osteoarthritis. *Curr. Rheumatol. Rep.* **15**, 375–375 (2013).
 Millward-Sadler, S. J. & Salter, D. M. Integrin-
- Millward-Sadler, S. J. & Salter, D. M. Integrindependent signal cascades in chondrocyte mechanotransduction. *Ann. Biomed. Engineer.* 32, 435–446 (2004).
- Loeser, R. F., Goldring, S. R., Scanzello, C. R. & Goldring, M. B. Osteoarthritis: a disease of the joint as an organ. Arthritis Rheum. 64, 1697–1707 (2012).
- Yusuf, E. et al. Association between weight or body mass index and hand osteoarthritis: a systematic review. Ann. Rheum. Dis. 69, 761–765 (2010).
- Visser, A. W. et al. The relative contribution of mechanical stress and systemic processes in different types of osteoarthritis: the NEO study. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 74, 1842–1847 (2015).
- Hotamisligil, G. S. Inflammation, metaflammation and immunometabolic disorders. *Nature* 542, 177–185 (2017).
- Berenbaum, F., Eymard, F. & Houard, X. Osteoarthritis, inflammation and obesity. *Curr. Opin. Rheumatol.* 25, 114–118 (2013).
- Griffin, T. M., Huebner, J. L., Kraus, V. B. & Guilak, F. Extreme obesity due to impaired leptin signaling in mice does not cause knee osteoarthritis. *Arthritis Rheum.* 60, 2935–2944 (2009).
- Berenbaum, F. Osteoarthritis as an inflammatory disease (osteoarthritis is not osteoarthrosis!). Osteoarthritis Cartilage 21, 16–21 (2013).
- Francisco, V. et al. Biomechanics, obesity, and osteoarthritis. The role of adipokines: when the levee breaks. *J. Orthop. Res.* **36**, 594–604 (2018).
 Eckel, R. H., Grundy, S. M. & Zimmet, P. Z. The
- 47. Eckel, R. H., Grundy, S. M. & Zimmet, P. Z. The metabolic syndrome. *Lancet* **365**, 1415–1428 (2005).
- Kaplan, H. et al. Coronary atherosclerosis in indigenous South American Tsimane: a cross-sectional cohort study. *Lancet* **389**, 1730–1739 (2017).
 Kaminer, B. & Lutz, W. P. Blood pressure in Bushmen
- Kaminer, B. & Lutz, W. P. Blood pressure in Bushmen of the Kalahari Desert. *Circulation* 22, 289–295 (1960).
- Raichlen, D. A. et al. Physical activity patterns and biomarkers of cardiovascular disease risk in huntergatherers. *Am. J. Hum. Biol.* **29**, e22919 (2017).
- Moore, J. X., Chaudhary, N. & Akinyemiju, T. Metabolic syndrome prevalence by race/ethnicity and sex in the United States, National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey, 1988–2012. *Prev. Chron. Dis.* 14, E24 (2017).
- Lee, Y. S., Wollam, J. & Olefsky, J. M. An integrated view of immunometabolism. *Cell* **172**, 22–40 (2018).
 Berenbaum, F. Griffin, T. M. & Liu-Brvan, R. Metaboli
- Berenbaum, F., Griffin, T. M. & Liu-Bryan, R. Metabolic regulation of inflammation in osteoarthritis. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* 69, 9–21 (2017).
- Zhuo, O., Yang, W., Chen, J. & Wang, Y. Metabolic syndrome meets osteoarthritis. *Nat. Rev. Rheumatol.* 8, 729 (2012).
- Rosa, S. C. et al. Impaired glucose transporter-1 degradation and increased glucose transport and oxidative stress in response to high glucose in chondrocytes from osteoarthritic versus normal human cartilage. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* 11, R80 (2009).

- Rosa, S. C. et al. Role of glucose as a modulator of anabolic and catabolic gene expression in normal and osteoarthritic human chondrocytes. *J. Cell. Biochem.* 112, 2813–2824 (2011).
- Vaamonde-Garcia, C. et al. The nuclear factorerythroid 2-related factor/heme oxygenase-1 axis is critical for the inflammatory features of type 2 diabetes-associated osteoarthritis. J. Biol. Chem. 292, 14505–14515 (2017).
- Berenbaum, F. Diabetes-induced osteoarthritis: from a new paradigm to a new phenotype. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 70, 1354–1356 (2011).
- Shane Anderson, A. & Loeser, R. F. Why is osteoarthritis an age-related disease? Best practice and research. *Clin. Rheumatol.* 24, 15–26 (2010).
- Steenvoorden, M. M. et al. Activation of receptor for advanced glycation end products in osteoarthritis leads to increased stimulation of chondrocytes and synoviocytes. *Arthritis Rheum.* 54, 253–263 (2006).
- de Munter, W., van der Kraan, P. M., van den Berg, W. B. <u>x</u> van Lent, P. L. High systemic levels of low-density lipoprotein cholesterol: fuel to the flames in inflammatory osteoarthritis? *Rheumatology* 55, 16–24 (2016).
- Conaghan, P. G., Vanharanta, H. & Dieppe, P. A. Is progressive osteoarthritis an atheromatous vascular disease? *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 64, 1539–1541 (2005).
 Niu, J., Clancy, M., Aliabadi, P., Vasan, R. & Felson, D. T.
- Niu, J., Clancy, M., Aliabadi, P., Vasan, R. & Felson, D. T. Metabolic syndrome, its components, and knee osteoarthritis: The Framingham Osteoarthritis Study. *Arthritis Rheumatol.* 69, 1194–1203 (2017).
- Louati, K., Vidal, C., Berenbaum, F. & Sellam, J. Association between diabetes mellitus and osteoarthritis: systematic literature review and meta-analysis. *RMD Open* 1, e000077 (2015).
- Neumann, J. et al. Type 2 diabetes patients have accelerated cartilage matrix degeneration compared to diabetes free controls: data from the Osteoarthritis Initiative. Osteoarthritis Cartilage 26, 751–761 (2018).
- Ruiz-Nunez, B., Pruimboom, L., Dijck-Brouwer, D. A. & Muskiet, F. A. Lifestyle and nutritional imbalances associated with Western diseases: causes and consequences of chronic systemic low-grade inflammation in an evolutionary context. *J. Nutr. Biochem.* 24, 1183–1201 (2013).
- Lepetsos, P. & Papavassiliou, A. G. ROS/oxidative stress signaling in osteoarthritis. *Biochim. Biophys. Acta* 1862, 576–591 (2016).
- Simopoulos, A. P. An increase in the omega-6/omega-3 fatty acid ratio increases the risk for obesity. *Nutrients* 8, 128 (2016).
- Wu, C. L. et al. Dietary fatty acid content regulates wound repair and the pathogenesis of osteoarthritis following joint injury. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 74, 2076–2083 (2015).
- Cai, A. et al. Metabolic enrichment of omega-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids does not reduce the onset of idiopathic knee osteoarthritis in mice. *Osteoarthritis Cartilage* 22, 1301–1309 (2014).
- Senftleber, N. et al. Marine oil supplements for arthritis pain: a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized trials. *Nutrients* 9, 42 (2017).
- Hill, C. L. et al. Fish oil in knee osteoarthritis: a randomised clinical trial of low dose versus high dose. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* **75**, 23–29 (2016).
- Davidson, R. K. et al. Sulforaphane represses matrixdegrading proteases and protects cartilage from destruction in vitro and in vivo. *Arthritis Rheum.* 65, 3130–3140 (2013).
- Berenbaum, F. Does broccoli protect from osteoarthritis? *Joint Bone Spine* 81, 284–286 (2014).
 Detriction P. Collection 10, 2007
- Davidson, R. et al. Isothiocyanates are detected in human synovial fluid following broccoli consumption and can affect the tissues of the knee joint. *Sci. Rep.* 7, 3398 (2017).
- McAlindon, T. E. et al. Do antioxidant micronutrients protect against the development and progression of knee osteoarthritis? *Arthritis Rheum.* **39**, 648–656 (1996).
- Sanghi, D. et al. Elucidation of dietary risk factors in osteoarthritis knee — a case-control study. J. Am. College Nutr. 34, 15–20 (2015).
- Peregoy, J. & Wilder, F. V. The effects of vitamin C supplementation on incident and progressive knee osteoarthritis: a longitudinal study. *Publ. Health Nutr.* 14, 709–715 (2011).
- Chaganti, R. K. et al. High plasma levels of vitamin C and E are associated with incident radiographic knee osteoarthritis. Osteoarthritis Cartilage 22, 190–196 (2014).

- Kraus, V. B. et al. Ascorbic acid increases the severity of spontaneous knee osteoarthritis in a guinea pig model. *Arthritis Rheum.* 50, 1822–1831 (2004).
- Misra, D. et al. Vitamin K deficiency is associated with incident knee osteoarthritis. *Am. J. Med.* **126**, 243–248 (2013).
- Neogi, T. et al. Low vitamin K status is associated with osteoarthritis in the hand and knee. *Arthritis Rheum.* 54, 1255–1261 (2006).
- Shea, M. K. et al. The association between vitamin K status and knee osteoarthritis features in older adults: the Health, Aging and Body Composition Study. *Osteoarthritis Cartilage* 23, 370–378 (2015).
- Datta, P. et al. High-fat diet-induced acceleration of osteoarthritis is associated with a distinct and sustained plasma metabolite signature. *Sci. Rep.* 7, 8205 (2017).
- Mooney, R. A., Sampson, E. R., Lerea, J., Rosier, R. N. & Zuscik, M. J. High-fat diet accelerates progression of osteoarthritis after meniscal/ligamentous injury. *Arthritis Res. Ther.* 13, R198 (2011)
- Arthritis Res. Ther. 13, R198 (2011).
 Le Chatelier, E. et al. Richness of human gut microbiome correlates with metabolic markers. *Nature* 500, 541–546 (2013).
- Biagi, E. et al. Through ageing, and beyond: gut microbiota and inflammatory status in seniors and centenarians. *PLOS ONE* 5, e10667 (2010).
- Conlon, M. A. & Bird, A. R. The impact of diet and lifestyle on gut microbiota and human health. *Nutrients* 7, 17–44 (2015).
- Brahe, L. K., Astrup, A. & Larsen, L. H. Is butyrate the link between diet, intestinal microbiota and obesityrelated metabolic diseases? *Obes. Rev.* 14, 950–959 (2013).
- Russell, W. R., Hoyles, L., Flint, H. J. & Dumas, M. E. Colonic bacterial metabolites and human health. *Curr. Opin. Microbiol.* **16**, 246–254 (2013).
 Boulange, C. L., Neves, A. L., Chilloux, J., Nicholson, J. K.
- Boulange, C. L., Neves, A. L., Chilloux, J., Nicholson, J. K. & Dumas, M. E. Impact of the gut microbiota on inflammation, obesity, and metabolic disease. *Genome Med.* 8, 42 (2016).
- Huang, Z. & Kraus, V. B. Does lipopolysaccharidemediated inflammation have a role in OA? *Nat. Rev. Rheumatol.* **12**, 123–129 (2016).
- Collins, K. H. et al. Relationship between inflammation, the gut microbiota, and metabolic osteoarthritis development: studies in a rat model. *Osteoarthritis Cartilage* 23, 1989–1998 (2015).
- Dai, Z., Lu, N., Niu, J., Felson, D. T. & Zhang, Y. Dietary fiber intake in relation to knee pain trajectory. *Arthritis Care Res.* 69, 1331–1339 (2017).
- Dai, Z., Niu, J., Zhang, Y., Jacques, P. & Felson, D. T. Dietary intake of fibre and risk of knee osteoarthritis in two US prospective cohorts. *Ann. Rheum. Dis.* 76, 1411–1419 (2017).
- Schott, E. M. et al. Targeting the gut microbiome to treat the osteoarthritis of obesity. *JCI Insight* https:// doi.org/10.1172/jci.insight.95997 (2018).
 Palmieri-Smith, R. M. et al. The role of athletic trainers in
- Palmieri-Smith, R. M. et al. The role of athletic trainers in preventing and managing posttraumatic osteoarthritis in physically active populations: a consensus statement of the Athletic Trainers' Osteoarthritis Consortium. J. Athlet. Train. 52, 610–623 (2017).
- Shaw, C. N. & Stock, J. T. Extreme mobility in the Late Pleistocene? Comparing limb biomechanics among fossil *Homo*, varsity athletes and Holocene foragers. *J. Hum. Evol.* 64, 242–249 (2013).
- Berger, T. D. & Trinkaus, E. Patterns of trauma among the Neandertals. J. Archaeol. Sci. 22, 841–852 (1995).
- Hallal, P. C. et al. Global physical activity levels: surveillance progress, pitfalls and prospects. *Lancet* 380, 247–257 (2012).
- Jacka, F. N. et al. Lower levels of physical activity in childhood associated with adult depression. J. Sci. Med. Sport 14, 222–226 (2011).
- 102. Arsenis, N. C., You, T., Ogawa, E. F., Tinsley, G. M. & Zuo, L. Physical activity and telomere length: impact of aging and potential mechanisms of action. *Oncotarget* 8, 45008–45019 (2017).
- Weibel, E. R., Taylor, C. R. & Hoppeler, H. The concept of symmorphosis: a testable hypothesis of structurefunction relationship. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* 88, 10357–10361 (1991).
- 104. Roos, E. M. & Arden, N. K. Strategies for the prevention of knee osteoarthritis. *Nat. Rev. Rheumatol.* **12**, 92–101 (2016).
- 105. Slemenda, C. et al. Quadriceps weakness and osteoarthritis of the knee. Ann. Intern. Med. 127, 97–104 (1997).
- 106. Vanwanseele, B., Eckstein, F., Knecht, H., Spaepen, A. & Stussi, E. Longitudinal analysis of cartilage atrophy

in the knees of patients with spinal cord injury. Arthritis Rheum. 48, 3377–3381 (2003).

- 107. Vanwanseele, B., Eckstein, F., Knecht, H., Stüssi, E. & Spaepen, A. Knee cartilage of spinal cord-injured patients displays progressive thinning in the absence of normal joint loading and movement. *Arthritis Rheum.* **46**, 2073–2078 (2002). 108. Urquhart, D. M. et al. What is the effect of physical
- activity on the knee joint? A systematic review. Med. Sci. Sports Exerc. 43, 432–442 (2011).
- 109. Jones, G. et al. Knee articular cartilage development in children: a longitudinal study of the effect of sex, growth, body composition, and physical activity. Pediatr. Res. 54, 230-236 (2003).
- 110. Racunica, T. L. et al. Effect of physical activity on articular knee joint structures in community-based adults. Arthritis Rheum. 57, 1261–1268 (2007).
- 111. Leong, D. J. et al. Matrix metalloproteinase-3 in articular cartilage is upregulated by joint immobilization and suppressed by passive joint motion. Matrix Biol. 29, 420-426 (2010).

- 112. Nomura, M. et al. Thinning of articular cartilage after joint unloading or immobilization. An experimental investigation of the pathogenesis in mice Osteoarthritis Cartilage 25, 727–736 (2017).
- 113. Paukkonen, K., Jurvelin, J. & Helminen, H. J. Effects of immobilization on the articular cartilage in young rabbits. A quantitative light microscopic stereological study. *Clin. Orthop. Relat. research*, 270–280 (1986).
- 114. Campbell, T. M., Reilly, K., Laneuville, O., Uhthoff, H. & Trudel, G. Bone replaces articular cartilage in the rat knee joint after prolonged immobilization. *Bone* **106**, 42–51 (2018).
- 115. Bricca, A., Juhl, C. B., Grodzinsky, A. J. & Roos, E. M. Impact of a daily exercise dose on knee joint cartilage - a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials in healthy animals. Osteoarthritis Cartilage **25**, 1223–1237 (2017).
- 116. Teichtahl, A. J. et al. The interaction between physical activity and amount of baseline knee cartilage. Rheumatology **55**, 1277–1284 (2016). 117. Arokoski, J. P., Jurvelin, J. S., Vaatainen, U. &
- Helminen, H. J. Normal and pathological adaptations

of articular cartilage to joint loading. *Scand. J. Med. Sci. Sports* **10**, 186–198 (2000).

Acknowledgements

The work of the authors is financially supported by grants from the French Society of Rheumatology, Fondation Arthritis (ROAD network) (to F.B.), the Hintze Family Charitable Foundation, the American School of Prehistoric Research (Harvard University) (to D.E.L.) and a grant from the US National Institutes of Health (AR47785 to D.T.F.).

Author contributions

All authors researched data for the article, wrote the article, made substantial contribution to discussions of the content and reviewed and/or edited the manuscript before submission.

Competing interests

The authors declare no competing interests.

Publisher's note

Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations

Author Correction: Major lung complications of systemic sclerosis

Christopher P. Denton, Athol U. Wells and John G. Coghlan

Nature Reviews Rheumatology (2018) https://doi.org/10.1038/s41584-018-0062-0 Published online 15 August 2018

In the originally published version of this article, Table 2 contained an error. In this table, the statement "Also licensed for CTEPH; cannot be combined with a PDE5 inhibitor" was in the wrong row and incorrectly attributed to the drug selexipag, whereas this statement was actually referring to the drug riociguat. Furthermore, the reference supporting this statement was incorrect. These errors have now been corrected in the HTML and PDF versions of the manuscript.

https://doi.org/10.1038/s41584-018-0108-3 | Published online 13 October 2018